Can participatory planning improve sustainable urban development in Angola?

Beat Weber

Thesis submitted for
the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Centre for Environment and Human Settlements
School of the Built Environment
Heriot-Watt University, Edinburgh

October 2007

The copyright in this thesis is owned by the author. Any quotation from the thesis or use of any of the information contained in it must acknowledge this thesis as the source of the quotation or information.
Abstract

This research examines participation in urban planning, arguing that many contemporary theories and related ‘best practice’ policies of participation are inadequate in the context of rapid urbanisation in the South, this mainly due to their insufficient attention to contextual variables. This research therefore suggests an approach that gives greater emphasis on the very specific context within which urban planning is taking place, using the concepts of sustainable development and governance as an analytical framework.

The analytical framework is applied in the examination of four different participatory planning case studies in São Paulo, Brazil, Johannesburg, South Africa, and Luanda and Huambo in Angola. Using a comparative case study approach the thesis shows how the different results in the case studies are related to the respective contexts. The Angolan case studies further show how participatory planning in this country is especially challenging, due to generally little participation in governance, an insufficient legal framework for planning and very weak state and civil society organizations.

The thesis therefore argues that in Angola the dominant theoretical positions on participatory planning and international ‘best practice’ policy are of limited effectiveness. Rather, emerging spaces of participation in the local context should be explored by using a pragmatic and action oriented approach, based on local capacities through creating long term partnerships with actors from state and civil society and with international experience contributing to, but not dominating, such locally embedded planning approaches.
Acknowledgements

This research would not have been possible without the support of my parents to whom I’m incredibly grateful. I’m also indebted to Bela, Otilia, Tania, Vado and Nadia for having provided me with a very supportive environment for completing this thesis.

I’m especially thankful to my supervisor Paul Jenkins who guided me through all stages of the research and to whom I owe much of the gained insight into urban planning in countries in the South. I would also like to thank Harry Smith for his support on several occasions.

In Angola, I would like to specially thank Allan Cain, Director of Development Workshop and my employer since early 2001 for his insight, support and also contractual flexibility especially in the later stage of the research when I was working in a part-time arrangement. Also in Development Workshop I would like to thank all my colleagues in the Monitoring and Research Unit in Luanda and in Huambo for their support and friendship, especially Moises Festo and Pacheco Ilinga.

In Angola I would further like to thank all those who made their time available for interviews and supplied me with information and documents.
ACADEMIC REGISTRY
Research Thesis Submission

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>BEAT WEBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School/PGI:</td>
<td>SCHOOL OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Version:</td>
<td>FINAL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Declaration**

In accordance with the appropriate regulations I hereby submit my thesis and I declare that:

1) the thesis embodies the results of my own work and has been composed by myself
2) where appropriate, I have made acknowledgement of the work of others and have made reference to work carried out in collaboration with other persons
3) the thesis is the correct version of the thesis for submission*.
4) my thesis for the award referred to, deposited in the Heriot-Watt University Library, should be made available for loan or photocopying, subject to such conditions as the Librarian may require
5) I understand that as a student of the University I am required to abide by the Regulations of the University and to conform to its discipline.

* Please note that it is the responsibility of the candidate to ensure that the correct version of the thesis is submitted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signature of Candidate:</th>
<th>Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 NOV. 2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Submission**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Submitted By (name in capitals):</th>
<th>HARRY SMITH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Signature of Individual Submitting:</td>
<td>Henry Smith</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date Submitted:</td>
<td>30/11/2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**For Completion in Academic Registry**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Received in the Academic Registry by (name in capitals):</th>
<th>J. BOUCH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Method of Submission</strong></td>
<td><strong>HANDED IN</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Handed in to Academic Registry; posted through internal/external mail):</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signature:</td>
<td>Date: 30 11 07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

October 2004
Table of contents

Chapter 1: Introduction ........................................................................................................ 1

1.1 Research aims ............................................................................................................ 1
  1.1.1 Research overview ................................................................................................. 1
  1.1.2 Contributions of the research ................................................................................ 3

1.2 Research objectives and questions ......................................................................... 5

1.3 Thesis structure ....................................................................................................... 6

Chapter 2: Analytical Framework – Participation, Governance and Sustainable Development ................................................................. 10

2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................ 10

2.2 Participation in planning theory, development studies and development policy .... 11
  2.2.1 Participation in urban planning theory .................................................................. 11
  2.2.2 Participation in development studies .................................................................... 18
  2.2.3 Participation in international urban development policy – the example of the Cities Alliance ................................................................. 22

2.3 Governance and participation ............................................................................... 28
  2.3.1 The concept of governance .................................................................................. 28
  2.3.2 Political systems and levels of decentralisation ...................................................... 30
  2.3.3 The role of planning legislation ............................................................................ 33
  2.3.4 Participation of civil society organizations in decision-making processes .......... 34

2.4 Sustainable urban development .............................................................................. 36

2.5 Conclusions ............................................................................................................ 41

Chapter 3: Research Approaches and Methods ......................................................... 45

3.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................ 45

3.2 Research process and timeline .............................................................................. 45

3.3 Case study research ............................................................................................... 47
  3.3.1 Characteristics of case study research ................................................................. 47
  3.3.2 Selection of case studies for this research ......................................................... 50

3.4 Data collection and analytical research methods ................................................... 52
  3.4.1 Literature review ................................................................................................. 53
  3.4.2 Interviewing ....................................................................................................... 53
Chapter 4: International Experiences in Participatory Urban Planning...62

4.1 Introduction..................................................................................................................... 62
4.2 Case study 1: Bairro Legal programme in São Paulo, Brazil................................. 63
  4.2.1 Historic overview and issues of sustainable urban development.................. 63
  4.2.2 The governance context ......................................................................................... 66
  4.2.3 Urban planning legislation, policy and practice ............................................... 68
  4.2.4 The Bairro Legal Informal Settlement Integration Programme in São Paulo... 73
4.3 Case study 2: City Development Strategy in Johannesburg, South Africa.......... 76
  4.3.1 Historic overview and issues of sustainable urban development.................. 76
  4.3.2 The governance context ......................................................................................... 82
  4.3.3 Urban planning legislation, policy and practice ............................................... 86
  4.3.4 The Johannesburg City Development Strategy ................................................. 87
4.4 Conclusions.................................................................................................................... 91

Chapter 5: An Introduction to Angola.............................................................. 94

5.1 Introduction..................................................................................................................... 94
5.2 Geography and people..................................................................................................... 94
5.3 A history marked by violent conflict........................................................................... 97
5.4 Urban development........................................................................................................ 101
  5.4.1 Urban growth ............................................................................................................ 101
  5.4.2 Sustainability of urban development................................................................. 103
5.5 The governance context.............................................................................................. 106
  5.5.1 Angolan `realpolitik' from 1975 to present......................................................... 106
  5.5.2 Nascent civil society .............................................................................................. 109
5.6 Governance and planning – legislation and spaces for participation............... 115
  5.6.1 Decentralisation ....................................................................................................... 115
  5.6.2 Territorial Planning Law 3/04 and Regulations .................................................. 120
  5.6.3 Land Law 9/04 and Regulation ........................................................................... 123
5.7 Conclusions.................................................................................................................... 126
Chapter 6: Luanda Case Study – Participatory Municipal Planning in Sambizanga

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Urban development, governance and planning in Luanda – a historic overview

6.3 Sustainability of contemporary development processes

6.4 The urban governance context

6.5 Important contemporary planning and development processes in Luanda
   6.5.1 Housing and infrastructure development by EDURB
   6.5.2 Housing and infrastructure development by the Office for National Reconstruction (GRN)
   6.5.3 Resistance to forced evictions
   6.5.4 Informal settlements – expansion without planning

6.6 The Sambizanga participatory municipal planning process
   6.6.1 Introduction to the case study
   6.6.2 Description of the planning process
   6.6.3 Levels of participation and the contribution to sustainable development

6.7 Conclusions

Chapter 7: Huambo Case Study – Participatory Local Lay-out Planning

7.1 Introduction

7.2 Urban development, governance and planning in Huambo – A historic overview

7.3 Sustainability of contemporary development processes

7.4 The urban governance context

7.5 Important contemporary planning and development processes in Huambo
   7.5.1 Structure and master planning
   7.5.2 Private-public partnerships for condominium developments
   7.5.3 Government led layout planning and land allocation for housing
   7.5.4 Informal settlements – expansion without planning
   7.5.5 Community led planning and resistance to forced evictions

7.6 The Bairro Fátima participatory lay-out planning process
   7.6.1 Introduction to the case study
   7.6.2 Description of the planning process
   7.6.3 Levels of participation and the contribution to sustainable development

7.7 Conclusions
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Analytical framework and corresponding sections and sub-sections in the case study chapters</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Research process and time table</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Urban growth of provincial capitals in Angola</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>Demographic development of Luanda city</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Number and locality of satellite city housing units</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>Structure and priority objectives of the Municipal Plan</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>Total number of participants and percentage of women</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8</td>
<td>Demographic development of Huambo city</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9</td>
<td>Research objective one and related research questions</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10</td>
<td>Research objective two and related research questions (analytical framework)</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 11</td>
<td>Research objective three and related research questions</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**List of Figures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>The triangle of three dimensions of sustainable development</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Map of Brazil</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Map of South Africa</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>Political Map of Angola</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>Ethno-linguistic map of Angola</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>Province of Luanda with municipal administration boundaries</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>2007 floods in Luanda: flooded main access road and destroyed houses</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>Example of housing provided in condominiums in Luanda</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Satellite image of Valsaroca in Sambizanga Municipality</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10</td>
<td>Old timber housing in Sambizanga</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11</td>
<td>Participation of institutions</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12</td>
<td>Satellite Image of Huambo, with the urban core perimeter (red), also referred to as 'inner city' and the peri-urban perimeter (blue)</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 13</td>
<td>Colonial house in bairro S. José</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 14</td>
<td>Consolidated adobe housing in bairro Kalundo</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 15</td>
<td>Huambo structural Plan</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 16</td>
<td>Location of bairro Fátima, Zones A and B</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 17</td>
<td>Picture of the physical plan drafted for bairro Fátima</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 18</td>
<td>Community members clearing the land to be urbanised (Zone B)</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 19</td>
<td>Machinery contracted by project revenues to open access roads</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 20</td>
<td>One of the many sensitisation meetings with community members</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 21</td>
<td>Discussing the physical plan with the local Administrator</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Name (Portuguese)</td>
<td>Name (English)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADRA</td>
<td>Acção para o Desenvolvimento Rural em Angola</td>
<td>Action for Rural Development in Angola</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBO</td>
<td>Community Based Organization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDS</td>
<td>City Development Strategy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFB</td>
<td>Caminho de Ferro de Benguela</td>
<td>Benguela Railway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COSATU</td>
<td>Council of South African Trade Unions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>UK Department for International Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPUA</td>
<td>Direcção Provincial de Urbanismo e Ambiente</td>
<td>Provincial Department of Urbanism and Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Democratic Republic of Congo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DW</td>
<td>Development Workshop</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDURB</td>
<td>Empresa de Desenvolvimento Urbano</td>
<td>Urban Development Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELISAL</td>
<td>Empresa de Limpeza e Saneamento de Luanda</td>
<td>Enterprise for Cleaning and Sanitation in Luanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPAL</td>
<td>Empresa de Aguas de Luanda</td>
<td>Enterprise for Water in Luanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>Food and Agriculture Organization of the UN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FNLA</td>
<td>Frente Nacional para a Libertação de Angola</td>
<td>Angolan National Liberation Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEPE</td>
<td>Gabinete Estudo, Planeamento, Estatística</td>
<td>Office for Assessments, Planning and Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHA</td>
<td>Gabinete de Habitação de Angola</td>
<td>Angolan Housing Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRN</td>
<td>Gabinete de Reconstrução Nacional</td>
<td>Office for National Reconstruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Integrated Development Plan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGCA</td>
<td>Instituto de Geografia e Cadastro de Angola</td>
<td>Institute for Geography and Cadastre in Angola</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Name</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INOTU</td>
<td>Instituto Nacional de Ordenamento do Território e Desenvolvimento Urbano</td>
<td>National Institute for Territorial Planning and Urban Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jmpla</td>
<td>Juventude do Movimento pela Libertação de Angola</td>
<td>Youth of the Movement for the Liberation of Angola</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lupp</td>
<td>Luanda Urban Poverty Programme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mat</td>
<td>Ministério de Administração do Território</td>
<td>Ministry of Territorial Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mdg</td>
<td>Millenium Development Goal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mfa</td>
<td>Movimento das Forças Armadas</td>
<td>Armed Forces Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minplan</td>
<td>Ministério de Planeamento</td>
<td>Ministry of Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minua</td>
<td>Ministério de Urbanismo e Ambiente</td>
<td>Ministry of Urbanism and Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mou</td>
<td>Memorandum of Understanding</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPLA</td>
<td>Movimento Pela Libertação de Angola</td>
<td>Movement for the Liberation of Angola</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP</td>
<td>National Party</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMA</td>
<td>Organização das Mulheres de Angola</td>
<td>Angolan Women’s Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPA</td>
<td>Organização dos Pioneiros de Angola</td>
<td>Angolan Organization of Pioneers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIP</td>
<td>Plano de Investimento Publico</td>
<td>Public Investment Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPB</td>
<td>Partido Progressista Brasileiro</td>
<td>Brazilian Progressive Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT</td>
<td>Partido dos Trabalhadores</td>
<td>Workers Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDI</td>
<td>Rural Development Institute</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDP</td>
<td>Reconstruction and Development Programme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacn</td>
<td>South African City Network</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACP</td>
<td>South African Communist Party</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADF</td>
<td>South African Defense Force</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SALGA</td>
<td>South African Local Government Association</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAP</td>
<td>Structural Adjustment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDF</td>
<td>South West African People’s Organization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITA</td>
<td>União Nacional para a Independência Total de Angola</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNTA</td>
<td>União Nacional dos Trabalhadores de Angola</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZEIS</td>
<td>Zona de Especial Interesse Social</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Programme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spatial Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Framework</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Independence of Angola</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>National Union for the Total Independence of Angola</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Angolan National Workers Union</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Special Social Interest Zone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Research aims

1.1.1 Research overview

This thesis analyses urban planning as a subset of governance, considering it a process through which decisions are taken on urban land use, examining whether wider participation in this process contributes to outcomes and impact that are sustainable in their social, economic and environmental dimensions.

The importance of widening participation in spatial planning processes has been emphasised by theorists, practitioners, governments and international agencies in North and South, especially since the 1960s (Sandercock 1998).¹ With varying degrees, most countries in the North have adapted some form of participation in their urban planning systems, shaped by their specific political, economic and social structures. In the course of practice and debate, different theories evolved, many with a distinct approach to participation. During the 1990s, the collaborative planning approach emerged with an especially important influence in many countries in the North (Watson 2003). Similarly in the field of development studies and practice, participatory approaches were taken on board from the 1980s onward as a response to the more top-down approaches that were previously dominant (Martinussen 2003). Especially during the 1990s, the concept of community participation reached an ideological dimension in the way it influenced and shaped development studies, policy and practice (Cleaver 2001).

Normative approaches such as collaborative planning and community participation in development can be characterised by their concern about participation in the process of planning, and arguably less about planning outcomes or impact. These approaches further promote methods which assume universal validity and applicability (Kothari 2002). These and other characteristics are widely critiqued within planning theory and development studies (Watson 2003; Flyvbjerg 1998; Fainstein 2000; Yiftachel and Huxley 2000).

¹ The North-South terminology has been introduced in the 1980s. Although it has been criticised for a simplistic view of a world divided between wealthy modern states (mainly in the North) on the one hand, and poor backward states on the other (mainly in the South) (Drakakis-Smith 2000: 4-6), the concept, while imperfect, nevertheless is useful in the context of this thesis.
Based on this critique, the thesis argues that these approaches do not give enough importance to the specificity of local urban development and governance contexts, often overriding existing and legitimate decision-making structures and not appreciating how great the differences of interests are among key players.

The thesis then argues that these theories therefore provide an insufficient basis for analysing the role and importance of participation in urban planning, suggesting instead the need for any analysis to initiate from a detailed understanding of the local development and governance context and the function of planning within this context. Based on this argument, the thesis then discusses two relatively well documented participatory planning case studies. *Bairro*² Legal, a slum-upgrading programme in São Paulo, Brazil (Cities Alliance 2004), and the city development strategy of Johannesburg, South Africa (Parnell and Robinson 2006), which are both considered successful interventions by international agency programme literature (Cities Alliance 2004; ECON 2005).

The case studies analysis reinforces the conceptual approach of the thesis, showing the importance of local development and governance contexts such as: levels of urban growth, sustainability of contemporary development trends and the workings of local politics in shaping planning processes and the effectiveness of participation. While São Paulo and Johannesburg both provided a challenging context, the case of Angola provides an example where these challenges for participation and urban planning are even greater, mainly due to extremely rapid urban growth, very weak formal government institutions and an only nascent civil society. As such, the case studies in Angola are seen as a way to study the theoretical and subsequent policy approaches advocated in a more testing environment.

In Angola, a country with a recent and devastating colonial history and marked by economic mis-management and three decades of civil war since independence in 1975, participatory governance has just very recently become mentioned as part of the Government’s agenda. Equally, urban expansion and urban development have only recently received increased attention, albeit still very inadequate taking into consideration extreme rapid urban growth and increasing urban poverty (DW and CEHS 2005). The urban governance context in Angola is characterised by very weak democratic institutions

---

² The word ‘bairro’ is Portuguese and means ‘neighbourhood’.
that are undermined by informal and non-transparent decision-making processes influenced by a very powerful political and economic elite (Hodges 2001).

In this context, participation in urban governance and planning is virtually non-existent, routinely excluding not only communities and civil society, but also in many cases local or even central government institutions. In comparison to Brazil and South Africa, Angola therefore arguably provides an even more challenging context for participatory approaches to effectively contribute to planning outcomes and impact, this being examined in detail through two different case studies. Based on the case study analysis, the thesis argues that internationally championed collaborative planning or community participation approaches and methods are of very limited applicability in the Angolan context, as they are based on assumptions of certain governance contexts. What is suggested is an incremental, pragmatic and action oriented approach (Hamdi 2004) that develops within the local context, builds on local initiatives and ‘realpolitik’, and by doing so develops long term partnerships between local institutions, using the spaces that recent planning legislation and increasingly de-concentrated government are providing. In terms of participatory approaches, the argument suggests building on those initial forms of participation that are developing in the local context, introducing international experiences where appropriate and considered useful by local actors. In doing so, the prime objective of urban planning is not about perfecting participatory methods, but about making it most contextually applicable for sustainable urban development.

1.1.2 Contributions of the research

This thesis does not generate new theory. It does however advocate an approach to participatory planning that rejects the communicative approach as being limited in its analysis of power. The approach promoted in this thesis is rather sited within the radical planning approach, but one that accepts engagement with the state and other powerful actors such as in the private sector. In this, the thesis advocates a ‘realpolitik’ approach to understanding the governance context first and foremost as a means to understand and deal with resource conflicts over sustainable development. Based on the case study analysis, the thesis further promotes an approach that is action-oriented, is more suggestive than normative, calling attention to key issues like long term partnerships and a focus on small changes, rather than promoting universally applicable approaches.
The thesis contributes to knowledge on urban development, governance and planning in Angola. To date, there has been only one attempt of a coherent and inclusive analysis of urban development in Angola (DW and CEHS 2005). This thesis builds on this research, bringing in more information from previously untapped grey literature and taking the researched urban land issues further in relation to urban land planning processes. In addition very little academic research has been undertaken on urban governance in Angola, apart from un-published postgraduate research and international agency development reports. Building on this fragmented information base, and completing it with primary data, the thesis provides a coherent account on the development and contemporary urban governance context in Angola. By examining case studies in Luanda and Huambo, the thesis further contributes towards a better understanding of urban development dynamics of the two cities. While there is some literature about urban development in Luanda, hardly anything exists about secondary cities such as Huambo, the thesis therefore arguably having made a potentially important contribution to increase the body of knowledge about urban development and planning in secondary cities in Angola, and through this process to the body of knowledge on Sub-Saharan African cities.

In terms of method, this research used a comparative case study approach where information was discussed and analysed in inference to an analytical framework. As such, while there is nothing innovative or new about the research method per se, the method proved very useful for undertaking research in a country like Angola, with great difficulty in access to data and limited research capacity. In combination with the 'insider' status of the researcher, the case study approach made it possible to make an in-depth analysis of the research topic, in the absence of available secondary information, mainly through the collection of primary data. The thesis therefore suggests that this approach provides an important additional approach to literature based research and surveys in countries where critical information is scarce and statistics unreliable, giving the possibility to transcend the superficial and dominating discourses and conduct in-depth academic investigation even with very limited resources.
1.2 Research objectives and questions

Three key research objectives have been developed, each being divided into research questions which are being addressed in the course of the thesis.

Objective 1: To examine the debate on participatory planning as a contribution to sustainable urban development in planning theory, development studies and international development policy.

Research questions:

1.1 What are the most influential approaches to participation in urban planning theory, development studies and international development policy and what critique exists of these approaches?
1.2 How does the concept of governance help to analyse and guide participatory planning processes?
1.3 What is meant by ‘sustainable urban development’?

Objective 2: To critically examine four different case studies of participatory urban planning in countries in the South and to assess the relevance of these planning approaches for sustainable urban development.

Research questions:

2.1 What are contemporary urban development trends and what forms of sustainable urban development would be desirable in the case study city?
2.2 What is the governance context of the case studies and what kind of participatory mechanisms are practiced within this context?
2.3 What are the legal framework, policy and contemporary practice of urban planning in the case study context?
2.4 What kind of participatory planning is the case study presenting and how does it contribute to the desired sustainable development of the city?
Objective 3: To discuss what forms of participatory planning are most likely to contribute to sustainable urban development in Angola.

Research question:

3.1 Based on the two Angola case studies, international experience and prior analysis, what kind of participatory planning is most likely to contribute to sustainable urban development in Angola?

1.3 Thesis structure

Overall, the thesis is structured to provide the best possible and most logical flow of the argument, leading from the more general theoretical part towards the specific case studies and then back to the general in the conclusions of the thesis.

This Chapter One provides the introduction to the research and presents the research questions.

Chapter Two creates the theoretical and conceptual analytical framework of the thesis. The first section discusses the concept of participation in different theories in the fields of planning and development studies and in international development policy. It argues that similar normative approaches to participation developed in both theory and policy, these however being contested and criticised for being too ideological, context independent, not giving sufficient importance to issues of power and often overriding existing and legitimate governance structures. Based on this critique, the thesis suggests that planning needs to be seen as part of governance, characterised as a decision-making process in a given context. Following this argument, the second section discusses the concept of governance which is defined as consisting of three spheres, the state, civil society and the private sector. It identifies structuring factors within a governance context, such as political systems and levels of decentralisation, as well as the transformative power of civil society. The third section then provides a historic account of how the concept of sustainable development became integral to contemporary debate in urban planning and international development. The discussion looks at the different dimensions of sustainability which include political, economic, social and environmental aspects, identifying conflicting interests among them. Finally, the chapter then concludes the discussion and constructs the main arguments of the previous three sections into forming the analytical framework through which the case studies are examined.
Chapter Three gives a detailed account of the research timeline, research approach, data collection and analytical methods and the role of ethics in research. The main research approach used in this PhD research is case study research, having selected four different urban planning case studies, these being:

1. The slum-upgrading programme Bairro Legal in São Paulo, Brazil;
2. The strategic planning process ‘Jo’burg 2030’ in Johannesburg, South Africa;
3. The Sambizanga Municipal Planning Process in Luanda, Angola; and,
4. The Bairro Fátima lay-out planning and slum-upgrading project in Huambo, Angola.

After having outlined the justification of selecting these specific four case studies, the chapter continues looking at the issue of generalisability of case study analysis results. It is argued that case study research can achieve a high degree of generalisability through theoretical inference, an approach that is applied in this thesis. Within the case study research approach, several data collection and analytical methods are applied, each one presented in the following section. The methods include literature review, interviewing, participatory observation and ‘insider’ accounts, and the triangulation of data and information. Concluding, the role of ethics in research is discussed, with a specific focus on ethic principles and the importance of values and objectivity in data interpretation.

Chapter four examines two international case studies of participatory planning in the South, these being a case of participatory slum-upgrading in São Paulo, Brazil and an experience of strategic planning in Johannesburg, South Africa. Using the analytical framework developed in chapter two, both case studies are examined with an emphasis on the development and governance context that significantly influenced these planning processes, outcomes and impacts. Overall, the two case studies offer an important insight into the potential and challenge of participation in urban planning in the context of rapidly expanding cities with relatively low levels of sustainability, using this concept as defined in chapter two. This insight is used later in the analysis of the Angolan case studies, where the cases of São Paulo and Johannesburg are referred to on several occasions.

Chapter Five provides an introduction to the development, governance and urban planning context in Angola. After a general introduction to the country, the chapter first looks at urban development with a specific focus on urban growth and the sustainability
of contemporary urban development trends. It then provides an overview of the governance context, focusing on three specific aspects, this being the impact of the armed conflict, Angolan ‘realpolitik’ since independence, and the emergence of Angolan civil society since the early 1990s. The chapter argues that although Angola is a constitutional representative parliamentary democracy since 1991 and has nominally created most democratic institutions to function as such, most important decision-making about economic, political and social life is undertaken through informal governance structures linked to the country’s powerful economic and political elite. This recognition is fundamental for discussing the challenges of participatory urban planning in the following chapter. The last section then examines the urban planning system in Angola, specifically looking at the process of decentralisation and its importance for urban planning, as well as the contemporary land use and planning legislation. The section concludes that the legal framework for urban planning is still very incomplete and with low levels of statutory participation if compared for example to Brazil or South Africa.

**Chapter Six** provides a detailed case study of participatory urban planning implemented by the Municipality of Sambizanga in Luanda in 2005 with assistance by the international development organization Development Workshop. The chapter starts with a detailed discussion of the development and governance context in Luanda, providing insight into the role of urban planning, this further illustrated by an overview of four contemporary planning processes in Luanda. The chapter subsequently examines the participatory planning case study in detail, concluding that although interesting levels of participation did take place during the process and although the output (the urban plan) contains important aspects of sustainability, this was not implemented and therefore failed to contribute to sustainable development. In analysing and explaining these conclusions, the text refers to the development and governance context of Luanda specifically and of Angola in general.

**Chapter Seven** provides another in-depth case study of participatory urban planning, implemented in the city of Huambo through a partnership between the Provincial Government of Huambo and Development Workshop. This case study implemented activities for slum-prevention and slum-upgrading through basic lay-out planning at the periphery of the city. The discussion shows how the project achieved key stakeholder participation which proved fundamental for the project outcome, as well as reasonable levels of community participation that facilitated the project implementation. The chapter
further argues that the planning process resulted in an immediate contribution to
sustainable development in its different dimensions. Through this immediate contribution,
the planning approach has gained credibility in the local government institutions and is
being applied in other parts of the city. The chapter concludes that in the current
governance context of Angola, this form of local planning, in partnership with provincial
and local government, has a more direct influence on urban development.

**Chapter Eight** finally revises the key issues of the thesis, concluding that participation
indeed can contribute to sustainable urban development in Angola, if:

- planning is actually linked to development;
- participation is considered as the basis for partnerships with local stakeholders;
- participation is considered primarily as a means to an end; and,
- participatory approaches are pragmatic, contextually based and action oriented.
Chapter 2: Analytical Framework – Participation, Governance and Sustainable Development

2.1 Introduction

Through a literature review, this chapter develops the analytical framework of the thesis, providing answers to following research questions:

1.1 What are the most influential approaches to participation in urban planning theory, development studies and international development policy and what critique exists of these approaches?
1.2 How does the concept of governance help to analyse and guide participatory planning processes?
1.3 What is meant by ‘sustainable urban development’?

In order to respond to research question 1.1, the next section of this chapter commences with an overview of some of the most important planning theories that discuss participatory planning. The discussion continues with an examination of participatory approaches in the field of development studies, and finally examines a specific case of international urban development policy.

Responding to research question 1.2, this section introduces the concept of governance, looking at actors that make up governance, structuring issues that define the concept and the question of participation in governance.

The third section, responding to research question 1.3, looks at the origins of the concept of sustainability and its contemporary meaning, especially focusing on those aspects that are important in the context of this thesis.

The conclusions finally summarise the key issues of this chapter, then proceeding to present the resulting analytical framework that is being used for the analysis of the case studies in Brazil, South Africa and Angola.
2.2 Participation in planning theory, development studies and development policy

2.2.1 Participation in urban planning theory

Planning theory has evolved considerably over the last decades. This however does not mean that all issues in planning thought of in earlier periods of theoretical debate have been resolved or come to a conclusion, as the field is currently so broad that most positions and issues live on with a wide range of approaches and theories seen as valid in different circumstances by different parties.

Until the 1960s, participation was not a major concern in planning theory and practice with planners being supposed to be able to assess the public interest through their (scientific) education. The planners' methods and techniques were assumed to be based on strong, scientific and objective knowledge as in other professions (Sandercock 1998: 169-170). In this period, comprehensive-rational planning was the dominant model in countries in the North, but was also being 'exported' through international development programmes overseas (Sandercock 1998: 169-170; Hudson 1979: 388). The model advocates an understanding of urban environments as comprehensive systems. It aims at managing and controlling a particular system in the environment, for which purpose it describes and analyses the system to be controlled, models it, designs a plan and evaluates the plan, an exercise which is continuously repeated. It is therefore a continuous process which works by seeking to devise appropriate ways of controlling the system concerned, and then by monitoring the effects to see how far the controls have been effective. For analysis and evaluation, the model relies heavily on numbers and quantitative methods (Campbell and Fainstein 2003: 9). In this model, planners are part of an ambitiously comprehensive public policy process, attempting to coordinate more and more specialised activities. The planner is the 'knower', relying on his professional expertise to do what was best for 'the public'. The notion of 'the public' is not critically examined and implies an undifferentiated homogeneous group, generally ignoring the needs of the poor and weak (Campbell and Fainstein 2003: 9).

The model however fails on several aspects, two of which being its misleading simplification of the notion of the public, and the challenge to monitor increasingly complex urban systems (Campbell and Fainstein 2003: 8). It has also been criticised for

3 However even during this period, participation and public consultation could be observed on some occasions. See for example: Rydin 1999: 184-185.
being top-down and anti-democratic, with a tendency of central control of the definition of problems, solutions and elaboration of alternatives (Hudson 1979: 389). Further, the model is based on processes with little regard to political aspects or the context where it is operating (Fainstein 2000: 452). Towards the end of the 1960s, these critiques grew stronger, leading to policy reviews in several countries. In the UK, the Skeffington report ‘People and Plans’ published in 1969 is often considered as the turning point in attitudes to public participation in planning. It emphasised the need for the public to be informed, consulted and actively involved in planning decisions and the preparation of plans. In the US there were similar calls for ‘maximum feasible participation’ and in Australia the government passed legislation in the mid 1970s that required public participation in planning processes (Sandercock 2005: 437). At the same time governments were being put under pressure by emerging urban movements that required a greater say in city politics, accompanied by an upsurge of opinion against comprehensive urban re-development that was often a result of this form of planning. This rise of civil society arguably had a very important role in democratising urban planning processes, pressuring for more opportunities of participation (Sandercock 2005: 438). These developments resulted in the surge of new planning models and approaches, most of them showing modifications of the rational comprehensive model or reactions to it, many with an increased emphasis on participation.

One of the new models was the advocacy planning model which emerged in the 1960s in the US at a time when the civil rights movement was at the height of its momentum. The basis of this planning approach is the recognition that the interest groups that normally have an influence on planning processes are usually well funded, well organized and highly articulate. The poor, minorities and disadvantaged however are often not able to make their concerns heard. The approach argues that it is therefore not sufficient for the planner to be a mere technician, but she/he must act as an advocate promoting the needs of the disadvantaged (Cullingworth and Caves 2003: 14; Davidoff 1995: 52-54). However, field experience with this model quickly showed that the poor actually did not lack technical skills that the advocacy planners were offering, but in fact the power to control action (Sandercock 1998: 171). Advocacy planning therefore expanded the role of the professionals and left the structure of power intact, largely in the hands of experts and confident in the workings of plural democracy. The model, as is argued by some of its critiques, is seemingly at odds with the comprehensive-rational model but does in fact serve to perfect it (Sandercock 1998: 171). In general, however, the approach has both
reflected and contributed to a general trend in planning away from assumed neutral objectivity in the definition of social problems in favour of applying more explicit value systems, such as principles of social justice (Hudson 1979: 390). Based on their experiences, advocacy planners turned in different directions, such as equity planning, social learning or more radical empowerment approaches to planning. Advocacy planning therefore provided a fertile ground for the development of other important models with an emphasis on participation of civil society and the empowerment of social actors (Sandercock 1998: 172).

One offspring from advocacy planning is the equity planning model. Equity planners have been defined as “[…] those who consciously seek to redistribute power, resources or participation away from local elites and toward poor and working-class city residents.” (Sandercock 1998: 173) The model does not draw much on local knowledge, but, like the comprehensive-rational and advocacy models, believes primarily in the planner’s expertise. The equity planner works within the state which is however not considered a monolithic adversary, but a terrain of political struggle. Within this terrain, the planner works together with cooperative social actors and through such action is in a position to do good for wider society. Communication skills are a key quality required by equity planners for posing questions, reformulating problems and advocating solutions. The main critique of this model is that it promotes and practices ‘top-down exclusionary politics’ without giving active roles to the poor and marginalised (Sandercock 1998: 174).

A more radical planning approach also emerged in the late 1970s, with planners coming from different backgrounds such as advocacy planning, feminism, civil rights or poverty and exclusion in international development. More than other planning approaches, radical planning promotes specific and substantive ideas about collective action and how this can achieve concrete results (Hudson 1979: 390). Similar to advocacy and equity planning, radical planning starts by creating a clear understanding of existing unequal relations and distributions of power in society. It does, however, take a different approach in the search for change, not advocating for the poor nor relying on expert-knowledge, but calling for collective action with the goal “[…] to work for structural transformation of systemic inequalities and in the process, to empower those who have been systematically disempowered.” (Sandercock 1998: 176) Radical planning recognises that the poor speak with many voices and that oppression has many faces such as class, gender and race. To address such social injustice, most radical planners offered solutions related to
community organization, action by urban social movements and issues of empowerment, rather than working through the state (Sandercock 1998: 179). Radical planning discourse further debates two important issues concerning the relationship between state, civil society and community. It stresses the importance of understanding not only the inhibiting role of the state in terms of participation, but also its complementary role vis-à-vis civil society. This argument therefore refuses to label the state as the ‘enemy’, pointing out its progressive role in many contexts, opening spaces for participation for example that in turn lead towards a more meaningful engagement of civil society and communities. The same discourse also emphasises the urgent need to de-romanticise community, recognising its diversity and potential for oppression in relation to the individual and society. Sandercock (1998: 179) summarises that:

“There is an unresolved and unresolvable tension between the transformative and repressive powers of state-directed planning practices, and their mirror image, the transformative and also repressive potential of the local, the grassroots, the insurgent.”

As a reflection of this tension, radical planners were split among those who advocated for the planner to ‘cross over’ to the community, shedding her professional status and those who defended a more critical distance to the community, without the planner losing her professional identity (Sandercock 1998:176-180).

In the early 1970s, also as an offspring to advocacy planning, another approach to planning emerged in the form of models that promoted communicative action and social learning. John Friedmann at the time used the term of a transactive style of planning by which he described a process of mutual learning between planners and their clients (Sandercock 1998: 174). What is argued radical about this approach is “[…] its epistemological shift away from the monopoly on expertise and insight by professionals to an acknowledgement of the value of local, or experiential, knowledge.” (Sandercock 1998: 175) In the 1980s another group of scholars started studying communicative action and planning based on the same fundamental observation as the transactive planners, that planning is above all a communicative activity. John Forrester was also one of the main proponents of this approach, based on the Habermasian concept of communicative action (Watson 2002: 29). During the 1990s, this approach was further developed and became commonly known as the communicative or collaborative planning model, having
gained wider acceptance and by some having become considered one of the dominant planning models at the time (Watson 2003: 397; Yiftachel and Huxley 2000: 907). The concept of communicative rationality and action, according to Flyvbjerg (1998: 187),

"[...] recalls older ideas of logos, inasmuch as it brings along with it the connotations of a non-coercively unifying, consensus-building force of a discourse in which the participants overcome their at first subjectively based views in favour of a rationally motivated agreement."

Based on this principle, the focus is not for planners to solve problems, but more on opening up debate about these. For collaborative planners, as Watson (2003: 398) summarises:

"[...] planning decisions should be reached through collaborative processes involving all stakeholders, and conforming to particular rules which ensure that participation is fair, equal and empowering. Embedded in this approach are the assumptions that community division can be overcome and consensus can be reached on planning issues; that collaborative processes involving primarily civil society-based groups can act to put pressure on the state to act more responsibly; and that collaboration can provide a learning environment and can serve to build social capital within communities."

The core of this approach is therefore the unconstrained, unifying, consensus-bringing force of argumentative speech, where all take part, freely and equally, in a cooperative search for truth, where nobody coerces anyone except the force of the better argument (Flyvbjerg 1998: 187). For the collaborative planner planning is no longer the outcome of a technical process but is produced through a social process within a specific context.

Collaborative planning has been considered a very valuable contribution to urban planning, especially through the importance it gives to communicative action with the potential for conflict resolution and its emphasis on the importance of participatory approaches during planning processes. On the other hand, it has also received critique on several levels, one of the most explicit being its insufficient recognition of power relations that shape and influence planning processes (Sandercock 1998: 175). Hague and Jenkins (2004) for example argue that the focus on consensus in collaborative planning
can ignore fundamental power imbalances that exist by specific forms of governance where state, private sector, and certain civil society lobbying groups have more resources and capacities to provide inputs to planning processes than wider civil society or individuals. They further argue that:

“This view [collaborative planning] assumes good will and an openness to sharing or redistributing power that often does not exist in practice [...]. It is thus an arguably desirable model, but one that understates the realpolitik of many planning decisions, where huge interests can be at stake, and negotiating positions can be defended to extreme lengths (as protracted planning inquiries illustrate).” (Hague and Jenkins 2004: 53)

The limited consideration of power in collaborative planning is rooted in Habermas’ communicative rationality. This aspect is criticised by Flyvbjerg who argues that in Habermas’ theory, communication takes place in an ideal setting where validity, truth and consensus are determined by rational argumentation and are ensured by several processual requirements. Participation in this form is discursive and detached participation, inasmuch as communicative rationality requires consensus through ideal role taking and power neutrality (Flyvbjerg 1998: 188). The basic weakness of Habermas’ model in Flyvbjerg’s analysis is therefore the lack of agreement between ideal and reality, between intentions and their implementation (Flyvbjerg 1998: 192). It is not that the concept of power is completely absent in Habermas’ model, but it is underdeveloped. This leads us to another critique of the collaborative approach which is the argument that this model underestimates the differences that planning encounters in reality, especially in cities in the South. Watson (2003: 395-402) for example argues that there is not sufficient account of just how deep difference can be. She also highlights the very specific context of African cities where rationalities of modern state administration are at once conflicting but also interacting with local rationalities of kinship, patrimonial power relations and informal and formal social networks. What in this context can be observed is a gap between the planner’s assumptions and reality. She argues that in this kind of context:

“[...] the clash of rationalities, or the differences in world-view between the various parties involved, is so great that it is difficult to believe that any amount of discussion or conflict resolution could overcome the divide and achieve consensus: differences go far beyond speech-level misunderstandings or an
unwillingness to see the others’ point of view. It is also difficult to imagine [...] what institutional arrangements, or what systems of governance, might cope with such schisms.” (Watson 2003: 402)

The collaborative planning approach therefore tends to neglect the characteristics of the specific context where planners work, as well as making the planner the central focus of analysis (Fainstein 2000: 455). Instead of asking what specifically should be done about cities or regions, this approach focuses on what the planner should be doing. In fact, Fainstein (2000: 456) argues that “The present trend among communicative planning theorists is to avoid broad examinations of the relationship between planning, politics, and urban development.” She continues that:

“Communicative theorists avoid dealing with the classic topic of what to do when open processes produce unjust results. They also do not consider the possibility that paternalism and bureaucratic modes of decision-making may produce desirable outcomes.” (Fainstein 2000: 456)

An alternative approach to planning, avoiding the above discussed shortcomings of collaborative planning is based on Just City theory. The proponents of Just City theory can be divided into two broad categories, one with a focus on participation in the planning process and another category that has a very normative perception on the distribution of benefits as a result of the planning outcome. The former differs from the collaborative planning approach, because it includes ideas from radical planning, arguing that progressive social change is only possible by the exercise of power by those that previously have been excluded from power. The latter group values this perception of participation in decision-making by relatively powerless groups but evaluates the contribution of this participation in terms of equity of outcomes (Fainstein 2000: 468).

The Just City theory therefore contains a notion of participation not only as part of a democratic, procedural process, but is also content focused, evaluating whether participation actually contributes to the achievement of a just city or whether participatory democracy reinforces existing, unjust power relations. In doing so, the theory recognises that democratic institutions can be used and bent in un-democratic ways for personal and group advantage (Flyvbjerg 1998: 19; Fainstein 2000: 469-470). Of all planning theories discussed in this section, Just City theory arguably provides the most inclusive approach.
in assessing the contribution of participation in planning for sustainable urban development, this also because it explicitly challenges the common assumption that plans are prepared and subsequently implemented. This assumption is misleading, because sometimes plans are prepared as a short term answer to political pressure to ‘do something’. Or they are used as propaganda intended to increase the attraction of an area (Cullingworth 2003: 14-15). This is a core issue for the argument of this thesis, because if participation is taking place for plans that are then not implemented, participation does arguably not contribute to development at all, including sustainable development.

2.2.2 Participation in development studies

Participatory approaches to development are conventionally seen as emerging out of the recognition of the shortcomings of other, more top-down, development approaches that were dominant during the first decades after the Second World War and dominated policy and practice until the end of the 1980s. In most of these approaches, the principal participants in development processes were governments in countries in the South, international agencies and bilateral donor organizations (Martinussen 2003: 331). Only in the 1990s did the issue of participation of local development actors such as local government or civil society became more common practice. This emerging approach to more inclusive participation subsequently became mainstreamed into existing development theories and policies that were developed since the 1950s. As has also been observed in planning theory, theories in development studies that developed during the post 1950 period have not substituted each other, but rather accumulated, with many of them continuing to influence contemporary development policy and practice, albeit since the 1990s, often with an added emphasis on community participation. Therefore, before discussing the emergence of broad community participation in development studies and policy, this section provides a short overview of some of the main development theories that developed since the 1950s.

The discussion of development theory since the 1950s can be structured around four principal paradigms: modernisation, dependency theory, ‘basic needs’ and ‘redistribution with growth’, and neo-liberalism (Jenkins et.al. 2007: 36).

The modernisation paradigm was the dominant paradigm during the 1950s and 1960s. It promoted an approach to development by which developing countries go through a process of structural change and by which underdeveloped and traditional countries in the
South strive towards greater similarity with Northern countries (Martinussen 2003: 38). The focus is on economic growth reflected by the increase of the Gross National Product (GNP) and there is little direct concern about poverty reduction and inequality, because a ‘trickle-down’ effect as a result of economic growth is assumed to eventually benefit the whole of the population. During the 1960s, the model became more complex and interdisciplinary with the recognition of the importance of non-economic factors. Towards the end of the decade though, modernisation policies were seen as failing because in practice the expected results were not visible (Jenkins et. al. 2007: 40). Some critical voices also argued that it did not provide a sustainable approach, pointing out that if all countries would achieve the levels of energy consumption and waste of the western industrialised countries, global resources would be depleted very rapidly (Pearce 2000: 17-18). However, the conception of development as a modernisation process with these characteristics has been retained in policy and practice, especially in government institutions in the South.

Dependency theory emerged in Latin America, mainly as a critical response to the failures of the modernisation approach. This concept for development is of Neo-Marxist origin (from the 1960s onwards) and has to do with the developing countries’ position in the international system. It is influenced by a structuralist approach with a focus on trade relations between the periphery and the centre and held views that development required the gaining of a nationally self-sustained economic process facilitating real independence from formerly colonising countries (Martinussen 2003: 39). Dependency theory had a distinct influence on national and international development policy and practice during the 1960s and early 1970s especially in Latin America (Jenkins et.al. 2007: 40-41).

‘Basic needs’ and ‘redistribution with growth’ approaches developed in parallel with dependency theory in the 1970s. These approaches recognised that economic growth alone does not automatically eliminate poverty, but on the contrary, can contribute to increased social and economic inequality. As a response, these approaches promoted a more active role by the state in order to guarantee that, through redistributive mechanisms, the basic needs of the poor were met. During the 1970s, these approaches influenced policy and practice of international agencies such as the World Bank which started to show an increased concern about poverty reduction through planned redistributive measures supported by economic growth (Jenkins et.al. 2007: 41-42). During the 1980s, however, the focus of the World Bank shifted towards a neo-liberal
view of development (see below), but in the 1990s, ‘basic needs’ and ‘redistribution with growth’ had a comeback and were again shaping the World Bank’s general approach to development (Martinussen 2003: 37).

A liberal market approach was dominant during the earlier years of the modernisation paradigm before being replaced with Keynesian interventionist thinking that was linked to the contemporary development of strong welfare states in Europe (Jenkins et al. 2007: 39). Liberalism gained renewed interest and acceptance from the 1970s onwards, from this period onwards described as ‘neo’-liberalism, at a time when the role of the welfare state was redefined in many European countries. The neo-liberalist paradigm promotes a free market approach and regards state interference as counter productive. The final breakthrough of the approach was linked to political changes especially in the US and UK and their strong position in the world economy and international organizations like the World Bank and IMF. This resulted in neo-liberal attitudes penetrating both domestic policy and attitudes towards how developing countries ought to prioritise in their economic policies (Jenkins et al. 2007: 44-47).

As a direct outcome of this approach, Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) were implemented in many countries in the South as a means of economic reform. In many cases however, there was no real political base for reform, neither from the respective government (who often were the same government that provoked the economic crisis), nor from the population, heavily affected by the austerity measures that accompanied structural reform. In most cases, the process remained incomplete and provoked many critiques related to the design of SAPs and the negative impact on the provision of social services, making life for the poor even harder (Schuurmann 1993: 11-12).

Based on the failures of many development approaches as discussed above and unexpected development successes of countries which did not follow any explicit development theory, the 1990s saw a certain marginalisation of development studies and a certain feeling of ‘crisis’ or ‘impasse’ in development studies literature (Schuurman 1993: 1). A general shift away from using ‘meta-theories’ as discussed above with their focus on societal formations in their entirety could be observed, giving way to an increasing number of ‘sector oriented theories’ with lower levels of abstractions. Participation was one of these emerging fields of theorising (Jenkins et al. 2007: 54; Martinussen 2003: 353).
Particularly influential in promoting participatory approaches in development policy and practice was the work of Robert Chambers which initiated from an interest in Rural Rapid Appraisals (RRA) and then Participatory Rural Appraisals towards participatory development in general (Cooke and Kothari 2001: 5). This new approach was welcomed by development practitioners and academics, because the involvement of local people’s perspectives, knowledge and priorities presented an appealing alternative to donor-driven and outsider led development. As a result, participatory approaches to development were taken on board by many international development agencies and partners in the South. During the 1990s, most of the big international agencies and donors institutionalised participatory approaches in their policy papers and operational guidelines. The 1993 Human Development Report (1993, cited in Martinussen 2003: 42) for example recommended that:

"[...] the authorities in developing countries – with outside support - should do everything in their power to promote participation of all citizens in both economic and political life, not merely as an instrument to further other development goals but as a goal in itself – as an important aspect of human development."

The World Bank followed suit in 1994 with a position paper with the title ‘The World Bank and Participation’ and with the ‘Participation Sourcebook’ (World Bank 1996) for which PRA was one of the influences behind its development (Francis 2001: 78). During the 1990s, the concept of participation in development subsequently became what is sometimes called an ‘act of faith’ or ideology, fundamentally influencing contemporary development policy and practice (Cleaver 2001: 36).

This participation ‘ideology’ however has not been without critique. For example, PRA and similar approaches assume communities to be homogenous entities, often not recognising that “[...] communities are rife with relational and structural divisions associated with factors such as: access to wealth and resources, politics, religion, cast, mobility and power.” (Lewer 1999: 2) Further, within much of the participatory development discourse, ‘people’s power’ or ‘local knowledge’ is seen as a fixed commodity that people have and own. Instead however, the critique argues that a more dynamic vision is needed for institutions and communities, one that includes social networks, takes into account power relations and recognises the inclusionary as well as
the exclusionary nature of participation. Exclusionary, because, as Kothari (2001: 142) argues:

“[that participatory development] can encourage a reassertion of control and power by dominant individuals and groups, that it can lead to the reification of social norms through self-surveillance and consensus-building, and that it purifies knowledge and the spaces of participation through the codification, classification and control of information, and its analysis and representation.”

Rigid participatory approaches further have a tendency to substitute locally legitimate decision-making processes which have advantages that participation cannot provide (Cooke and Kothari 2002: 7). Further critique points out “[...] how participation can result in political co-option, and can require contributions from participants in the form of labour, cash or kind and thus transfer some of the project costs on to beneficiaries.” (Cooke and Kothari 2001: 6) The same authors point out the quasi-religious associations of participatory rhetoric and practice (i.e. ‘acts of faith’) and the emphasis on the micro level of intervention that can obscure, and indeed sustain, broader macro-level inequalities and injustice. As the discussion in the following subsection shows, the ideology of participation is often quite explicitly reflected in contemporary international urban development policy.

2.2.3 Participation in international urban development policy – the example of the Cities Alliance

This subsection examines international urban development policy concerning participation in spatial planning, through a literature review of one major international urban development initiative, the Cities Alliance. This global alliance of cities and their development partners was launched in 1999 by the World Bank and UNCHS (Habitat)4, creating a partnership with heads of global associations and ten governments. The Cities Alliance aims to (Cities Alliance 2006b):

- Improve the quality of urban development cooperation and lending;
- Strengthen the impact of grant-funded urban development cooperation;

---

4 In 2002 a General Assembly resolution elevated the status of UNCHS to the level of a programme which was from then onwards called the United Nations Human Settlements Programme or UN-HABITAT.
Expand the level of resources reaching the urban poor by increasing the coherence of effort of existing programmes and sharpening the focus on scaling up successful approaches; and,

Provide a structured vehicle for advancing collective know-how.

To achieve these aims, the Alliance focuses on two priorities of action (Cities Alliance 2006b):

1. Cities Without Slums, through citywide and nationwide upgrading of low-income settlements to improve the livelihoods of the urban poor; and,

2. City Development Strategies, aimed at formulating a broad consensus on a vision and a set of priorities for city actions.

Cities Alliance however has not developed its own implementation capacity, but is drawing upon the existing capacities of its partners and the implementation projects are managed through the offices of these partners. It claims therefore to reinforce and complement the ongoing activities of its partners, such as UN-HABITAT’s two global campaigns, Secure Tenure and Urban Governance, the World Bank’s Urban and Local Government Strategy, the Urban Management Programme (UMP), the Sustainable Cities Programme (SCP), the Municipal Development Programme (MDP) and the UNDP-World Bank Water and Sanitation Programme (Cities Alliance 2006b). The following is an overview of the two priorities of action, city development strategies and slum-upgrading.

A City Development Strategy (CDS) is an approach to city-based strategic planning (ECON et.al. 2005: 1). It is “[...] a collaborative decision-making process designed to help reduce urban poverty and provide a basis for sustainable urban development.” (Cities Alliance 2005: 63) The first CDS was piloted in Asia in 1998 and since then over 100 cities worldwide have undertaken a CDS process (ECON et.al. 2005: 13). In general terms, CDSs seek to promote economic growth and poverty reduction, through the development of urban development strategies that include better local governance with a specific focus on financial management. The main value of a CDS is based on the recognition that “[...] well-positioned and well-timed public, private, and civil society strategic interventions can significantly alter a city’s development path.” (Cities Alliance 2006: 1) CDSs are also regarded as a means to achieve the Millennium Development
Goals (MDGs) on the local level, facilitating the convergence of urban planning processes and international development assistance. CDSs are initiated and driven by cities themselves and therefore can take many forms. Acknowledging local variance, CDS guidelines nevertheless identify five themes and eight methodological steps that should be followed in the elaboration of a CDS (Cities Alliance 2006a: 3-8). The five themes or areas to be studied and acted on are:

1. Livelihood, such as job creation, business development, and sources of household income;
2. Environmental sustainability and energy efficiency of the city and the quality of its service delivery;
3. Spatial form and its infrastructure;
4. Financial resources; and,
5. Governance.

For a specific CDS intervention, the literature identifies the following eight methodological steps to be followed:

1. Initiating the process;
2. Establishing the initial parameters and the scope of the CDS;
3. Making an initial assessment;
4. Formulating a vision;
5. Identifying strengths-weaknesses-opportunities-threats (SWOT analysis);
6. Setting strategic thrusts;
7. Building awareness; and,
8. Starting the implementation.

---

5 In 2000, the special UN Millennium Summit was held with the aim to establish a series of goals for humanity in the 21st century, based on key documents of UN conferences held during the previous decade, including Agenda 21 and the Habitat Agenda. Following this summit, which produced the Millennium Declaration, a road map with 8 specific global goals (MDGs) and 18 targets was produced at the General Assembly session. The MDGs provide a framework for the entire United Nations system to work coherently towards common ends. UN-HABITAT for example has been given responsibility for operationalising, collecting and measuring target 11 of Goal 7 which is: By 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers. See also Appendix 1 for a list with all Millennium Development Goals, Targets and Indicators.
Although the process of developing a CDS is considered important, some CDS literature clearly identifies the implementation of the strategy as the main goal that participants must pursue. In other words, a CDS without implementation is of no value (Cities Alliance 2005: 63; Cities Alliance 2006a: 8). There is however still little evidence of the results of CDSs in terms of implementation and therefore also little evidence of the contribution of CDSs to poverty alleviation (ECON et.al. 2005: 8).

For CDSs not to be a one-off event, the accompanying literature further points out that a CDS needs to be institutionalised and become an integral part of how the city is managed in order to make the process sustainable. A recent evaluation however records that this usually only takes place if there is a suitable governance framework into which a CDS can be integrated, such as the case in South Africa where cities must produce Integrated Development Plans on an annual basis (ECON et.al. 2005: 7). Overall, there seems to have been limited success in this regard.

Participation is referred to as a key issue in CDS literature, however not to be confused with good governance. Good governance in CDS literature includes the notion of civil participation, but the emphasis is clearly on good financial management (ECON et.al. 2005: 1). Although a recent evaluation considers the development of consultation and participation mechanisms as one of the most important achievements of the CDS process (ECON et.al. 2005: 6), it admits that consultation and participation processes are usually not monitored or evaluated. This means that even in cases where indicators exist, they are not applied in practice (ECON et.al. 2005: 41). The literature is further not consistent on the forms of participation that should be promoted. In some instances, the literature emphasises participation of all stakeholders, especially the poor (ECON et.al. 2005: 5) while in other documents participation is mainly referred to as representative participation through the organizations which constitute the key stakeholder group that leads the CDS process. In this case, in terms of direct participation, there is only a reference to “at least one open meeting (a town hall meeting) to provide information about the process and the opportunity for any group or person to speak up.” (Cities Alliance 2006: 43)

Cities Alliance engagement with slum-upgrading initiated in July 1999, when the Alliance developed the ‘Cities without Slums’ action plan that was launched by Nelson

---

6 IDPs are discussed in more details in chapter five in the discussion of the South African participatory planning case study in Johannesburg.
Mandela at the inaugural meeting of the Alliance in Berlin in December 1999. The action plan is being supported by the UN and has been endorsed at the UN Millennium Summit in 2000 where it became to reflect MDP Goal 7, Target 11. According to Cities Alliance (2007: 2), slum-upgrading consists of “physical, social, economic, organizational and environmental improvements undertaken cooperatively and locally among citizens, community groups, businesses and local authorities.”

Slum-upgrading as an action for urban development is nothing new. The World Bank and other organizations have implemented slum-upgrading projects since the 1970s (World Bank 2000; Cohen 2001). In the 2003 Global Report on Human Settlements (United Nations 2003: 165) participatory slum-upgrading, conducted not as a technical exercise but as a political, social and organizational plan, is described as the “accepted best practice for housing intervention in developing countries.” The challenge however comes along with the Cities Alliance emphasis on up-scaling. The 2003 Human Settlements report acknowledges that slum-upgrading has mostly been adopted on a limited scale or as demonstration projects. The report also points out that much organization, local goodwill and political will are necessary to make projects of this type work, and that it remains to be seen whether they are replicable on a wider scale (United Nations 2003: 166). Up-scaling is also closely linked to institutionalisation and sustainability of slum-upgrading and hence the wider governance issues noted above. As with CDSs, slum-upgrading projects can be a one-off event on the micro level if not taken on board as an urban policy by local and national governments.

Cities Alliance literature argues that participation, through the integration of the poor in decision-making processes and through building the social capital in poor communities, contributes significantly to sustainability and replication of its programmes (Cities Alliance 2005: 62). The literature calls for stakeholder participation to achieve political buy-in and community participation. The focus of community participation is on infrastructure and service delivery projects and community participation in this form is to take place in conception, development, financing, upgrading and maintenance of infrastructure and services to guarantee sustainability (Cities Alliance 1999: 7-9). Community participation however is not mentioned as a key method for slum-upgrading in the Cities Alliance charter which only refers to the establishment of consensus with local stakeholders, creation of alliances and mobilisation of resources (Cities Alliance 2006b).
Overall, participation promoted through CDS and slum-upgrading literature arguably reflects aspects of collaborative planning and the previously discussed ideology of participation, this being manifested by the literature’s emphasis on rather vague concepts of inclusive stakeholder and community participation as found. Similarly as in collaborative planning and the previously discussed participation ideology, the participation promoted through Cities Alliance literature neglects issues of power and politics in planning processes, promoting idealised and seemingly non-problematic and all inclusive stakeholder and community participation. Just as collaborative planning approaches, Cities Alliance policy does not mention the existence of fundamental differences that can arguably pose a great challenge to inclusive participation, also making participatory approaches look like universally applicable by the promotion of ‘steps to follow’, not mentioning the risk of substituting local and legitimate decision-making processes. Finally, the above discussion identifies a key weakness in the participation policy of the Cities Alliance. While one side of the literature is very normative about participation, Cities Alliance related literature (such as the CDS evaluation done by ECON et.al. 2005) points out that to date, there is no sufficient evidence of the effectiveness of these approaches.

Summarising this section, following key issues can be pointed out:

The first sub-section looked at different planning theories and the role they attribute to participatory approaches. The discussion showed that since the 1960s, several planning theories emerged in Northern countries with a collaborative approach becoming very influential in the 1990s. While this style of planning introduced valuable aspects of participation, it has also been criticised on several issues. Some of the dominant critique points out how collaborative planning neglects the issue of power in planning processes, and how it focuses on the planner’s role and the planning process, with the tendency to ignore planning outcomes and influence of planning contexts.

The second sub-section provided a similar examination of participatory approaches in contemporary development studies. The discussion showed how especially the concept of community participation reached an ideological dimension during the 1990s, with a profound influence on international development policy and practice.
The third sub-section then made an analysis of international development policy of participatory approaches, taking as an example the case of Cities Alliance literature. This discussion showed that aspects of collaborative planning and the community participation ideology are reflected in that specific literature, with a focus on participation during planning processes assuming that this participation would secure pro-poor outcomes. Some of the literature however points out that in practice this link has rarely been monitored and evaluated and that in fact the most important but often neglected aspect is the implementation of plans.

The key conclusion of this section therefore is that much of contemporary planning and development theory, as well as planning and urban development policy, are promoting the use of specific normative approaches to participation which are often based on assumptions that arguably often do not hold in the reality within which planning operates. As a response to this critique, the thesis suggests an approach to planning that has a greater emphasis on the planning context, examining how this context shapes planning processes. Two specific analytical tools are being used in this thesis for analysing the planning context, these being the concept of governance and the concept of sustainable development. Before discussing the concept of sustainable development, the following section examines the concept of governance, arguing that planning is part of governance, being a decision-making process where actors from state, civil society and the private sector potentially participate.

2.3 Governance and participation

2.3.1 The concept of governance

Governance is a contested concept without any generally accepted definition. The IMF and the World Bank for example started to include the concept into their policy and practice as a response to the failures of Structural Adjustment Programmes. Promoting ‘good’ governance, these institutions however tend to have a normative rather than analytical approach to governance, confining it to the promotion of sound economic management and an enabling environment for freer markets (Young 1999: 22-28). The IMF (2006: no page numbering) for example promotes that:

“Good governance is important for countries at all stages of development. Our approach is to concentrate on those aspects of good governance that are most
closely related to our surveillance over macroeconomic policies - namely, the transparency of government accounts, the effectiveness of public resource management, and the stability and transparency of the economic and regulatory environment for private sector activity.”

This understanding of good governance therefore does not automatically include concepts and values of democracy and participation. As Ake (1996: 172) points out, “Democracy entails good governance performance, but good governance performance does not entail democracy: good governance is perfectly compatible with political authoritarianism.” UN-HABITAT’s (2006: no page numbering) definition of good governance is somewhat more socially oriented, pointing out that:

“Urban governance is inextricably linked to the welfare of the citizenry. Good urban governance must enable women and men to access the benefits of urban citizenship. Good urban governance, based on the principle of urban citizenship, affirms that no man, woman or child can be denied access to the necessities of urban life, including adequate shelter, security of tenure, safe water, sanitation, a clean environment, health, education and nutrition, employment and public safety and mobility. Through good urban governance, citizens are provided with the platform which will allow them to use their talents to the full to improve their social and economic conditions.”

Governance, therefore, as a concept defined and used above by international agencies is very normative, and in the case of the IMF and World Bank, also rather confined with its focus on economic management issues. For the purpose of this thesis, a less normative and more analytical understanding of governance seems necessary and appropriate.

Recent research points out that governance can be understood as the sphere of relations between government, actors of civil society and the private sector, also referring to the processes of interaction between these (ODPM 2003: 7; Jenkins and Smith 2001). Based on extensive research in cities in the South, Devas (2001: 5-6) argues that:

“It is now widely accepted that governance is much more than the formal institutions of government. Governance includes the whole range of actors within civil society, such as community based or grass-roots organizations, NGOs, trade
unions, religious organizations and businesses, both formal and informal, alongside the various branches of government and governmental agencies, both national and local.”

Governance therefore is distinct from government in the way that it includes actors such as from civil society and the private sector. The study of governance also differs from that of government through its focus on the relationships between the different actors, such as between civil society and the state. Examining this relationship, two specific aspects seem especially important: first, what are the conditions for planning and participation that are created through the state, the political structures and organizational variables, (including legal frameworks) and second, what is the capacity of civil society to engage the state (McCarney 1995).

2.3.2 Political systems and levels of decentralisation

Political systems do have a broad influence on structuring a governance context, providing a framework for the interaction of different actors. One important political system adopted in different ways by a large number of countries is that of democracy. Contrary however to the often misleading conception that democracy is an unproblematic concept, an unquestionable ‘good’ about which there is little or no difference of opinion, the concept is ambiguous and with a variety of definitions (Abrahamson 2000: 67). One way of looking at democracy is focusing on how it is organizing government and citizen participation. According to Dahl (1971, cited in Martinussen 2003: 195), the concept of democracy should include:

- Meaningful and extensive competition among individuals and organized groups for the major positions of government power;
- A highly inclusive level of political participation in the selection of leaders and policies, at least through regular and fair elections, such that no major social group is excluded; and,
- A level of civil and political liberties – freedom of expression, freedom of the press, freedom to form and join organizations – sufficient to ensure the integrity of political competition and participation.

Many contemporary democracies however have adopted a rather minimalist model of democracy where participatory models are excluded or dismissed being considered un-
realistic (Abrahamson 2000: 67). Especially in many recent democracies in Africa, a model of democracy can be observed that is principally preoccupied with elections and the competition of political parties, aiming for votes and power.\footnote{A notable exception to this trend is South Africa, which is discussed in greater detail in chapter four.} Participation in these models is then simply confined to electoral participation. Important for the context of this thesis is therefore the fact that the political system of democracy does not automatically entail participatory governance mechanisms. Rather, democratic systems under investigation should be analysed for the existence and functioning of spaces of participation that they provide through their institutional set up. While many democracies in the South are modelled on a minimalist concept as described above, increased levels of decentralisation arguably began to open spaces of participation at the local government level.

Since the late 1980s, a policy of \textit{decentralisation} has become popular amongst donor agencies and national governments in many countries in the South (McCarney 1995: 121). In sub-Saharan Africa for example, the transfer of political power from the centre to the regional and local level has been observed as a general contemporary trend (Chazan et.al. 1999: 191).

The term decentralisation encompasses several forms of institutional arrangements and these can be classified into four different categories (Martinussen 2003: 210-212):

1. \textit{De-concentration} includes the handing over of some administrative or managerial responsibility to sub-national units within line ministries for example. In deconcentrated systems, the room for manoeuvre for such sub-national units varies, but they do not exist as discrete entities (as for example in the case of devolution as discussed below).

2. \textit{Delegation} is that case when public enterprises and other semi-autonomous government agencies are assigned responsibilities in certain sectors, mainly in energy, communications, ports, water and transport.

3. \textit{Devolution} means the transfer of authority and responsibility to regional or local governments with their own discretionary authority. This form of decentralisation gives sub-national governments considerable administrative and financial autonomy, and central government usually then has the role to oversee and ensure that sub-national governments operated within broad national guidelines.
4. **Privatisation** on the other hand refers to the case when government agencies pass the responsibility of project implementation or provision of services to private sector companies or NGOs.

While institutional arrangements of decentralisation vary, processes of decentralisation usually have the aim to make government and state administration more efficient and accountable (Mitlin 2004). Some general identifying characteristics of decentralisation therefore include:

"[...] the control by regional or local governments over their own budgets, legal affairs, and allocative processes. Furthermore, the government must be comprised of representatives of the local population and must hold authority over a wide range of diverse arenas." (Chazan et.al. 1999: 190)

The characteristics of decentralisation therefore, beside the focus on increased power, efficiency and accountability of local government, include participation of the local population which is being practiced for example through the election of mayors or local municipal councils. Beside increased power and resources of sub-national government, the concept of decentralisation as discussed in this section therefore also entails an increased participation of local governance actors in deciding how this power and resources are being used.

In reality, a range of variables is deciding whether such aims as increased participation and more equal access to resources are achieved. Such variables include the level of fiscal decentralisation or autonomous economic fiscal base (in other words, resources available for sub-national governments), the mode of election (or appointment) of sub-national government, levels of transparency and accountability and forms of participation by civil society and communities in local decision-making processes (Orre 2001: 31-35). Other important variables are local power structures, interests and the actual mode of function of local institutions. It has for example been observed that local elites tend to invade and significantly influence local authorities, often based on patron-client relationships and reproducing social and political exclusion (Martinussen 2003: 216; McCarney 1995:

---

8 As will be discussed in greater detail in the Angola case studies, the level of human and financial resources available for local government can be a decisive factor which conditions the capacity of these governments to comply with their tasks.
123). Important for the argument of this thesis is the fact that decentralisation is a fact in many countries in the South, bringing more power and resources to local governments and sometimes linked to increased citizen participation. It is however important to recognise that decentralisation as a concept and in reality is not intrinsically linked to increased participation, but that local context dependent variables decide whether wider participation is taking place or not.

2.3.3 The role of planning legislation

One main characteristic of democratic states in general is that they are organized and governed based on legal frameworks. In the urban context, this means that these legal and regulatory frameworks pervade urban development, urban management and the processes of urbanisation in any given specific context (McAuslan 1998: 45). As legal frameworks pervade urban development in general, they also frame levels of participation such as for example in planning processes. It is thus argued that institutionalising participation in legal frameworks is fundamental for creating spaces for participation in such a governance context. For example in many countries in the North in the late 1960s and early 1970s laws were introduced that made public consultation a statutory requirement for many aspects of urban planning. Writing during this period of change in the UK, Sewell and Coppock (1977: 6) observed that “Legislation and changes in administrative structures and public policies, however, will ensure that a somewhat higher level of such participation will prevail than before the present movement began.”

Legal frameworks however are in many cases not the only structuring factor for decision-making processes in general and planning specifically. In Latin America for example it has been observed that in many cases legal frameworks have not kept up with rapid political and economic changes and that significant parts of legal and institutional systems have in practice become obsolete (Azevedo 1998: 260). This decreasing relevance of legal systems led to a prevalence of informal and pragmatic approaches to planning in order to maintain a certain level of control over land use and development. Such informal and pragmatic approaches to planning include legal and non-legal aspects of decision-making, often without a clear boundary between the two. Systems of clientelism and patronage are two examples. Often attributed exclusively to countries in the South, clientelism and patronage are in fact an “[…] ever-present tendency in governance systems. It involves an interactive relationship between politicians and government officials, through the social networks which politicians and officials have.” (Healey 1997: 33).
228) Clientelistic practices are hidden from democratic scrutiny and are labelled corrupt in many cases. In today’s modern states, clientelistic systems do not exist on their own, but are interwoven with formal state institutions, be it democratic or authoritarian (Healey 1997: 228). In the case of this thesis this means that while accepting the importance of formal legal frameworks in structuring planning practice, an analysis of national and local planning practice must also understand the functioning and magnitude of informal structures (i.e. clientelistic relationships) that influence decision-making in planning processes and the wider governance context. It seems further important to understand the often dialectic relationship between formal legislation and informal structures, for example looking at how the informal develops in the absence of the formal or how informal practice can undermine statutory participation.

Structuring factors such as legal frameworks can play an important role in providing spaces of participation in planning processes, as has been discussed above, mentioning how in the 1960s and 1970s in many countries in the North laws were introduced that made public consultation a statutory requirement. The thesis however argues that another key factor is the capacity of different actors in effectively using these spaces. With a focus on civil society organizations, the next sub-section is examining this aspect.

2.3.4 Participation of civil society organizations in decision-making processes

As mentioned above, beside the structuring factors of governance, it is the capacity of civil society to engage with the state that must be examined for a better understanding of participation in a given context. There are many different meanings of civil society in contemporary debates and there is no single definition or use of the concept. One common approach for drawing the boundaries of civil society is to define it in relation with the state. In the following citation, Flyvbjerg (1998: 185) uses this approach, arguing that:

“Most writers on civil society agree, however, that civil society has an institutional core constituted by voluntary associations, outside the sphere of the state and the economy. Such associations range from, for example, churches, cultural associations, sports clubs and debating societies to independent media, academies, groups of concerned citizens, grassroots initiatives and organizations of gender, race and sexuality, all the way to occupational associations, political parties and labour unions.”
Similarly, Azarya (1994: 88; cited in Jenkins 2002: 107) provides a definition of civil society, describing it as “[...] a certain area of society, a public area between household and state, where groups constituted at the level beyond the family interact with each other and with the state to pursue their interests.” It is further argued that the focus should not only be on associational life because this would leave out a great number of people that are organized differently. Rather, relations based on blood and kin should be included into the concept of civil society, especially if applying the concept in contexts such as Africa where primordial society has a very important role (Pearce 2000: 33; Jenkins 2002: 107).

In specific governance contexts, organizations or groups of civil society as defined above can use the spaces of participation provided by political systems and legal frameworks. For civil society however to effectively use these spaces, it must be empowered and aware of its civic rights and duties. It must further, as McCarney et.al. (1995: 124-125) point out, have the “[...] collective capacity to determine the destiny of its local context that the means to influence, in a democratic way, the wider public arena.” The issue of capacity and power of civil society therefore is a key issue, manifested for example through civil society organization’s organizational and technical capacities, as well as general awareness of rights and duties. In the pursuit of their objectives actors from civil society use a range of methods for influencing specific governance processes through the provided spaces of participation. Action research, lobbying, advocacy campaigns, the use of media, petitions, demonstrations, public awareness campaigns, constructive collaboration or participation in public forums, just to name a few, are ways of participation practiced by civil society organizations.

Also common, and with the aim to increase their leverage in influencing decision-making processes, is the creation of social movements constituted by different actors of civil society, these often based in urban areas. Examples of major social movements for example include civil rights and peace movements, women’s liberation, ecological groups or regional separatist movements. Social movements in Latin America for example have played an important role for the democratic opening in several countries (McCarney 1995: 126). Important for the argument in this chapter is the fact that civil society organizations adopt strategies for influencing specific decision-making processes, these
strategies reflecting the spaces provided by the specific governance context and capacities of the organizations involved.

Summarising this section, following key issues stand out:

Governance is a concept that includes actors from state, civil society and the private sector with a focus on relationships between these actors. The chapter further identified two key analytical issues, one with a focus on those factors that structure a governance context and another with a focus on the capacity of civil society to engage in those spaces of participation that are provided by the structuring factors. The concept of governance therefore provides a useful analytical tool for the analysis of a complex context where decision-making processes such as planning are taking place. By analysing such planning context, the concept facilitates the identification of key structural issues that at the same time facilitate as well as constrain certain forms of planning and levels of participation within them. The concept therefore facilitates to understand planning not as a technical process, but as a decision-making process related to the political and social dynamics in the context within which it is taking place.

After this discussion of governance, the following section will now examine the other key concept of this thesis, the one of sustainable development.

2.4 Sustainable urban development

The contemporary concept of sustainable development has its origins in an increased concern about environmental protection during the 1970s. Two especially important events triggered this interest, one being the Club of Rome report, ‘Limits to Growth’ which raised a number of critical questions concerning the then dominant development model of economic growth, arguing that new production techniques must take into account environmental concerns in order to avoid resource depletion (Meadows et.al. 1972; Martinussen 2003: 149). The second important event was the UN Conference on Human Environment held in Stockholm that resulted in the creation of the United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP), also serving as a triggering event for a series of trend setting studies and strategy papers regarding environment and development (Martinussen 2003: 149). Towards the end of the 1980s, the Brundtland Commission’s report ‘Our Common Future’ reinforced the emphasis to consider the relationship between social, economic and environmental aspects of development (WCED 1987). For describing this
approach to development, the term ‘sustainable development’ became increasingly used during this period.

In 1992, a UN conference on sustainable development was held in Rio de Janeiro in Brazil, usually referred to as the ‘Rio Earth Summit’. An important outcome of this conference was a manifesto for sustainable development, known as Agenda 21, which is a comprehensive plan of action to be taken globally, nationally and locally by organizations of the United Nations system, governments, and major groups in every area in which human beings impact on the environment (UN Department for Economic and Social Affairs 2007). Being adopted by more than 178 governments, Agenda 21 has several dimensions, such as securing the improvement in local environmental quality, using a holistic approach by integrating policy in different sectors and securing greater public involvement with the goal of sustainable development. A special emphasis of the programme is on changing the nature of local politics with increased public participation seen as an indicator of success (Rydin 1999: 194). Agenda 21 had a considerable influence on policy and practice in many countries. The UK government for example published several strategy papers following the years after the summit and gradually introduced the concept of sustainable development on the national, regional and local level (Cullingworth and Nadin 2006: 256-261). As a follow-up event in 2002 in Johannesburg, South Africa, the World Summit on Sustainable Development further reinforced the implementation of the goals of Agenda 21 (United Nations 2007).

In contemporary planning theory and development studies, as well as policy and practice, sustainable development has become an ever present, if often insufficiently defined, concept. Especially in policy and practice, it is almost impossible to find documents that do not mention sustainable development (Campbell 2000: 259). Contemporary literature and debate commonly perceive sustainable development comprising three areas, these being social, environmental and economic dimensions of sustainability (Campbell 2003: 436-438). Others add a fourth, political dimension, this including issues of administration and institutional capacity, arguing that sustainability is reflected by the levels an organization is capable to function over the long term, providing services or assuming tasks that lie within its responsibility (Romaya and Rakodi 2002: 4; Edén et.al. 2000: 260-261). Also sometimes placed within the political dimension of sustainable development are issues of procedural equity, participation and public engagement in decision-making
processes, often implicitly assuming that participatory development leads to more sustainable outcomes (Kothari 2002: 139; Rydin 2003: 209).

In this thesis, the concept of sustainable development is used in its more restrictive sense, focusing on social, economic and environmental dimensions, these being discussed in greater detail below. The political dimension with an emphasis on participation, while of key importance for this thesis, has been conceptually discussed in the previous section that examined the concept of governance. Therefore, while not discussed in this chapter, the political dimension of development is discussed in more detail than the social, economic and environmental dimension. This emphasis on the political dimension, through the conceptual discussion of governance, is justified through the research topic of the thesis with its emphasis on participation. The remaining part of this section now focuses exclusively on social, economic and environmental aspects of sustainable development.

Social, economic and environmental aspects of sustainable development are often conceptualised through allocating each dimension or priority to the corners of a triangle (see Figure 1.)

In one corner of the triangle, the social dimension of development looks at social justice, economic opportunity, income equality and the provision of services among different social groups. It also looks at levels of social inclusion and exclusion respectively, the latter being an indicator of unsustainable development.9 The economic dimension of

---

9 While the concept of social exclusion is contested, Beall (2002) identifies three broadly distinct areas:

1. The neo-liberal perspective by which social exclusion is understood as an unfortunate but inevitable side-effect of global economic realignment.

2. A second position that relates but also conceptually distinguishes social exclusion and the concept of poverty, with some proponents linking social exclusion to the deprivation of rights and responsibilities of citizenship as defined in a specific context.

3. A third position that is concerned about social relations which are seen as being embedded in the formal and informal institutions of society.

For the purpose of this thesis, using the concept of social exclusion in the analysis of development dynamics in the case study cities, the second position is interesting through its distinction of social exclusion and poverty as two different, albeit intrinsically related concepts. As Atkinson (1998) argues, many of those who are socially excluded are not necessarily materially deprived and equally, material deprivation is not automatically accompanied by exclusion from full social participation.

Following can be used as a definition of social exclusion in the context of this thesis:
development in another corner is concerned about production, consumption distribution and innovation with the city competing with other cities for markets and new industries. Economic sustainability can however also include aspects such as access to adequate income and a concern about poverty. In the third corner of the triangle, the environmental dimension has a focus on natural resources and waste management, being concerned about possible threats for nature in general (Campbell 2003: 437-438). The environmental dimension includes the so called ‘brown’ agenda, which is related to environmental health such as solid waste removal and access and quality of water, and the ‘green agenda’ which is concerned about ecological resources and ecosystems, such as protection of water sources (Jenkins et.al. 2007: 185-187).

Not presented in Campbell’s triangle but important in the context of this thesis is the argument that all these areas of concern must be analysed against the backdrop of their demographic situation (Drakakis-Smith 1995: 666). Rapid population growth in most cities in the South, this due to natural growth and rural in-migration, provides an extra obstacle to policies and programmes that seek to counter unsustainable development trends such as a lack of service provision or growing unemployment. This demographic aspect therefore is important to consider in the analysis of development trends as done in the case studies of this thesis.

Back to Campbell’s triangle, the illustration identifies three fundamental conflicts that exist among the different dimensions. On one side, the property, or growth-equity conflict

“An individual is socially excluded if (a) he or she is geographically resident in a society, (b) he or she cannot participate in the normal activities of citizens in that society, and (c) he or she would like to so participate, but is prevented from doing so by factors beyond his or her control” (LSE 2007: no page numbering)

While the economic dimension includes concepts such as income distribution, the thesis acknowledges that there are, what has been referred to as ‘social limits to growth’ (Hirsch 1977). Hirsch argues that economic growth is not only restricted by physical limitations (as has been proclaimed by the above mentioned Club of Rome report) but also by the absorptive limits on their use (Hirsch 1977: 3). At the core of the concept lies the understanding that competition among individuals entails hidden costs for others, and therefore, what is possible for the single individual is not possible for all individuals (Hirsch 1977: 6-7). This understanding does not contradict concepts such as social inclusion and social justice, but sheds attention to the argument that complete social equality for all individuals within a society is not possible. Therefore, while not arguing that sustainable development as used in this thesis entails the quest towards complete social equality, it is argued that the search for increased income distribution, social equality and justice is an important aspect of sustainable development.
exists between economic and social priorities and arises by competing claims on property use, including land use. On a second side of the triangle is the conflict about resources, characterised by diverging priorities of the use of natural resources, such as between industry and environmentalists. On the third side is what is called the development conflict which is a result of the challenge of how to increase social equity and simultaneously protect the environment, independent of what form of economic growth is taking place. Ideally, if a planning or development approach manages to equally consider all three priorities, it could be called sustainable and as such placed in the centre of the triangle (Campbell 2003: 438-440).

**Figure 1: The triangle of three dimensions of sustainable development** (Campbell 2003: 437)

![Diagram of the triangle of three dimensions of sustainable development]

The understanding of this potential of conflict between the different dimensions of sustainability is a key problematic of sustainable urban development. In the earlier years of the evolving concept of sustainable development, these conflicts were described as ‘trade-off’ situations with the understanding that fundamental compromises were inevitable (Martinussen 2003: 251). During the early 1990s however, the World Bank and others introduced scenarios of win-win situations, arguing for example that increased production both improves the environment and enhances the capacity for long term development (Martinussen 2003: 152-153). However, beside conflicts that arise due to weak communication and misreading of perceptions, there are also conflicts of fundamental interests which cannot be resolved through a conflict resolution approach.
Importantly, unequal power relations between those with competing interests often result in the stronger party getting its way.  

Arguably, the strengths of the concept of sustainability lie in its unifying power, facilitating a holistic vision of a desired future. The challenge however is to understand what kind of action actually contributes towards reaching this vision. In other words, how can planning and development practice overcome mere lip-service and apply the concept to engage in decision-making processes that create the necessary institutions, mechanisms and initiatives that will contribute to the different dimensions of sustainable development (Campbell 2003: 447-448).

In this thesis, the concept is used to provide an analytical frame for analysing urban development trends of the case study cities. In all four cities, an analysis of demographic trends is made and urban development dynamics are examined in their social, economic and environmental dimensions, analysing and discussing the sustainability of these developments. The concept therefore helps to identify what forms of development the planning process in question, and participation taking place in it, should contribute to. This link between planning process and development outcome is, as the thesis title says, the key research objective of this thesis.

2.5 Conclusions

This chapter developed the argument for the analytical framework of the thesis, to be applied for the analysis of the two case studies in Brazil and South Africa in chapter four and the two case studies in Angola, examined in chapters six and seven.

The chapter first examined approaches to participation in planning theory, development studies and urban development policy. In each of these three fields, the discussion identified certain, sometimes considered dominant, approaches to participation. In the field of planning theory, it is collaborative planning, in the field of development studies the community participation ideology and in the field of development policy, an approach to stakeholder and community participation that in

---

11 In this aspect, the concept of sustainable development shows its intrinsic link with decision-making processes and therefore the concept of governance discussed in the previous section. While the concept of sustainable development provides the necessary space to discuss participation, this has been done within the discussion of governance in the previous section and will not be addressed again here.
many aspects reflect influences of the two above mentioned theoretical approaches. While the discussion acknowledged the importance of these approaches in theory, policy and practice, a more critical analysis also outlined some fundamental shortcomings, of which the following are the most important and transcendent in all three fields investigated.

- First, the critique points at the insufficient recognition of power relations in collaborative planning, the participation ideology and international urban development and planning policy, these often assuming an ‘equally levelled playfield’ where all participants have the same influence on the planning outcomes. In other words, these approaches do not sufficiently take into account the influence of local ‘realpolitik’.

- Second, these approaches often underestimate fundamental differences among participants, differences which can arguably not be resolved by ‘communicative’ conflict resolution techniques or argumentative speech. The discussion showed that this is an especially important aspect in countries in the South, such as in sub-Saharan Africa.

- Third, the discussion pointed out that the promotion of universally applicable participatory approaches can override or substitute local and legitimate decision-making processes, this danger being evident when participatory approaches of countries in the North are promoted through ‘best practice’ policy such as described in international agency policy.

- Fourth, participation in development policy is criticised for being based on assumptions, because as for example in the case of CDSs, there is to date no evaluation undertaken that would confirm the contribution of participatory approaches to sustainable development outcomes.

Recognising these shortcomings, the thesis suggested an alternative approach to the analysis of participatory urban planning, considering planning a decision-making process within a given governance context, acknowledging the uniqueness such contexts in different places at different times and recognising the importance of power relations among participants, shaped through the dynamics of local ‘realpolitik’. For an analysis of a planning process, therefore, a detailed understanding of the governance context is argued to be necessary.
Governance was characterised as a concept with three domains of actors, these being the state, civil society and the private sector. The discussion showed how a given governance context is not only characterised by structuring factors, but also by the capacity of civil society to engage the state through different mechanisms of participation. The chapter therefore argued that the concept of governance provides a useful analytical tool for the analysis of complex contexts where decision-making processes such as planning are taking place. By analysing such planning context, so it argued, the concept facilitates the identification of key structural issues that at the same time facilitate as well as constrain certain forms of planning and levels of participation within them. The concept therefore facilitates an understanding of planning as a decision-making process related to the political and social dynamics in the context within which it is taking place.

While the concept of governance facilitates the analysis of planning process, the concept of sustainable development discussed in the last section suggested a way to identify those development processes and outcomes towards which the planning process is supposed to contribute. To facilitate the use of the concept, it was ‘dismembered’ into three components (social, economic and environmental), each characterised by certain indicators of sustainability which are used in the discussion of urban development dynamics in the case study cities.

Based on the discussion and analysis of this chapter, the thesis therefore suggests the following analytical framework.

The proposed analytical framework starts with an analysis of the development context of the cities where the case studies are located, looking at what forms of urban development are currently taking place and what forms would be desirable and sustainable in the specific context. This underpins research question 2.1: What are contemporary urban development trends and what forms of sustainable urban development would be desirable in the case study city?

The framework then undertakes an analysis of the governance context of the planning case studies, looking at political systems, levels of decentralisation and the participation of civil society in decision-making processes. This underpins research question 2.2: What is the governance context of the case studies and what kind of participatory mechanisms are practiced within this context?
The framework subsequently analyses planning legislation, policy and practice in the case study city, examining the relation of planning processes with the wider governance context. This underpins research question 2.3: What are the legal framework, policy and contemporary practice of urban planning in the case study context?

Finally, the framework undertakes a detailed analysis of the participatory planning case study, underpinning research question 2.4: What kind of participatory planning is the case study presenting and how does it contribute to the desired sustainable development of the city?

The following table provides an overview of the analytical framework and the corresponding sections in the case study chapters.

**Table 1: Analytical framework and corresponding sections and sub-sections in the case study chapters**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analytical Framework (chapter two)</th>
<th>Brazil and South Africa case studies (chapter four)</th>
<th>Angola case studies (chapters six and seven)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Development context</td>
<td>Subsections 1 (in both case studies)</td>
<td>Sections 2 and 3&lt;sup&gt;12&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Governance context</td>
<td>Subsections 2 (in both case studies)</td>
<td>Section 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Planning legislation, policy</td>
<td>Subsections 3 (in both case studies)</td>
<td>Section 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and practice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Participatory planning case</td>
<td>Subsections 4 (in both case studies)</td>
<td>Section 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>study</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>12</sup> The discussion of the development and governance context of the Angolan case studies is further complemented by chapter five which discusses the development and governance context of Angola on the national level.
Chapter 3: Research Approaches and Methods

3.1 Introduction

This chapter explains the research approaches and methods applied in the course of this PhD research. The core method that frames and structures the research is the case study research approach. It is used in this thesis for the analysis of the planning case studies in South Africa, Brazil and Angola, linking the case studies to the countries’ planning system, governance context and also the conceptual and theoretical debate in chapter two. Within the case study approach, several research methods were applied, these being interviewing and participant observation, as well as triangulation of data and information. After the first section of this chapter, which gives an overview of the research process and research timeline, the second section discusses the case study research approach, section three then provides information about the data collection and analysis methods that were applied, and section four examines the importance of ethical issues for this specific research project.

3.2 Research process and timeline

The PhD process initiated with the researcher’s registration as a part-time off-campus PhD student in the Department of Peace Studies at Bradford University in September 2001. From 2001 to 2003, the researcher completed the research method courses required by the University’s Graduate School, including the relevant assignments. The PhD thesis title conceived at this stage of the research was ‘Measuring the peace-building impact of community based peace initiatives on violence causing structures.’ In line with this research topic, the researcher initiated a literature review about governance in Angola and the role of civil society and community based initiatives in the peace-building process, taking into account that the armed conflict in Angola was still ongoing at the time of initiating the PhD. During the same period, the researcher was already working as an employee for the Angola based international NGO Development Workshop (DW) in the function of a technical advisor for peace-building and research. With the end of the

---

13 The researcher previously graduated from the same department’s Conflict Resolution Masters programme in the year 2000.
war in Angola in 2002, DW’s research focus started to shift towards peri-urban\textsuperscript{14} land issues, this having become a key development issue in the context of post-war reconstruction. In partnership with Centre for Environment and Human Settlements (CEHS) at Heriot-Watt University in Edinburgh, Scotland, DW at the time initiated a major research programme on peri-urban land, in which the researcher was actively involved from the beginning, leading several of the field research components.\textsuperscript{15} Given this changing development context in Angola, also reflected in the new research focus through employment, the researcher decided to change thesis topic and to change University. Rather than focusing on civil society’s contribution to peace-building, the new research topic would focus on civil society’s participation in urban planning as a potential way to contribute to more sustainable urban development in Angola, and through this to improved governance and reduced social conflict.

In January 2004 therefore, the researcher officially transferred from the Department of Peace Studies at Bradford University to the School of the Built Environment at Heriot-Watt University in Edinburgh, now under the supervision of Professor Paul Jenkins, director of CEHS. Most of 2004 was spent conducting a literature review on participatory planning and relevant international urban development/planning experiences. In 2005, the researcher initiated a more specific literature review and field research on urban development, governance and planning context in Luanda, the capital of Angola, and the participatory planning case study in Sambizanga in that city. During this year, the researcher became re-deployed as the Manager of DW’s Monitoring and Research Unit.

\textsuperscript{14} While there is a wide literature around defining the term ‘peri-urban’ (Simon et.al.2004; McGregor et.al. 2006; Allan et.al. 2006), there is to date no accepted definition. The literature generally however acknowledges that peri-urban areas are an extension of the city with specific physical, social, economic and environmental features. For the purpose of this thesis, peri-urban areas are defined as areas with following main characteristics (MINUA 2002):
\begin{itemize}
  \item Absence of basic service provision such as piped water, sanitation and solid waste removal;
  \item Proliferation of unplanned development of housing and infrastructure such as roads.
\end{itemize}
However, even when using this rather simple definition of the peri-urban, the thesis acknowledges that in many cases it is not possible to establish the clear limits between the urban and the peri-urban and between the rural and the peri-urban.

\textsuperscript{15} This research programme led to the publication of a book published in English and Portuguese (DW and CEHS 2005), with a focus on urban land reform in the post-war period in Angola. The research looked at some aspects of urban planning in Angola, but the research focus was much broader, without any in-depth analysis of urban planning specifically. Therefore, while building on this research undertaken by CEHS and DW, this thesis covers new ground that has not been addressed by previous research.
While some initial research started in Huambo in 2005, most of the literature review and field research was undertaken during the first six months of 2006, when the researcher moved to part-time employment with DW as a technical advisor for urban development projects in Huambo, a position held until the time of writing, permitting more time to be devoted to completing and writing up the thesis research. The following Table summarises the research process.

Table 2: Research process and time table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>07</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Six month periods</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Skills Modules (Bradford)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature review (Bradford)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature review (Heriot-Watt)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field research in Luanda</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field research in Huambo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing up of Thesis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year of study</td>
<td>Yr 1</td>
<td>Yr 2</td>
<td>Yr 3</td>
<td>Yr 4</td>
<td>Yr 5</td>
<td>Yr6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.3 Case study research

3.3.1 Characteristics of case study research

Case study research has experienced an increased popularity since the late 1970s, which can partly be attributed to the wider use of qualitative research methods (Bryman 1989: 177). Case study research can be described as a specific form of social research that contrasts with two other influential forms, these being social surveys and experimental research (Gomm et.al. 2000: 2). One important characteristic of case study research is the

---

16 As a part-time off-campus student, the researcher was based in Angola most of the time, but came for two to three week periods to Heriot-Watt University on five occasions for intensive supervision. Additionally, the researcher’s supervisor visited Angola several times, these visits having been used for discussing issues related to the PhD research.
relatively low number of cases investigated and yet the high amount of information collected for each case. In this aspect case study research differs from social surveys that tend to collect relatively little information about many cases. In contrast to experimental research, where the researcher has direct control over variables and creates the cases investigated, case study research chooses its cases out of naturally occurring social relations (Gomm et.al. 2000: 3).

Case study research can be considered as a way that research is structured or approached and within which a full range of research methods can and should be applied (Robertson and Dearling 2004: 163-5; Bryman 1989: 172). In this view, case study research can be characterised as a different research paradigm, showing a very specific way how social phenomena should be investigated (Gomm et.al. 2000: 5).

A first important point of clarification in the discussion is the definition of 'case'. A case can be a person, group, organization, institution or geographic area. It can also be an event, activity or a specific process (Robertson and Dearling 2004: 166-167; Bryman 1989: 171). Further, case study can refer to more than one case, when two or more units of analysis are researched. The study of two or more cases has the advantage that by applying comparative analysis it can enhance generalisability of the research conclusions.17

Inherent to the process of generalisation of research conclusions are aspects that are often considered as the main drawback of case study research, questioning how findings from singular case studies can be generalised to the general social environment and be applicable to other cases in the same or different environments (Bryman 1989: 172; Gomm et.al. 2000: 5). There is, however, a growing recognition that the accusations of limited generalisability are not always justified. Mitchell (2000: 183) argues that most of the confusion:

“[...] has arisen because of a failure to appreciate that the rationale of extrapolation from a statistical sample to a parent universe involves two very different and even unconnected inferential processes - that of statistical inference, which makes a statement about the confidence we may have that the surface relationships observed in our sample will in fact occur in the parent population,

17 This point will be discussed in greater detail below.
and that of logical or scientific inference, which makes a statement about the confidence we may have that the theoretically necessary or logical connection among the features observed in the sample pertain also to the parent population.”

It is rather obvious that a single case cannot statistically represent similar cases in the same or other environments, although the use of multiple case studies can mitigate this issue to a certain degree. More importantly however, as Mitchell mentions above, is the fact that case studies do not pretend to achieve statistical inference, but theoretical or logical inference, directly linking the results of case study research to theoretical debate. Therefore, case studies can, through their in-depth investigations, provide new insights and give valuable contributions to the generation of theory, which then can be tested with other case studies in the same or different environments to further enhance generalisability of findings. The simultaneous implementation of multiple case studies allows the testing of generated theory through a comparative analysis, which is a commonly applied use of case studies (Robertson and Dearling 2004: 167). Using comparative analysis, there is however the risk of a simplistic approach which ignores the way that cultural and social structures, as well as national policies and institutions shape and influence the case or phenomenon under investigation. Souza (2003: 206) very explicitly points out that:

“No country should merely try to ‘imitate’ successful experiences developed in another country, because the institutional, cultural and economic differences between countries (as well as between regions and cities within a single country) can be so significant that such an import can turn into a failure or even be catastrophic.”

Contextual or external factors therefore always influence the case under investigation, but can only be included in the theoretical explanation by their incorporation into the case as one of the essential and necessary characteristics (Mitchell 2000: 181). It is further important to grasp the different dimensions of context, this including the small, local context as well as the larger, international context in which the investigated phenomenon takes place (Flyvbjerg 2004: 297-8). This issue is clearly reflected in the analytical framework of the thesis with its explicit emphasis on contextual variables by looking at

---

18 Inference can be described as a mode of reasoning in which detailed data or events are used to develop a claim which is a generalisation beyond that data actually recorded (Olson 2001: 12).
planning as a decision-making process embedded in and shaped by a specific governance context.

3.3.2 Selection of case studies for this research

This thesis has selected several case studies from three countries, these being Brazil, South Africa and Angola.

**Brazil** and **South Africa** were chosen because they both have relatively extensive experience with participatory urban planning. Also, these countries do show more similar (albeit still very different) governance characteristics to Angola than for example European and North American countries. This closer similarity of context arguably facilitates the comparative analysis of the case studies between South Africa, Brazil and Angola. Brazil today is among the best known and documented promoters of participatory urban governance through participatory budgeting, and it has been argued that African states should learn from such experiences (McAuslan 1998: 45). Brazil and Angola further share the same national language (Portuguese), as well as similar legal and administrative bases, and over the last years have increasingly strengthened their social, political and economic ties. South Africa, a nearby neighbour to Angola, since its transition to democracy in 1992, has undertaken a difficult but, judged by many, successful continuing political, social and economic transition, with levels of democracy and participation quite unique in the African continent. It is without doubt that South Africa, with all its shortcomings, can serve as an example of participatory governance and democracy for many other African nations.

**Angola** has been chosen because of the author’s personal interest connected to his employment and residence in the country since 2001. Independent from this however, the country also offers a very interesting ground of investigation in terms of urban development and planning. A former Portuguese colony until 1975, Angola only emerged from a destructive post-Independence civil war in 2002, leaving most of its infrastructure damaged and destroyed. In terms of urbanisation and urban planning, Angola provides an extreme context in many aspects. The cities are undergoing a period of extremely rapid urban expansion, in most cases without the provision of basic social and technical infrastructures. The urban planning system is very weak, legally, administratively and technically, and has very little influence on urban development, while informal and elite dominated ad-hoc planning mechanisms are dominating. Some initial forms of
participatory governance and also planning however are emerging in parallel with government institutional revisions and a process of decentralisation, and as such are of interest to study as an extreme case.

In the three countries, the following four planning case studies were selected, drawing on available literature for the first two and literature and fieldwork for the two Angolan cases:

- Programme *Bairro Legal* ('nice neighbourhood') in São Paulo, Brazil
- City Development Strategy of Johannesburg, South Africa
- Participatory municipal planning in Sambizanga, Luanda, Angola
- Participatory lay-out planning and slum-upgrading in Bairro Fátima in Huambo, Angola

In Brazil and South Africa, the two case studies have been identified through the literature of the Cities Alliance, as (as noted above) this is an influential development organization with fairly representative approaches to participatory urban development. In Brazil, the rationale for choosing the case of a slum-upgrading programme in São Paulo, called *Bairro Legal* was based on the programme's claimed success in applying a participatory approach to planning in several aspects. The *Bairro Legal* programme was launched in 2001 by the Municipal Housing and Urban Development Department (SEHAB) and the São Paulo Municipal Administration, with the main aim of the programme being to turn slum areas into neighbourhoods through a combination of physical upgrading, social inclusion and land tenure regularisation (Cities Alliance 2004).

In South Africa, the chosen case was that of the elaboration of the Johannesburg City Development Strategy, *Jo’burg 2030*. Also claimed as successful by Cities Alliance literature, the rationale for choosing this case study was based on providing an example of participation in a strategic planning process, opposed to participation in a local planning process as in the case of the *Bairro Legal* programme above. The Johannesburg City Development Strategy process was initiated by the Greater Johannesburg Metropolitan Council in 1999.

The two case studies were also chosen by the fact that academic literature has also covered these planning processes to some extent. Many cases of participatory urban
planning with international agency involvement are only documented by those institutions involved, such as for example the Cities Alliance. A discussion relying on only these sources would most probably be biased and therefore it seemed necessary to select cases with a variety of sources of information in order to achieve a balance discussion and analysis.

The **participatory municipal planning in Sambizanga**, Luanda, the capital of Angola, was chosen as an example of an attempt to introduce participatory urban governance and planning mechanisms on the municipal level in Angola in the current context of increased decentralisation in the country. The project has been implemented by the Municipality of Sambizanga in partnership with the international agency Development Workshop in 2005.

The **Bairro Fátima participatory planning case study** in Huambo, a secondary city in central Angola, was identified as a case of local participatory lay-out planning and slum-upgrading. The case study, implemented in 2006, was chosen for being the only contemporary participatory planning case study in Huambo, providing an interesting example of participation in a smaller scale planning process in a secondary city when compared to the Sambizanga case in the capital.

The Angolan case studies were further chosen based on the fact that the author was an ‘insider’ to both planning processes, with all the associated advantages in terms of access to information, as otherwise this was unlikely to be available through any other process.\(^\text{19}\) Given the still very challenging research environment in the post-war context in Angola, (in terms of logistics, related to lack of infrastructure and in terms of access to information, related to a lack of ‘public’ information in general) insider access actually was quite crucial for getting access to the level of information necessary to complete a PhD.

### 3.4 Data collection and analytical research methods

Within the case study approach, a range of specific data collection and analytical research methods were applied, the most important being:

\(^\text{19}\) The ‘insider’ social research approach is discussed in greater detail below, also looking at how the author dealt with the risk of bias in information collection and analysis.
3.4.1 Literature review

An initial literature review was conducted with the objective to define the area of investigation and to get a broad overview of the literature published in the fields of urban development, urban planning and participation. Subsequently, a more in-depth literature review was conducted with a specific focus on planning theory and development studies. This review provided the basis for chapter two and consequently, the analytical framework. From the early stage of the research process, literature about the three countries of the case studies was accumulated. For the development and governance context and urban planning systems of Brazil and South Africa, sufficient documentation was found in planning and development literature, such as journals and books. For the in-depth participatory planning case studies in both countries, project documentation as well as some academic literature was available. In the case of Angola however, there is a scarcity of written documentation. One of the few libraries that contains some substantial information about urban development and planning in Angola is located in the offices of the NGO Development Workshop in Luanda. It contains many un-published documents that have been written about the topic since the 1980s, mostly mission and project reports, research papers, surveys and evaluations. This library was extensively consulted. For the Sambizanga case study in Luanda, the author had access to all project documents, this being complemented by informal and semi-structured interviews as discussed below. For the Bairro Fátima case study most information was gathered through other research methods than the literature review, this also being discussed in the following subsections.

3.4.2 Interviewing

There are many different categories of interviewing, including informal conversations, open ended interviews, structured interviews, semi-structured interviews, unstructured interviews, ethnographic interviewing, elite interviewing or focus group interviewing.
Informal interviews allow the researcher to have an open conversation with the participant. In fact, the participant may be left with the impression that the interview was simply an interesting and stimulating conversation (Robertson and Dearling 2004: 121). The interviewer does not have any sequence of questions that she or he follows, but having the key research question in mind, tries to elicit information from the participant by approaching the topic from different directions. Informal interviews cannot be considered an ‘easy’ or ‘soft’ option for interviewing. In fact, this method requires considerable skills and understanding of the subject matter (Robertson and Dearling 2004: 121). The method is often used together with participant observation, where the researcher can respond to interview opportunities during fieldwork. The technique provides a very flexible method to gather a range of information from all kinds of research participants in different, often informal settings. However, informal interviews are arguably more open to bias and the data generated is in most cases completely unstructured which can make it difficult to analyse. To reduce bias, as with other forms of interviewing, information generated should be triangulated with the information gathered by other research methods. In this research, informal interviews were used for the case studies in Luanda and in Huambo.\textsuperscript{20}

Semi-structured interviews have the advantage that they make the analysis of data more manageable than with open interviews but are also more open and flexible than questionnaires. Doing semi-structured interviews, the researcher follows-up some pre-defined key questions but without a fixed sequence and with the wording adapted to the interviewee and the interviewer further having the flexibility to follow up issues that arise during the conversation (Walliman 2005: 284-286). As with unstructured interviews, there needs to be a certain level of cooperation and sometimes also trust between interviewer and participant, otherwise the participant might not be willing to share his/her information and point of views. Interviews essentially aim to provide information about the participant’s perspective of the situation. If the conceptual framework of a research requires more than that, information from interviews should be triangulated with

\textsuperscript{20} For list of people with whom were made interviews (informal, semi-structured, focus groups) in the course of the research, please see Appendix 1.
information gathered through other research methods (Marshall and Rossman 1999: 110). In this research, semi-structured interviews were used in the case studies in Luanda and in Huambo.

A **focus group** is a selection of people who are invited to respond to the researcher’s questions and usually discuss a subject collectively. They may comprise people who are a cross-section of the population, or they may be homogeneous. The number involved usually is relatively small, ranging from 6-12 people (Walliman 2005: 123). Focus group interviews are very useful for some purposes as they can provide more and richer information than for example semi-structured interviews, given the participation of more than one interviewee. Drawbacks of this method are problems caused by group dynamics, where dominant individuals can obliterate alternative points of view. This risk can be countered by creating homogeneous groups, for example only women, or only youngsters. However, there is still the risk that opinions are controlled by locally dominating individuals, such as political party members or economically powerful individuals. This risk then can be minimised by the researcher’s knowledge about the participants and the local political and social context. Due to these risks, it is therefore sometimes argued that the results of these groups should only be treated as material for reflection and further investigation (Arksey and Knight 1999: 77-78). Focus groups are also used to validate research results, for example in collaborative analysis exercises, or for triangulating data with other interview methods (Arksey and Knight 1999: 77-78). In this research, one focus group interview was undertaken in the Bairro Fátima case study. Those who participated in the different group interviews were all local residents directly involved in the planning process.

### 3.4.3 Participant observation and ‘insider’ accounts

Participant observation has its origins in social anthropology and is often described as being an ethnographic research method (Foster 1996). By some of its proponents, participant observation is claimed to be “the most effective way, if not the only way, of investigating social organization.” (Ackroyd and Hughes 1981: 104) These proponents consider life being constructed through meanings that cannot be understood through deterministic laws, but must be studied through interpretation. And this process of studying and interpretation is only possible when the researcher is participating in the social phenomenon that she or he is investigating (Ackroyd and Hughes 1981: 104). This implies that researchers often spend a considerable length of time within a social setting
they want to investigate. Therefore, the meaning of participation is from the point of view from the researcher, participating in the life of the studied ‘subjects’. The researcher observes, listens, takes part in conversations and asks questions. In short, the researcher tries to obtain the ‘insider’s’ view of the social group (Ackroyd and Hughes 1981: 99, 108). In this PhD research, participant observation as a research method was not used in its ‘pure’ form as often applied in ethnography, implying immersion with the social organization that is studied. However, elements of participatory observation were used especially in the Bairro Fátima case study in Huambo, where the author, as a participant in the planning process, had the opportunity to observe events related to the planning process and context during a prolonged period of time.

Similarly, and in some aspects synonymous to participant-observation used in anthropology and other social science fields, research into organizations often uses a method called ‘insider’ research. This method has become increasingly popular over the last decades with a range of research about organizations, such as examining industrial enterprises, construction projects, or research on managers, studies on organizational culture and the examination of power in organizations (Bryman 1988). Using this research method the researcher, as a participant-observer, studies a phenomenon from within an organization, usually in agreement with the organization’s leadership. One of the main advantages of this social research method is its potential to gain access to information that would not be available to ‘outside’ researchers. In the course of this PhD research, this method has been applied in the Sambizanga and Bairro Fátima case studies in Luanda and Huambo.

In the Sambizanga case, the author at the time was employed as the Manager of DW’s Monitoring and Research Unit. The manager’s tasks included providing monitoring and evaluation assistance to DW’s Sambizanga project implementation team, this having given the researcher facilitated access to all project documents and personal contact with the team members. In the case of the Bairro Fátima case study (which took place a year later), the author was employed as a technical advisor to the planning process. The author’s participant status allowed a much wider access to information about the planning process, for example participating in all meetings with the project partners, these being meetings on the community level, with local authorities and the relevant government institutions. These meetings provided a wealth of information, not only about the Bairro Fátima project, but also about other urban development issues and processes that were
discussed on many occasions. In both case studies, it would have been extremely difficult if not impossible for an ‘outside’ researcher to have access to this sort of information. The ‘insider’ research approach used by the researcher therefore resulted in a significantly higher level of access to information. On the other hand, researchers that operate from an ‘insider’ position are especially subjected to bias in data collection and interpretation. This issue will be discussed in the last section of this chapter.

3.4.4 Triangulation of data and information

One important method for data verification during the process of interpretation is the triangulation of information. Burns (2000: 419) defines triangulation as “[…] the use of two or more methods of data collection in the study of some aspect of human behaviour.” Triangular techniques tempt to explain more fully the complexity of a phenomenon by studying it from more than one standpoint and using a variety of methods, even combining qualitative and quantitative methods in some cases. Burns (2000) argues that exclusive reliance on one method may bias or distort the researcher’s picture of the particular aspect of reality that is being investigated.

However, triangulation of methods and information is not unproblematic. Silverman (2000: 98-99) points out that:

“[...] mapping one set of data upon another is a more or less complicated task depending on your analytic framework. In particular, if you treat social reality as constructed in different ways, in different contexts, then you cannot appeal to a single phenomenon which all your data apparently represents.”

Therefore, there should not exist a naïve or overly optimistic assumption that the joining of data from different sources will automatically produce a more complete picture of reality (Silverman 2000: 99).

Taking into account these limitations, triangulation nevertheless has been a useful method of analysis for this PhD research with the objective to validate information that has been gathered. In an environment where ‘public’ information is very scarce (Huambo for example has no newspaper and only one state owned radio broadcaster), information gathered in the research process must constantly be validated by different sources, often using different research methods. The most effective research method for validating
information in this PhD research has been the informal interview. As the need for validation was constant, the informal interview provided a flexible enough tool for this purpose.

3.5 Ethics and research

3.5.1 Ethic principles

It is argued that all social research needs to take into account the ethical dimension. Bulmer (2001: 45) for example suggest to understand ethics in research as:

“[…] a matter of principled sensitivity to the rights of others. Being ethical limits the choices we can make in the pursuit of truth. Ethics say that while truth is good, respect for human dignity is better, even if, in the extreme case, the respect of human dignity leaves one ignorant of human nature.”

For the operationalisation of this broad statement, Bulmer (2001: 46-53) suggests, among others, following ethical principles:

- Informed Consent;
- No harm to subjects and researchers;
- No deceit and lying in the course of research;
- Attending to the consequences of publication.

In order to respect informed consent in the course of this PhD research, all interviewees that participated in semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions have been informed about the researcher’s intention to use interview data and information for this thesis. Many of the informal interviews were also held with interviewees that knew about the author’s position as a PhD researcher. There were however some informal conversations that were initially held in the author’s role as a part-time employee of the NGO Development Workshop and the information gathered was only considered useful for the research at a later stage. In these cases, the interviewees were not aware at the time of interview of the researcher’s use of the gathered information.

As the research topic touches on rather sensitive political issues such as governance in Angola, the principle of avoiding harm to subjects and researchers was treated with
special attention. Some of the interviews for example raised awareness of unfulfilled rights (e.g. land rights) and unjust power relationships in the local governance context. The researcher was very careful not to stir up existing frustrations or to use negative language against certain institutions or individuals. It is however difficult to judge the impact of such involuntary awareness-raising, which can be considered a secondary effect of interviewing. Given that in a context like in Angola it can be rather difficult to judge social and political dynamics, the author was always accompanied by an Angolan colleague when doing community based research, partly for assisting the author in assessing local dynamics and partly to help to create conducive environments for interviews. All interviews were otherwise anonymous to protect the identity of the interviewees and interview transcriptions are without names of the interviewees. This precaution was taken because files, floppy discs and computers can be stolen or confiscated which then may harm certain interviewees.

As mentioned under the principle of ‘informed consent’, interviewees were generally well informed about the research objectives. Other forms of deceit and lying that have been avoided by this PhD research are the knowing distortion of data and results.

The principle of attending to the consequences of publication implies a reflection of the results of the research, their publication and who will have access to this publication. Some of the results of this research include criticism of certain institutions involved in planning in Angola, observations that might not be welcome by these institutions. Every effort however has been made to maintain a grounded and constructive critique and guard the confidentiality of interviewees. It is assumed that the thesis will be of interest to only a relatively narrow academic audience, at least in its initial published form, but giving its detailed account of planning and urban development in Angola, there is a possibility that it will be read by some development practitioners or government officials in Angola. On the other hand, some of the findings of the research are being directly fed into the planning policy and practice of the NGO Development Workshop, the author’s employer. Development Workshop is significantly scaling-up its peri-urban planning and development interventions to three other locations in Huambo city and two more provinces in Angola. Through the ongoing contribution of the PhD research to this process, the results of this thesis are thus seen as ‘giving something back’ to the
communities investigated and other peri-urban communities where project activities are being implemented.\textsuperscript{21}

3.5.2 Values and objectivity in data interpretation

Values and objectivity in data interpretation could arguably be discussed as a sub-section of data analysis methods, but in this thesis shall be considered part of the ethical dimension of social research.

Scientific objectivity is very difficult to obtain, arguably even impossible taking into account that the researcher is automatically biased through her or his position in terms of gender, race, age, education and social status. One important aspect is therefore for the researcher to be aware of her or his position and values, and this can be undertaken in several aspects.

First, research should have a clear \textit{theoretical perspective} in which the researcher uncovers existing assumptions and allows the reader to follow and understand the reasoning of the researcher (Walliman 2005: 339-340). Theoretical allegations should be exposed, discussed and un-packed in as much detail as possible. In this PhD research, this process has been undertaken in chapter two in the discussion leading towards the analytical framework.

Second, any aspect that could influence the \textit{impartiality} of the researcher, such as for example funding sources, should be mentioned. In this PhD research, the most important aspect in this regard has been the author's double role as an NGO employee and PhD researcher in the Angolan case studies. The inherent risk in such situation is the identification of the researcher with either the organization or the population, reducing her or his ability for critical and impartial analysis. This however does not necessarily take place as long as the researcher is explicitly aware of this risk and takes active steps to avoid bias. One important active step to avoid bias is rigorous theoretical inference in the case study analysis, this having been applied in the case of this thesis. By this consciousness and taking of active steps to avoid bias, the researcher can retain the

\textsuperscript{21} As this research did feed into urban planning and development activities of DW's programs, the research was arguably using some elements of an 'action research' approach, such an approach being characterised that it not only focuses on the contribution to knowledge but also solving problems in particular empirical domains (Bryman 1989: 178).
academic freedom to problematise and be critical of what she or he sees (Flyvbjerg 2004: 291). Third, the researcher can make a statement about values that influence her or his interpretation and analysis. The discussion of values often exposes the research to questions of fundamentalism versus relativism, that is, in Flyvbjerg’s (2004: 291) words “[…] the view that there are central values that can be rationally and universally grounded, versus the view that one set of values is as good as another.” He suggests however to overcome this opposition, moving towards ‘situational ethics’ that neither has aspects of fundamentalism nor relativism. ‘Situational ethics’ means that the researcher bases values on the social and historic context within which the investigated phenomenon is situated (Flyvbjerg 2004: 291). Through this process, the researcher recognises the capacity of a society to define its own values, and simultaneously acknowledges the limitations of her or his values which are based on personal choice and social and cultural background. This PhD research uses the approach of situational ethics building on the detailed discussion of development and governance contexts in the three countries examined.
Chapter 4: International Experiences in Participatory Urban Planning

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents two case studies of participatory urban planning led by local authorities and with some technical support by the Cities Alliance. The first case study is about a participatory slum-upgrading process, led by the Municipal Secretariat of Housing and Urban Development (SEHAB) in São Paulo, Brazil. The second case study provides an example of a city development strategy process, implemented by the Metropolitan Government of Johannesburg, South Africa. As discussed in chapter three, the two countries Brazil and South Africa were identified as countries in the South with a rather broad but comparable experience in participatory planning. Similarly, the two specific planning case studies were chosen because in planning and development literature they are both referred to as successful examples of slum-upgrading and strategic planning respectively, the cases therefore serving their purpose of providing examples of participatory planning to be used in a comparative analysis with the Angola case studies later in the thesis.

Both case studies are examined following the analytical framework presented in the conclusions of chapter two, responding to following research questions:

2.1 What are contemporary urban development trends and what forms of sustainable urban development would be desirable in the case study city?
2.2 What is the governance context of the case studies and what kind of participatory mechanisms are practiced within this context?
2.3 What are the legal framework, policy and contemporary practice of urban planning in the case study context?
2.4 What kind of participatory planning is the case study presenting and how does it contribute to the desired sustainable development of the city?

Subsection one of each case study responds to research question 2.1, looking at urban development trends on the national levels, as well as on the level of the city where the case study is located. Responding to research question 2.2, subsection two of both case studies examines the governance contexts, again first on the national level and then on the
city level where the planning processes are taking place. The discussion in subsection three is then looking at the legal context that frames and guides urban planning at the national and local level, thereby responding to research question 2.3. Subsection four finally, responding to research question 2.4, focuses on the participatory planning case studies, discussing the characteristics of the planning process.

4.2 Case study 1: Bairro Legal programme in São Paulo, Brazil

4.2.1 Historic overview and issues of sustainable urban development

Brazil is the biggest and most populous country in Latin America, covering an area of 8.55 million km² with a population of more than 180 million. The recent history of Brazil is politically turbulent. A former Portuguese colony, Brazil became independent in 1822. The early 20th century was marked by periods of military and democratic governments, with the latest military government ruling from 1964 to 1985 before civilian rule resumed (Economist 2006). Industrialisation and urbanisation in Brazil started in the 1930s when less than 30 per cent of the population lived in urban areas (Fernandes and Rolnik 1998: 140). Until the 1970s, urban populations grew mainly in a few major cities. This trend changed in the 1980s with increased growth of medium-sized cities. Structural adjustment programmes and forced removals from rural land throughout the 1980s also contributed to this swelling of the cities (Baiocchi 2003: 5). Today, approximately 80 per cent of the Brazilian population, some 150 million, live in urban centres and of these some 40 per cent are in metropolitan areas. The urban population is still growing fast with peripheral growth being a very common phenomenon in Brazil’s cities (Cities Alliance 2004: 10).

The arguably most significant aspect of un-sustainable development in Brazilian cities is their high levels of poverty. It is estimated that around 60 per cent of the urban population live in informal settlements, called favelas, where there is a lack of infrastructure such as access to health, education, water, drainage, open spaces and public transport (Fernandes and Rolnik 1998: 151). Despite the fact that in favelas there are high levels of poverty of a large part of the urban population, they do have an important political role, especially since the 1970s with the increased leverage of social movements, mass media and the expanding state bureaucracy (Banck and Doimo 1989: 130). In spite of government efforts to contain the favelas, it has been estimated that by 2002 for example, annually some 600,000 families in Brazil’s cities had no choice but to enter the informal housing sector (Cities Alliance 2004: 10), this being an indicator of social exclusion that is accompanied by the informality of housing.
São Paulo is the largest metropolitan area in Brazil with a contemporary population of almost 18 million inhabitants (Budds et. al. 2005: 91). Located on the São Paulo Plateau and having been founded as a Jesuit Village in 1554, it became a wealthy coffee capital in the 19th century before experiencing rapid urbanisation and industrialisation from the 1950s onwards. São Paulo is no exception in relation to national dynamics of urbanisation, showing rapid urban growth at the city’s periphery. Especially from the 1950s onwards the city’s favelas began to expand, mainly due to in-migration from other Brazilian States. The expansion was accompanied by rapid population growth and the existing urban infrastructures and services were not able to cope (Budds et.al. 2005: 89). Favelas therefore are a relatively new phenomenon in São Paulo, being less than 50 years old (Fix et.al. 2002: 9). Still in the 1980s, only some 5.2 per cent lived in these

22 Source: http://www.infoplease.com/atlas/country/brazil.htm

23 The municipality of São Paulo has a population of approximately 10 million inhabitants (Budds et.al. 2005: 91)
settlements, but then the proportion exploded to 19.8 per cent in 1993 (Fix et.al. 2002: 3). The population of these settlements is still rising, at a rate of 2.9 per cent from 1991 to 2000, compared with 0.9 per cent of the city as a whole (Budds et.al. 2005: 89).

The favelas however are only one form of substandard settlement in São Paulo. Overall, four main types of such settlements can be identified, with a total population of more than 3 million inhabitants (Budds et.al. 2005: 90-95):

- **Squatter settlements** (favelas) which result from the illegal occupation of public or private land (approximately 1,160,000 inhabitants);
- **Illegal sub-divisions** (lotes irregulares) which result from the informal and unofficial sale of plots of private land which can be the land owner or not (approximately 1,475,000 inhabitants);
- **Public housing estates** which are large complexes of multi-storey apartment blocks which were built from the 1960s to the 1980s at the periphery of the city, usually without any provision of health and education infrastructures (approximately 586,000 inhabitants);
- **Cortiços** (tenement slum) which consist of run-down and abandoned inner-city buildings where poor families are renting informally for high prices in cramped and unhealthy conditions (approximately 107,000 inhabitants).

Contemporary migration patterns in the urban area are from the centre to the periphery. The city’s downtown experienced a negative growth rate during the periods 1981/1990 and 1991/2000 whereas in the peripheral districts, the population increased. The city therefore is under-occupied in the best equipped (central) areas and over-occupied in the least equipped (peripheral) areas (Cities Alliance 2004: 24). This urban development pattern of social segregation and growing favelas is an example of an unsustainable development trend in the social dimension as referred to in Campbell’s triangle.

São Paulo is Brazil’s main economic and financial hub, although it has lost its dominant character as a manufacturing city with only 18 per cent of the economically active population still being employed by this sector (Fix et.al. 2002: 7). The shift away from manufacturing has been accompanied by an increase of the service sector linked to the global economy. On the other hand, there has also been an increase in the informal economic sector and unemployment which stood at 17.9 per cent in 1999 (Fix et.al. 2002:
7). In its economic dimension therefore, aspects of economic exclusion manifested through high unemployment and the thriving informal sector, contradict with economic growth and the new position of São Paulo in the global economy.

The rapid and uncontrolled expansion of informal settlements also had serious environmental implications, especially in Guarapiranga, the city’s water catchment area. The lack of sanitation in the settlements contributed to increased water pollution, becoming such a serious problem in the late 1980s that the help of the World Bank was sought in order to initiate an upgrading and cleanup programme (Imparato and Ruster 2003: 329).

Overall, development trends in their social, economic and environmental dimensions show signs of unsustainable development, manifested through social exclusion, unemployment and damage to the environment related to urban expansion. The next section however shows that recent political events in Brazil brought into effect important policies and programmes that seek to counter these unsustainable development trends.

4.2.2 The governance context

Contemporary Brazil is a federal republic with 26 states and the capital district of Brasilia. The president is elected for terms of four years and he chooses a cabinet that he heads. The legislative is the bicameral National Congress, consisting of the 81-seat Senate (the upper house), with representatives of 26 states, plus the federal district of Brasilia, and the 513-member directly elected Chamber of Deputies (the lower house). Each of the 26 states and the district of Brasilia has its own legislature and administration. Presidential, congressional and state elections are also held every four years, with the most recent ones held in October 2006. Municipal elections are held every four years, with next ones due in October 2008.

Through the approval of the 1988 constitution (that followed the reconstitution of democratic government in 1985) a formal process of decentralisation of government has taken place. This process had fundamental influence on the role of municipalities in the

---

24 In the case of Brazil, decentralisation could be characterised by what has been described as ‘devolution’ in chapter two. The thesis however maintains the term ‘decentralisation’ as this is the one used in the literature consulted for this chapter.
local governance context, introducing more political and fiscal autonomy for local governments, having provided an effective devolution of power from the central to the municipal level. The decentralisation process was further accompanied by the development of a legal framework for citizen participation in social programmes (Baiocchi 2003: 9), introducing increased spaces for participation in the Brazilian governance context.

Looking at the capacity of civil society organizations in filling these spaces as conceptually discussed in chapter two, it can be noted that Brazilian civil society indeed does play an important role. Social movements started in Brazil in the 1970s and expanded rapidly in urban and rural areas (Banck and Goimo 1989: 125). In some areas, these social movements succeeded in actively engaging local authorities and introducing more participative ways of governance. While these experiences were not long lasting, they became well-known examples for urban activists in the 1980s (Baiocchi 2003: 7-8). Since the beginning, social movements were not isolated from regional or national networks and organizations, such as the Catholic Church, or professional associations like the Brazilian Lawyers Association, Engineers Council and the Journalist Syndicate. During the military regime, the church was almost the only organization that could openly challenge the state and many priests, nuns, and church activists joined the ‘Workers Party’ (Partido de Trabalhadores - PT) after its foundation in 198025 (Banck and Goimo 1989: 131-132).

Since then, the PT became know as the principal proponent of participatory governance in Brazil. Internally it practices a ‘broad church’ policy position emphasising internal democracy and openness, rejecting democratic centralism and vanguardist positions (Baiocchi 2003: 10). The 1982 local government elections were the first where the PT participated, with one mayoral victory. By 1988 and 1989 however the party achieved considerable electoral victories with PT mayors put into place in 36 cities. In the 1990 elections the PT gained 35 seats in congress and its first senator. By this time, much of the PT leadership tended to come more from the progressive church, the student movement and other social movements, rather from the union movement (Baiocchi 2003: 12). The party consolidated its position during the 1990s and by the end of the decade it was becoming known for participatory governance and innovative municipal institutions that were redistributive, transparent and efficient. By 2000, 187 cities were governed by

---

PT mayors, accounting to 17.5 per cent of Brazil’s population (Baiocchi 2003: 13). In 2002 and again in 2006, Luis Ignácio da Silva, also known as Lula and one of the founders of the PT, won the presidential elections.

One of the probably best know participatory decision-making processes in the Brazilian governance context, implemented by the PT, is participatory budgeting, first introduced in 1989 by the municipal administration in Porto Alegre. Participatory budgeting characterises wide citizen participation in decision-making on municipal government annual budgets. Usually, the participatory budget represents between 2 and 10 per cent of the overall implemented budget. These can represent up to 100 per cent of investment resources of the overall municipal budget. Other budget items, such as personnel or maintenance are most often not part of participatory budgets. Participatory budgeting became the model for many other PT administrations and from 1993 onwards, participatory budgeting reforms were adopted by almost all PT administrations. Between 1997 and 2000 alone some 130 municipalities adopted the model (Baiocchi 2003: 23; Cabannes 2004: 29). Participatory budgeting in Brazil is characterised by direct participation of citizens26 and aims to bring an ‘inversion of priorities’ in terms of public spending, away from the traditional focus on wealthier areas towards investing more into poorer ones. In the context of this thesis, the existence of participatory budgeting is relevant in the sense that in many Brazilian cities, participatory approaches to urban governance are nothing new, whether for politicians, civil society organizations or citizens. This positive experience with participatory governance arguably raises expectations and facilitates the introduction of other participatory governance processes, such as participatory master planning as discussed in the next section.

4.2.3 Urban planning legislation, policy and practice

Until the introduction of the 1988 constitution, the 1916 Civil law provided the legal framework for property rights. This implied that until 1988 private property was almost absolute and the state had very limited control of land use development (Fernandes and Rolnik 1998: 141-142). The first systematic approach to urban planning was only introduced in the 1970s, but these plans were subordinated to private sector interests and

26 Other Latin American cities tend to opt more towards participation through representatives of existing organizations (indirect participation) and some cities apply a mix of the two approaches (Cabannes 2004: 36-37).
the property market and civil society was silenced through the military regime and
commercial developers using urban plans to further their interest (Fernandes and Rolnik
1998: 140). The master plans elaborated at the time were of a top-down nature, not
committed to any form of participatory process and aimed to achieve an ideal city from
which irregular settlements were to be banned (Souza 2003: 194). This contributed to the
typical shape of today’s cities in Brazil where modern central areas are surrounded by
poor, peripheral and informal settlements resulting in increased poverty and exclusion
(Baiocchi 2003: 8).

With the end of the military regime in 1985 and the re-establishment of democratic order,
a constitutional commission was created in 1986. In terms of urban development, the
commission had the task to clearly define the notion of social property and to establish a
new legal paradigm replacing the old one based on the Civil Code (Fernandes and Rolnik
1998: 146). Civil society had the right to propose constitutional amendments for the new
constitution and produced the ‘Popular Amendment on Urban Reform’, supported by
social urban movements and professional organizations and signed by about 150,000
people. The popular amendment was subsequently modified in congressional debates and
the new constitution, promulgated on 5 October 1988, only contained fragments of the
original proposal (Souza 2003: 192). The constitution however still brought changes of
fundamental importance for urban development and planning, principally in its articles
182 and 183. Fernandes and Rolnik (1998: 147) summarise the main issues covered by
these two articles, pointing out that:

1. It conferred on local government the power to enact laws governing the use and
development of urban space and cities with more than 20,000 inhabitants had to
produce a Master Plan Law as the basic policy instrument for urban expansion and
development.
2. It recognises the right to private property as a basic principle, but only if it
provides its social function as defined by the city’s master plan.
3. It recognises the right to adverse possession (squatter rights) in private urban
landholdings up to a maximum of 240m² after five years of peaceful possession of
the property.

Some aspects within the two articles however were rather vague, complicating the
implementation of the new policies (Souza 2003: 193). Only thirteen years later the
relevant federal regulatory framework was approved, this being the City Statute (Estatuto da Cidade) and Provisionary Decree 2220/01 (Medida Provisória – MP 2220/01).

In the **City Statute** the master plan (plano diretor) is defined as the main instrument to guide a city’s development policy and planning of urban expansion in the Municipality (Ministério das Cidades 2004: 12). It characterises the principles of master plans with a redefined content, using a ‘bottom-up’ and participative approach. The plans are to deal with the existing city, to find tools to tackle urban problems and not to establish ideal futures. In other words, the technocratic master plan has been reshaped into a tool for urban reform at the municipal level (Souza 2003: 194). In order to facilitate the implementation of this new form of master plans, the Ministry of Cities produced the document ‘The Participatory Master Plan – a Guide for its Elaboration by Municipalities and Citizens’ (Ministério das Cidades 2004). The guide emphasises that it should by no means be used as a ‘ready made recipe’, but must be related to the social, political and territorial reality of the municipality (Ministério das Cidades 2004: 13). It further explains that the process of elaborating a master plan must be driven by the executive, with broad participation of the legislative and civil society. Participation is to be included in all steps of the plan elaboration. Plans must not be elaborated and then presented to the public for consultation only and where participatory budgeting mechanisms are in place, these should be involved in the plan elaboration (Ministério das Cidades 2004: 17-19).

The **Provisional Decree 2220/01** provides several instruments to implement Articles 182 and 183 of the constitution. The most important in terms of urban planning are:

- Individual and collective special squatter rights (Usucapião especial urbano individual e coletivo);
- Individual and collective concession for special use for housing (Concessão de uso especial para fins de moradia individual e coletivo);
- Zones for special social interests (Zonas de Especial Interesse Social - ZEIS) which defines areas for tenure regularisation and physical upgrading.

As the São Paulo case study below shows, these instruments were widely used by the City administration in its slum-upgrading programme.

---

27 In Portuguese: 'Plano Diretor Participativo – guia para a elaboração pelos Municípios e cidadãos'
Another important event was the creation of the **Ministry of Cities** in January 2003 by then newly elected President Lula. The creation of this Ministry has been a long standing demand of the urban reform social movements (Ministério das Cidades 2006). In the same year, the Ministry initiated a national programme called ‘Papel Passado’ (literally ‘processed paperwork’) with the aim to revitalise the land regularisation process of the poor. Through the application of law 10.931/2004, which guarantees the exemption of all costs for the land regularisation process by low income households, the programme managed to process 1.03 million applications until April 2006 (Ministério das Cidades 2006b).

In accordance with national trends, urban policy in **São Paulo** under the military regime was characterised by the removal of squatter settlements and reallocation of the population in public housing at the periphery of the city (Budds et.al. 2005: 90). The first overall master plan was only implemented in 1971, but it did not include the poor peripheral areas of the city (Fix et.al. 2002: 3). Municipal administrations, since the adoption of the new constitution in 1988, were clearly shaped by the above mentioned rise of the PT and the gradual introduction of participatory governance mechanisms. The political leadership of the municipality from 1989 to 2004 saw two PT headed administrations which both promoted participatory slum-upgrading programmes led by the Municipal Secretariat of Housing and Urban Development (SEHAB). In contrast the PPB administrations that also led the Municipal Administration during two terms in the period since 1989, promoted more top-down driven high-rise construction projects as discussed below. The following mayors were elected four years terms each since 1989:

- 1997 – 2000: Celso Pitta (PPB)
- 2001 – 2004: Marta Suplicy (PT)

---

28 SEHAB’s annual budget is approximately USD 100 million while in 2002, the municipality had a budget of and estimated USD 3.2 billion, made up of local taxes and transfers from the state and federal governments (Fix et.al. 2002: 7).

29 Partido Progressista Brasileiro - The ‘Brazilian Progressive Party’ which is a conservative political party and among Brazil’s major political forces.
During the Erundina administration the first widespread **slum-upgrading programme** was implemented, investing about USD 150 million and benefiting 21,128 families (Cities Alliance 2004: 14). The administration also initiated the slum-upgrading programme in the south of the Municipality near the water reservoirs, called the Guarapiranga programme. This programme was an effort to upgrade squatter settlements and illegal sub-divisions in the Guarapiranga basin in the South of the Metropolitan area, also with the aim to control pollution in the water reservoir as previously mentioned (Cities Alliance 2004: 14).

The incoming Maluf administration continued the Guarapiranga programme that, until its termination in 2000, invested approximately 320 million of which 114 million were slum-upgrading activities, benefiting 27,000 families (Fix et.al. 2002: 22). However, apart from this programme, the administration fundamentally changed the manner of intervention in favelas, focusing on large construction projects for new high rise housing complexes with little community participation. The main programme of this administration became the Favela Verticalisation Programme (PROVER), also known as the ‘Singapore project’ (Projecto Cingapura), with the objective to build high rise housing. For this programme some USD 250 million were invested with finance from the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) over the period of eight years, benefiting some 15,000 families (Fix et.al. 2002: 25). The programme had a limited impact and, in terms of costs per family, it was more expensive than alternative upgrading interventions (Cities Alliance 2004: 15).

Celsa Pitto’s subsequent PPB administration basically continued urban policy and programmes of the Maluf administration, specifically the Guarapiranga and the ‘Singapore’ programmes. However, it also introduced a new programme called **Lote Legal** (legal plot) which was an initiative to combine slum-upgrading with land tenure regularisation. As with the Guarapiranga programme under the Maluf and Pitto administration, the **Lote Legal** programme however was on a relatively small scale and had limited success (Cities Alliance 2004: 15).

The Suplicy administration that took office in 2001 reinvigorated upgrading activities through four different programmes (Cities Alliance 2004: 16-17):

1. The Housing Production Programme, seeking to expand the supply of new housing including a self-help housing component;
2. The Living Downtown Programme (Morar Perto), an upgrading programme for downtown slum tenements (corticos) that was initiated in 2002, with USD 5 million funding (Fix et al. 2002: 25);

3. The Administrative Modernisation Programme of SEHAB, funded by the IDB with USD 1.2 million, undertaking an institutional modernisation of SEHAB;

4. The Bairro Legal programme, an integrated programme of urban upgrading combined with land regularisation.

Beside the specific urban upgrading programmes, the Municipal Administration was also engaged in several poverty alleviation programmes which were implemented on the state or federal level. For these programmes, the Municipal Administration in 2002 had USD 72 million available (Fix et al. 2002: 26). The most important outside financing has been provided by the IDB and the World Bank which have had a considerable impact on the city’s budget. Smaller contributions have from the European Union and the Cities Alliance (Fix et al. 2002: 27).

The administration further developed a new municipal strategic master plan and within these new parameters, SEHAB developed a municipal housing plan with an emphasis on the production of new housing units, upgrading and land-tenure regularisation, regeneration of the city centre, modernisation of the municipal administration and public participation (Budds et al. 2005: 96). A total of 964 areas were defined as ZEIS and for each area, SEHAB began drawing-up a development plan (Budds et al. 2005: 100-101).

The next section now provides a more detailed account of the Bairro Legal programme that was implemented within the context discussed in this section.

4.2.4 The Bairro Legal Informal Settlement Integration Programme in São Paulo

The Bairro Legal programme is an informal settlement integration programme. The programme is coordinated by SEHAB and can be categorised into six different aspects of intervention (Budds et al. 2005: 103-108).

---

30 Bairro Legal is a play with words. Legal not only means legal but also great or nice. In this respect, the programme means not only ‘legal neighbourhood’ but also ‘great’ or ‘nice’ neighbourhood.

31 Looking at the contribution of the Cities Alliance to Bairro Legal, three specific outputs are identified (Cities Alliance 2004: 41):

1. Development of housing and urban development action plans;
1. Upgrading and land tenure legalisation in squatter settlements: 36 areas (all ZEIS) were selected for upgrading activities which included the provision of infrastructures, services and public facilities. The programme distributed land titles to 45,000 residents in 160 squatter settlements (all ZEIS).

2. Verticalisation of squatter settlements: SEHAB’s policy was to terminate this programme which was initiated under the Maluf administration in 1993. However, existing contracts were brought to an end and some aspects were renegotiated with the funding agency (the IDB) in order to include upgrading and public facilities.

3. Resettlement of favela residents: This was only practiced on very specific occasions, such as resettlement from hazardous or protected areas. Resettled families are moved to apartment blocks or other upgraded favelas.

4. Artificial channelling of waterways: This programme was created in 1995 with financing from the IDB with SEHAB completing outstanding contracts.

5. Upgrading and land tenure legalisation in illegal sub-divisions (Lote Legal): As mentioned above, this programme was initiated under the Maluf administration in 1995 and been taken forward by the Suplicy administration in 2001. It is a similar process to the earlier version mentioned above, upgrading and land tenure legalisation in squatter settlements, but managed by a sub-division of SEHAB, the Land Sub-division Department (RESOLO), which has a mediation role between the settlers and the land owners. The revised sub-division law defines that only illegal sub-divisions formed before April 2000 are eligible for legalisation. Since its beginning in 1995, the programme has facilitated the legalisation of 236 sub-divisions with more than 110,000 plots.

6. Renovation and tenure legalisation of public housing estates: this programme has been applied in the public housing estates, providing upgrading and the creation of public

2. Contributing towards a methodology for analysis and prevention of violence;
3. A consolidated methodology for housing and urban development action plans.
facilities. The programme also included a tenure legalisation aspect and some 51,000 property titles have been issued.

As can be noted, **Bairro Legal** is an extensive and complex programme that reflects the urban development trends and decision-making processes within the governance context of São Paulo. Three of the six above mentioned interventions that constitute **Bairro Legal** are 'leftovers' of the previous administration, taken on board by the Suplicy administration with the objective to fulfil outstanding contracts, with some adjustments undertaken reflecting the more socially oriented urban policy of the PT administration.

While two PPB administrations during the 1990s reversed back to more capital intensive and non-participatory high rise construction programmes, the PT administration coming into power in 2001 again focused on participatory slum-upgrading as main policy, implemented through several programmes of which one was **Bairro Legal**. The programme’s specific emphasis on slum-upgrading is reflected in the first mentioned intervention with its focus on upgrading and land tenure legalisation in squatter settlements. In this programme, the areas of intervention were identified through the application of the earlier mentioned Provisional Decree 2220/01, these designated ZEIS areas then benefiting from the legal provisions of the Decree, such as facilitated land tenure regularisation. This shows how recent changes in the legal planning framework facilitated the implementation of this participatory planning and development programme.

This analysis also shows that **Bairro Legal** is partly the result of decisions taken before the Suplicy administration and partly the result of the specific urban development policy promoted by this administration. The programme therefore is linked to past and contemporary decision-making processes within a changing governance context, shaped by urban policy in São Paulo by different political parties and the development of national urban legislation and policy, guided by the PT government. Participatory approaches played an important role in the planning and implementation process of **Bairro Legal**. Two different aspects of participation have been identified, one being participation of key stakeholders, and one being community participation. It has been argued that stakeholder participation has been key to the overall outcome, this including negotiation processes among stakeholders and the promotion of capacity building not only in the **Bairro Legal**, but also other programmes implemented by SEHAB. Participation however is not being considered the single most important issue in the programme, but rather assessed in
relation to other equally fundamental aspects such as the reform of local administration or financial management (Cities Alliance 2004: 54). Importantly, as noted above in the literature review, the participatory processes have resulted in a major impact. The analysis of this case study in relation to the analytical framework is undertaken after the second international case study is reported.

4.3 Case study 2: City Development Strategy in Johannesburg, South Africa

4.3.1 Historic overview and issues of sustainable urban development

The recent European history of South Africa began with its colonisation in the 17th century with the arrival of Dutch settlers. The British arrived more than a century later and together the Europeans struggled for land with the African kingdoms during much of the 19th century. The discovery of diamonds and gold further intensified conflict over land, not only between the Europeans and Africans but also between the two main European ethnicities, the Dutch descendants (Afrikaners or Boers) and the British, culminating in the so called Boer War of 1899-1902. The British won but the two groups together drafted a constitution and Britain gave South Africa independence in 1910.

In the following decades, both European groups did everything possible to maintain white supremacy. The 1913 Natives Land Act for example attributed only 8 per cent of land to the large African majority. Africans were further restricted in their movement through ‘pass laws’ and they had no right to vote. In 1948, with the election victory of the right-wing National Party (NP), a full legal system of apartheid (separateness) was introduced. Blacks were confined to townships and rural reservations whereas the Whites lived in the cities and occupied all prime farming areas. The main black opposition party, the African National Congress (ANC) which was founded in 1912 was also banned and many of its leaders (including Nelson Mandela) were either imprisoned or went into exile. By the 1980s however international sanctions and social unrest were increasingly threatening economic and social stability. In 1990, the last NP president F. W. de Klerk released Nelson Mandela from prison, who after 27 years in jail became the head of the now legal

32 Under Apartheid, the people of South Africa were defined into four different racial groups, these being Blacks (or Africans), Coloureds, Indian and Whites. These categories today are still used in describing different racial groups in South Africa, as for example in the academic literature that was consulted for writing this section.
ANC. The first democratic elections were held in 1994 and Nelson Mandela and the ANC came into power (Economist 2006).

Massive urbanisation initially took place in South Africa in the years before and during World War II, resulting from push and pull factors, with Africans being evicted from their land and looking for a better life in the cities. Urbanisation of the African population however was tightly controlled through influx controls which were extended through government acts in 1923 and 1937 (Goodland 2006: 1630). The NP’s electoral victory in 1948 initiated an urban transformation and social engineering under apartheid which continued until the 1980s. The Group Areas Acts of 1950 and 1966, together with the Pass Laws, were the main legal tools used by the government to implement apartheid policy in urban areas. While pass laws restricted the freedom of movement, Group Areas Acts defined which urban areas were open for which one of the four defined racial groups (African, Indian, Coloured and White).

Over the years, urban areas became racially separated, with white groups benefiting from upgraded and well serviced land, while the African population was forced into substandard housing in peripheral townships that were built through massive government financed housing projects (Jenkins 2001a). The Indians were mostly allocated poor housing in specifically defined areas in the city and the Coloureds (mostly but not only concentrated in the Cape area) were forced to live in designated townships, such as for example the Cape Flats townships in Cape Town, far from the city centre (Goodland 2006: 1630). The urbanisation of the African population continued at a fast rate during the 1970s and 1980s but equally important for increased urbanisation became natural growth. The lack of available housing resulted in the continued growth of informal settlements around towns and cities (Goodland 2006: 1633). By 2001 South Africa had a population of 44.8 million. Of the total population, Africans constituted 37.6 million, Whites 4.4 million, the Coloured population 4.2 million and Indians/Asians the remaining 1.2 million. South Africa continues to be a rapidly urbanising country with an urbanisation rate of 59.2 per cent in 2001 (Economist 2006).

Whereas during the decade after apartheid urban development was mainly concerned about redressing the apartheid legacy, the emphasis soon shifted towards economic, social and environmental concerns. For example, to report on the contemporary state of South

---

33 In the rural areas, Africans were forced to live in one of the 10 designated ‘homelands’.
Africa’s cities, the South African Cities Network (SACN)\(^{34}\) is using an analytical framework with four key components (Boraine et al. 2006: 262; SACN 2006):\(^{35}\)

1. **The inclusive city**, with a focus on whether residents have the opportunities and capacities to share equitably the social benefits of city life (social dimension);
2. **The productive city**, examining whether the local economy provides a majority of residents with means to earn an acceptable living (economic dimension);
3. **The sustainable city**, looking at how the city impacts on natural resources that sustain the settlement and make it liveable (environmental dimension);\(^{36}\) and,
4. **The well-governed city**, assessing whether the political and institutional context is stable, open and dynamic enough to ensure that varied interests can be accommodated and adequately responded to (political dimension).

Looking at the social dimension, South African cities are still considered highly segregated, but compared to the days of apartheid progress has been achieved in terms of urban integration (Christopher 2001: 463). However, while interracial inequality is diminishing, inequality in general has actually increased since 1994 (Boraine et al. 2006: 260). About a quarter of households in the nine largest cities in contemporary South Africa live in shack settlements or shacks in the backyards of formal housing (Boraine et al. 2006: 272). One main reason of the continued lack of integration by the majority of Africans is the lack of economic empowerment that would permit the use of opportunities given by the contemporary legal context (Christopher 2001: 463). Recent surveys give evidence that the perceived quality of life among the African population is actually declining (Boraine et al. 2006: 275). One of the fundamental challenges for integration is population growth and limited increase in employment (even decrease in various sectors), this leading towards the key issue that economic growth is in fact not keeping up with population growth. As Boraine et al. (2006: 272) summarises:

\(^{34}\) The SACN is discussed in greater detail below.

\(^{35}\) This analytical framework is very similar to the one of the thesis which uses a triangular framework, looking at economic (the productive city), social (the inclusive city) and environmental (the sustainable city) dimensions of urban development. This ‘triangle bottom line’ which concerns environmental sustainability, shared economic growth and social inclusion as well as good urban governance is also a key emphasis of official South African Policy (Boraine et al. 2006: 261).

\(^{36}\) Although the term ‘sustainability’ in this third component is used in a narrower sense than the concept of sustainability as defined for this thesis in chapter two, the wider aspects of sustainability are represented in the other three components.
"While the absolute number of households served [by basic services] has increased noticeably, the increasing size of populations and other dynamics have meant that the proportion of households receiving these services has often remained static or improved only marginally. For example, households using electricity for lighting purposes increased by 928 368 between 1996 and 2001, but the number without also increased, resulting in an only modest improvement of households without electricity."

This quote provides a vivid example of the economic and social challenges brought by rapid population growth in South Africa. Related to this observation are high levels of unemployment, having increased during the 1990s with the trend of cities to change from primary and secondary industry to services. In general, unemployment rates tend to be slightly lower in the cities, but some cities show rates considerably higher than in rural areas (Boraine et.al. 2006: 268-272).

Many aspects of the environmental dimension are a legacy of the apartheid era when cities were designed with a disproportionate impact on the environment, such as a lack of waste and sewage management and transport inefficiencies. However, post-apartheid policy has also contributed significantly to environmental problems as for example housing policy and programmes that encourage peripheral green-field developments and have thus expanded the cities’ ecological footprint. This urban sprawl further creates huge challenges in terms of infrastructure and transport congestion (Boraine et.al. 2006: 276-278). As discussed below, the development of the city of Johannesburg is not atypical to the overall national context.
The city of Johannesburg was founded as a small gold digging tent village in 1886. The gold rush made the city swell to 100,000 inhabitants within only 10 years and the economic significance of the area increased rapidly. The national policies at the beginning of the 20th century led towards a highly segregated urban development pattern, with the black population confined to peripheral townships around the city such as Soweto and Alexandra. With the end of apartheid and the abolition of the Group Areas Act in the early 1990s, the inner city experienced a great influx of poor black Africans.

coming mostly from the townships. Increased population densities accompanied by
general inner-city decay and very high levels of criminality made many businesses move
into the northern suburbs and new suburban centres. The municipality of Johannesburg
has an estimated population of almost 3.3 million while the wider metropolitan area has a
population of more than 8 million (Wikipedia 2007). The average annual population
growth rate is 2.5 per cent and the average population density of the municipal area (1644
km²) is 2003 people per km² (SACN 2006).

Contemporary Johannesburg is a divided city with the poor largely living in the south or
on the peripheries of the far north, and the middle classes concentrated in the suburbs of
the centre and its immediate north. The poor are predominantly black and the middle
class and rich predominantly white. The suburbs offer a standard of living comparable to
other major cities in the North yet some 20 per cent of the population live in deep poverty
in poorly serviced shack settlements that lack proper roads or electricity. Another 40 per
cent live in inadequate housing, with insufficient municipal services. In 2002, an
estimated 16 per cent of households lacked sanitation, 15 per cent did not receive
municipal electricity and 3.6 per cent were without water supply. Some 116,800 families
were estimated to live in informal settlements and some 108,000 families in illegal
backyard dwellings (SACN 2002: 4).

Johannesburg has the largest economy of all cities in South Africa (Boraine et.al.: 266).
Some 74 per cent of South African companies have their headquarters situated in
Johannesburg and by many standards, such as communication and transport
infrastructure, it is a modern city (SACN 2002: 4). The city has a commitment to global
competitiveness and seeks to become a ‘high-tech hub’ (Beall et.al. 2000: 121).
Johannesburg however is also a city where poverty has been increasing ever since the
1970s (Beall et.al. 2000: 108). The former dominant sectors of manufacturing and mining
have declined since the 1970s while the tertiary sectors of government and non-
government services and finance have increased. As a result, employment in the
manufacturing sector has fallen from 24 to 16 per cent of all employment while
employment in the service sector has increased steadily (Beall et.al. 2000: 108-110).
Johannesburg also has a very high unemployment rate, having risen from 27 to 30 per
cent over the past three years (City of Johannesburg 2006).
One of the main environmental problems experienced by the city is related to urban sprawl, extending the ecological footprint of the city and destroying some of the best arable land in South Africa. Other environmental issues are related to increased air pollution and waste management treatment issues.

Overall, Johannesburg shows many unsustainable development trends linked to social exclusion, increasing poverty and urban sprawl. The next section however shows that similarly as in São Paulo, recent changes in the governance context produced what are by many considered rather effective policies and programmes that seek to counter these trends.

### 4.3.2 The governance context

In terms of political structure, South Africa is a federal state, consisting of a national government and nine provincial governments. The national government legislative has two assemblies, the 400 seat National Assembly and the 90 seat National Council of Provinces, both being elected every five years. The last national elections were held in April 2004 and the next ones are due in 2009. Under the 1996 constitution, the president (elected by the National Assembly) is permitted to serve a maximum of two terms. The last local government elections were held in 2005 and the next ones are due in 2010.

After the national elections in 1994, South Africa also embarked on a process of decentralisation. The first democratic local government elections were held in 1995, leading towards a local government which radically differed from its apartheid predecessor that had as its main task the delivery of services. The second local government elections in 2000 consolidated this process and local authorities were now expected to play an active role in local economic development (Nel and Binns 2001: 355). This decentralisation process and the new role of local government were guided by a series of legislative acts, initiated by the new 1996 constitution: the 1996 Local Government Transition Act and the 1998 Local Government White Paper. These early

---

38 As in Brazil, decentralisation in South Africa has characterised of what has been described as ‘devolution’ in chapter two. The thesis however maintains the term ‘decentralisation’ as this is the one used in the literature consulted for this chapter.
laws and policy directives laid the basis for developmental local government, specified in subsequent legislation such as the 1998 Local Government Municipal Structures Act, which assigned the three levels of local government (metropolitan, municipal and district) distinct powers and responsibilities. This new legislation also provided the space for participation of traditional authorities in local governance. The 2000 Local Government Systems Bill identified the core processes and elements necessary for local governments to achieve their goals. The core processes include participatory governance and integrated development planning (Nel and Binns 2001: 355).

**Participatory governance** therefore is a core aspect of decentralisation, explicitly referred to in all main policy documents and relevant legislation. While the development of participatory mechanisms is mandatory for municipalities, they have adopted different ways to comply with this aspect of legislation, creating structures such as ward committees, resident associations or development forums (IDASA 2006).

One important agent in South Africa’s civil society is the **civic movement** that grew out of resistance to apartheid policy and practice. Important events such as the Soweto Uprising in 1976 led towards a resistance campaign supported by the underground political opposition, making the townships ungovernable. This ‘policy’ became one important lever of the ANC during the negotiation period with the NP leading towards the first democratic elections in 1994. During this transition phase, the main opposition alliance, which included the ANC, the Council of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) and the South African Communist Party (SACP), initiated a series of talks with the government to establish the post-apartheid institutions and policy (Jenkins 2001a). These talks were held through different forums with the participation of representatives from the government, opposition alliance and the civic movement.

A rather recent but increasingly important actor in the urban governance context is the **South African City Network (SACN)** which was established in 2001. Its members are the nine largest cities in South Africa and the South African Local Government

---

39 Developmental local government stands for the fact that in the post-apartheid period, local authorities were expected and have been empowered to play an increasingly prominent role in local economic development (Nel and Binns 2001: 355).

40 Integrated development planning is discussed in greater detail below.
Association (SALGA) and it is funded by member contributions and donors. It is not a government entity but describes itself as a non-profit voluntary organization owned by, and accountable to, its members (SACN 2006). The goals of the SACN are to promote good governance, analyse strategic challenges facing South African cities, share experiences and promote partnerships among large city governments and between different spheres of government in South Africa (SACN 2006). The SACN has had an important influence on the development of recent urban policy in South Africa (Boraine et.al. 2006: 261).

In terms of governance during apartheid, the area that today is Johannesburg city was divided into 11 local authorities, seven white and four black. Johannesburg however only referred to that part of the city that was occupied by Whites. African residential areas such as Soweto or Meadowlands were run separately by black local authorities that however never received any legitimisation within the townships (Beall et.al. 2000: 118). During the transition time that led to the elections in 1994, the City Council initiated a dialogue with black organizations and established the Central Johannesburg Partnership with businesses and community representatives in order to seek consensus on housing and development projects (Goodland 2006: 1632).

In 1995, the four interim metropolitan councils of Johannesburg attempted to address the city's problems by adopting the policy of 'One City, One Tax Base'. The idea was that with a single tax base, revenues from the wealthy, traditionally white areas would help pay for the services needed in the poorer black areas. The municipal boundaries were expanded to include wealthy satellite towns like Sandton and Randburg, as well as poorer townships such as Soweto and Alexandra, and informal settlements like Orange Farm. This initiative however quickly ran into trouble due to over-ambitious spending, wasted expenditure and some cases of fraud. It was also criticised for focusing excessively on the micro level and not sufficiently considering the macro dynamics that were rapidly reshaping the city (Harrison 2006: 329). Additionally, revenue collection was boycotted on a large scale (City of Johannesburg 2006).

By 1997, the city was in such serious financial problems that routine administration was suspended in favour of an emergency committee which directly oversaw budgeting and decision-making (Parnell and Robinson 2006: 342). The committee also oversaw the elaboration of an institutional and financial restructuring plan which was produced in
1999, called iGoli 2002.\footnote{41} This three year plan introduced some quite radical changes such as the selling of non-core assets and restructuring of certain utilities (e.g. privatisation and management contracts for water and electricity provision of the city), and the creation of the ‘Unicity’ or Greater Johannesburg Metropolitan Council in 2000, representing the first integrated metropolitan government of the city (Parnell and Robinson 2006: 342).\footnote{42}

Today’s Unicity is run by Johannesburg’s executive mayor which takes overall strategic and political responsibility for the city and leads a 10-person mayoral committee (city-level ‘cabinet’). Each member of the mayoral committee has executive responsibility for a portfolio. At the head of city administration is a management team run by a city manager along with executive directors for planning, community development, finance, municipal administration and contract management (SACN 2002: 4). Some of the key city service functions are supplied by separate, self-contained entities, each run on business lines with its own CEO and each entering into service contracts with the administrative core. There are for example:

- **10 Utilities** such as electricity, water and sanitation, and solid waste management. These Utilities are registered companies, must be self-funding (no annual grants from the city), providing charged services directly to the households.

- A set of **Agencies** which include Johannesburg Roads, City Parks and the Johannesburg Development Agency. Each of these performs a service to the public at large, also being structured as separate companies, but relying on the city for funding.

- **11 Regions** into which the city has been divided, each serving about 300,000 people. The regions have their own management structures, each headed by a regional director. The regions run certain services such as libraries, community clinics, sports facilities, housing and social services.

The City council is constituted of 217 elected councillors, with the ANC in the majority (129 councillors).

\footnote{41} iGoli is the vernacular name of Johannesburg, meaning ‘place of gold’.

\footnote{42} A similar process of amalgamating councils took place all over South Africa, in the process of which the number of local authorities was reduced from 843 to 284 and large ‘unicities’ were created in Cape Town, Durban, Pretoria and the East Rand (City of Johannesburg 2006).
4.3.3 Urban planning legislation, policy and practice

Under apartheid, there was a dualist and binary planning system privileging Whites and oppressing Blacks with a preoccupation about segregated land use based on race (Oranje 2003: 179). Under this planning system that lasted until the late 1980s, forward spatial planning of the main South African metropolitan areas was done through Guide Plans elaborated by national government. With the abolition of the Pass Laws in 1986, the prospect of large scale urbanisation became an immediate challenge and a new form of urban planning was considered necessary (Watson 2003: 141). The new planning model or approach that was being adopted by many urban planners at the time was based on the compact city approach and had the advantage to basically oppose all negative outcomes of apartheid planning, promoting higher densities, mix of land uses and the allocation of the poor in central rather than peripheral urban areas (Watson 2003: 142).

By 1994, a number of large South African cities were in the process of elaborating comprehensive urban spatial plans, all containing elements of the compact city approach. In the welfarist context of the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP), spatial planners saw themselves in a key position to influence urban development and equity through these physical planning processes (Watson 2003: 140). However, with the shift at central government level towards neo-liberalism and the emerging emphasis on developmental local government, spatial planning lost some of its importance. It was not anymore considered as the one important mechanism of integration, its place being taken by the budget in accordance with neo-liberal thinking (Watson 2003: 141).

The contemporary framework for urban planning is provided by local government policy and laws as discussed above. The 1996 Local Government Transition Amendment Act first introduced the concept of integrated planning, budgeting and management, requiring all metropolitan and municipal governments to draw up Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) for their area of jurisdiction. These require that the areas of land use planning, transport planning, infrastructure planning and economic development planning should be integrated to inform the IDP which also had to include a budget (Watson 2003: 143; Nel and Binns 2001: 355). The 1998 Local Government Municipal Structures Act also gave a mandate to the district councils to assist municipalities in the elaboration of IDPs. Over

---

An IDP guideline document was issued by the Department of Constitutional Development in 1997.
the years the spatial planning aspect within the IDP process became more and more marginalised in favour of a ‘business planning’ approach that seemed more appropriate to further the objectives of developmental local government (Watson 2003: 144).

Local governments however experienced serious problems in the attempts to implement IDPs. One of the main obstacles became the different approaches used by departments on the local government level. Local government departments, tied to their national level counterparts through laws, directives and funding, have often experienced difficulties to integrate their approaches with other sectors. While national transport planners for example were increasingly giving support to spatial forms such as high density public transport corridors within cities, national housing policy has focused on delivering the maximum number of housing at minimum cost which has steered delivery of housing to large green-field sites on the urban periphery in the form of low-density, single units. Watson (2003: 152) argues that this lack of intersectoral integration is one of the main issues that caused the extreme difficulties that local governments are facing in elaborating IDPs. By 1999 for example, most African local authorities have not yet successfully linked the IDP to a budget (Beall et.al. 2000: 120). Nevertheless, it is argued that IDPs can be considered as an important step towards more participatory and effective planning on the municipal level with an increasing importance for local development.

4.3.4 The Johannesburg City Development Strategy

Since the early 1990s there have been initiatives to envision the future of Johannesburg. But only in 1997, when the emergency committee took over city management, was a first strategic plan elaborated, the above mentioned iGoli 2002, resulting in the institutional and financial restructuring that led to the establishment of the Unicity in 2000. While widely regarded as a necessary and successful process, iGoli 2002 has also attracted considerable opposition, especially from anti-liberalisation proponents linked to local civil society and popular movements (Parnell and Robinson: 2006: 345).

These differences led to opposed and entrenched positions among those participants that were responsible to initiate the first medium and long term strategic planning process in 1999, called iGoli 2010.44 The poor relationship among participants as a result of the

---

44 At the early stages, there was some partial involvement by UN-HABITAT through the UMP and the Cities Alliance with the University of Witwatersrand in a coordinating role. However, most of the work on
iGoli 2002 process therefore conditioned the development of iGoli 2010 from the beginning. Parnell and Robinson (2006: 345) recount that "Having started as a participatory 'partnership' between the local authority, business, community and unions, the CDS ended up as more of a technical exercise limited to consultants, councillors and officials." The international consultancy Monitor subsequently led the key research that was to inform iGoli 2010. It presented a very broad report with a range of options to the city council, primarily in the realm between economic growth and delivering basic services to the poor. The document however was perceived as being indecisive, lacking clear directions for city development and ultimately, the Council never adopted the document (Parnell and Robinson 2006: 345-346). The local government elections in December 2000 coincided with the disappointing reception of iGoli 2010 and the newly elected council appointed a national consultant who, on the basis of the research conducted by Monitor and others, set out anew to propose a clear strategy for the city.

This new plan, called Jo'burg 2030, was a much more focused strategic document with a continued emphasis on the importance of economic growth as the basis for increased employment and tax revenues. The provision of basic services was valued on the basis of their contribution to economic growth. In the process for developing Jo’burg 2030, the issue of participation disappeared completely and the Unions, civic movement and NGOs did not participate in the process. Decisions about the CDS content and setting of priorities were therefore basically left to the elected city council as a formal representative democratic institution. This led to the incorporation of an additional emphasis on social service delivery, addressing HIV/AIDS and ensuring that the poor would benefit from economic growth. However, the emphasis on these social issues was not sufficient for some, but with the need for approval of the plan it was agreed to revise Jo’burg 2030 at a later stage in order to strengthen these social aspects (Parnell and Robinson 2006: 346-347). There was also the recognition that there would be some space of manoeuvring about prioritisation of funds in the annual budgeting decision-making process led by the city council.

Following Jo’burg 2030 the city also prepared a Human Development Agenda and an Environmental Management Plan. Aspects of both documents were included in the CDS

the Johannesburg CDS has been funded by the city itself with limited contributions by outside actors (ECON 2005: 96).
in a review of Jo'burg 2030 during 2004 and 2005, broadening the scope of Jo'burg 2030 beyond economic development. It is however argued that, at the same time, the city authorities showed themselves rather insensitive towards the poor in many instances. One example being cited is associated with the Better Buildings Programme (one of the 62 programmes initiated through Jo'burg 2030) which aims to upgrade some 230 run-down buildings in the inner-city where currently some 25,000 people live. Evictions associated with this upgrading programme received sharp critique locally and internationally, mainly because of the social impact of the evictions and inadequate provision of alternative accommodation (Harrison 2006: 330).

Jo’burg 2030 further provided a framework for other planning processes, such as a city-wide physical plan called the Spatial Development Framework (SDF). The SDF took into account actual market and development trends without losing the vision of Jo’burg 2003, in promoting increased urban efficiency and introducing urban growth boundaries and concentrated decentralised developments within clearly defined nodes with the aim to minimise the costs of servicing a sprawling city. The plan was well received by the business community. The plan’s compromise between the Jo’burg 2030 vision and actual market and development trends seemed necessary, because earlier physical planning had little impact on development. Harrison (2006: 329) summarises that:

“Historically, the ability of city authorities in Johannesburg to shape spatial patterns was very weak and, through the 1990s especially, urban space was restructured by private-and public-sector investment with almost no regard to post-apartheid planning ideals such as compaction-integration.”

In the case of Johannesburg, the CDS further served as a guiding document for the elaboration of the annual IDP and the medium term budget strategy (SACN 2002: 5).

In terms of participation in the CDS process, strong and inclusive participatory methods were envisaged at the beginning. Later however, the process became internalised, only involving senior officials and consultants (Parnell and Robinson 2006: 342). It is argued that this aspect of the Johannesburg experience actually brings into question the role of participation in developing city development strategies and that in the case of Johannesburg the interests of the poor and other groups were adequately represented
through the participation of elected officials (Parnell and Robinson 2006: 342). Parnell and Robinson (2006: 346) argue that:

“[...] the formal democratic institutions of local government [...] played the most important part in ensuring the incorporation into the final Jo’burg 2030 document of an emphasis on delivering social services, addressing the HIV/AIDS crisis and ensuring a commitment to stretching the benefits of economic growth to poorer parts of the city.”

This view however is presumably contested by the civic movement that has not effectively participated in the planning process. Nevertheless, it shows that in cases where participatory mechanisms fail (as it did in the elaboration of Jo’burg 2030), local democratic institutions can, and this obviously depending on the local context, contribute to aspects of social and economic inclusion in urban plans.

The case of the Johannesburg CDS provides an example of a planning process in the context of important changes in the local and national governance context. The change in the national political system, this manifested through the democratisation of South Africa, radically changed urban governments and policy, this initiating processes such as iGoli 2002 that then led towards the development of Jo’burg 2030. Although public participation was very limited, the elected local government, a result of the national process of decentralisation, ensured a certain level of scrutiny of the government-led planning process. The analytical framework of the thesis also set out the importance of an empowered civil society for using spaces of participation. In the case of Jo’burg 2030 however, initially considered spaces were closed in the process mainly due to incompatible interests and values between the city government and powerful civil society groups. This situation therefore provides an example of conflicting development visions and interests, this, when drawing on Campbell’s triangle, mainly between the economic dimension linked to the governments vision of economic growth and the social dimension, related for example to the concern of many civil society organizations about the provision of social services or issues like HIV/Aids.
4.4 Conclusions

This chapter examined two case studies of participatory urban planning through the lenses of the analytical framework as presented in the conclusions of chapter two. Based on this analysis, several conclusions can be drawn.

Both cities show low levels of sustainable development with high levels of social and economic exclusion, this also being linked to environmental problems. In both cities, exclusion is most significant at the peripheries. Also in both cities, conflicts between the different dimensions of sustainability are evident, especially between urban development approaches for increased social inclusion and economic growth strategies. In terms of political inclusion and governance, both case study cities underwent radical changes after the end of authoritarian regimes. In both countries, the newly elected democratic regimes elaborated new constitutions, introducing more decentralised government and significantly opened up to wider participation especially at municipal levels. Also in both countries, strong vocal civil society organizations made significant contributions for implementing institutional and legal changes. Urban planning legislation underwent similar changes as the broader governance context, with new legislation in both Brazil and South Africa assigning more responsibility to local governments and democratising planning processes through the institutionalisation of wider stakeholder participation. The planning process, outcome and impact of the two case studies were clearly shaped by this broader context.

The Bairro Legal case study in São Paulo provided an example of a slum-upgrading programme implemented by the city government in partnership with key local stakeholders from government and civil society, as well as with support from the Cities Alliance. The thesis argued that the success of the programme can be attributed to the fact that the city of São Paulo has a history of participatory governance, introduced through a first PT administration in the late 1980s. Since then, the city has implemented a series of slum-upgrading programmes. The Bairro Legal programme was further able to apply recent and progressive urban legislation that permitted the designation of ZEIS areas, facilitating rapid land tenure regularisation. This analysis showed that Bairro Legal is partly the result of decisions taken before the Suplicy administration and partly the result of the specific urban development policy promoted by this administration. The programme therefore is linked to past and contemporary decision-making processes within a changing governance context, shaped by urban policy in São Paulo by different
political parties and the development of national urban legislation and policy, guided by the PT-led government at central level. While this context facilitated the implementation of *Bairro Legal*, the programme successfully applied a series of participatory mechanisms within the realm of stakeholder participation and community participation, this reportedly having contributed to the success of the programme. In this case study, participation in the planning processes had a direct influence on the planning outcomes that finally led to the slum-upgrading activities. This direct causal relationship between planning and development can arguably be assigned to the nature of a slum-upgrading programme, where the ultimate objective is development and the planning process is a means to it. But it can also been argued that this direct link between planning and development, and the important role of participation in the process, was due to the fact that the approach of *Bairro Legal* was embedded in national policy and was further able to overcome conflicting interests during this process.

In Johannesburg, the chapter discussed a strategic planning process, in this case called a City Development Strategy (CDS). The initiation of the CDS examined, Jo’burg 2030, was itself an outcome of previous planning processes and institutional rearrangements undertaken by the post-apartheid metropolitan government. The planning process of Jo’burg 2030 saw very limited stakeholder participation and no community participation, although at the beginning of the planning process, there was an explicit intention to engage in these forms of participation. However, it is being argued by some (and contested by others) that the interests of the poor were arguably adequately represented through the participation of elected officials in the formal democratic institutions of the metropolitan government. While the relationship between planning and development may not be as explicit as in the case of *Bairro Legal*, it is still visible through the implementation of programmes linked to the Jo’burg 2030 vision, such as the Better Building Programme mentioned above. A further indicator of the CDS’s acceptance is its influence on subsequent planning processes such as the Spatial Development Framework.

In chapter two, the thesis argued for an analytical framework that emphasised on the importance of understanding the context within which a planning process is taking place in order to analyse the role and effectiveness of participation in relation to planning outcome and planning impact on sustainable development. The discussion of the two case studies in this chapter suggests that the development and governance analysis indeed provided the necessary information for a critical analysis and understanding of the
function of participation in the two planning processes and its relation to sustainable development.

Following this argument, two case studies therefore suggests that in terms of governance, important contributing factors to the success of the two case studies are democratic political systems and socially progressive political parties in power that had a significant impact on the design and implementation of the two planning processes. Further, both countries are in a fairly advanced stage of decentralisation where locally elected government has a wide range of decision-making power and associated resources for complying with its responsibilities. Both countries also show a history of strong civil society organization and public engagement that made its contribution in shaping the contemporary political context. Looking at the sustainability of urban development towards which the planning processes contributed, it can be concluded that aspects of social sustainability were arguably more reflected in the Bairro Legal case, while the Johannesburg CDS had an emphasis on economic growth which in Campbell’s triangle is an indicator of economic sustainability. The analytical framework on sustainable development also facilitated the identification of conflicts between different dimensions of sustainability, this in both case studies. While in the case of Bairro Legal differences in the process did not visibly affect the planning outcome, a conflict of vision and interests in the case of Jo’burg 2030 between government and civil society resulted in the exclusion of the latter in the planning process.

Dynamics of urban development and governance are very different in Angola, the context within which two other participatory planning processes are being examined in the following chapters. Angola is a country that arguably shows even bigger challenges for urban development and planning than Brazil and South Africa, this due to much more accentuated levels of unsustainable development in its social, economic and environmental dimension, exclusive and non-participatory governance, weak institutions in state and civil society and a very marginal function attributed to urban planning in general.
Chapter 5: An Introduction to Angola

5.1 Introduction

This chapter provides an introduction to Angola's geography and people, as well as the recent history that has been marked by prolonged and extreme violent conflict. After this general introduction, the chapter then provides a detailed analysis of the contemporary development and governance context. In terms of development, a first section looks at the phenomenon of extreme rapid urban growth, linking this to an analysis of sustainability of urban development in its social, economic and environmental aspects. A following section discusses Angolan ‘realpolitik’ and the characteristics and function of the nascent civil society in Angola within this context. A last section then provides an overview of the urban planning framework, examining the ongoing decentralisation process, the recently approved territorial planning law and the also recently approved land law and its forthcoming regulation. The information of this rather detailed contextual analysis is then used in the discussion of the case studies in chapters six and seven.

5.2 Geography and people

Angola is located on the South Atlantic Coast of West Africa between Namibia in the south and the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) in the north, bordering Zambia to the east. The province of Cabinda, being an enclave in the north separated from the rest of Angola, is bordering the DRC and Congo Brazzaville. The country comprises an arid coastal strip stretching from Namibia to Luanda, a wet highland in the interior, a dry savannah in the interior south and southeast, and rain forest in the north and in Cabinda. The Zambezi River and several tributaries of the Congo River have their sources in Angola. The coastal lands have a short rainy season lasting from February to April, with hot and dry summers and mild winters. The interior highlands have a mild climate with a rainy season from November to April followed by a cool dry season from May to October. Elevations in the interior generally range from 900 to 1,800 metres. The far north and Cabinda enjoy rain throughout most of the year. The coast is for the most part flat, with occasional low cliffs and Lobito Bay has water sufficiently deep to allow large ships to unload close inshore. The coastal plain extends inland for a distance varying from 48 to 165 km and is in general sparsely watered. The approach to the interior high plateau is marked by a series of irregular terraces. This intermediate mountain belt is covered with vegetation and water is fairly abundant. The plateau consists of well-watered, wide,
rolling plains, and low hills. In the east the high plateau falls away to the basins of the Congo and Zambezi, to the south it merges into a barren sandy desert. A large number of rivers make their way westward to the sea, the only two of any size being the Kwanza and the Kunene. The total area of Angola is 1,246,700 km² which is five times the size of the UK (Wikipedia 2006). This makes Angola the seventh largest country in territorial area in Africa.

Figure 4: Political map of Angola

Source: [www.nationsonline.org/oneworld/map/angola_map.htm](http://www.nationsonline.org/oneworld/map/angola_map.htm)
The most recent available information on the major ethno linguistic categories is from the 1960 census because the 1970 census did not capture ethno linguistic information.\textsuperscript{46} Most projections today are therefore made on numbers of the 1960 census, assuming that the rank order of the major ethno linguistic categories did not change (US Library of Congress 2006). All Angolan ethno linguistic categories belong to the Bantu family, except a small percentage of Europeans, and isolated bands of !Kung in the remote southeast. The largest ethnic group are the Ovimbundu, who speak Umbundu and who account for about 35 per cent of the population. They inhabit the Central High Plateau, including Huambo, have migrated to Benguela and Lobito cities and areas along the Benguela Railway to the west and east, and live in fairly large numbers in Luanda. The next largest ethnic group is the Mbundu (or Akwambundu), who speak Kimbundu and who make up about 20 per cent of the population. They dominate the capital city, Luanda, as well as the Malanje highlands and are well represented in most coastal towns. The Bakongo in the far north are the third largest group. They speak Kikongo and account for about 15 per cent of the population and are numerous in Luanda. People from the Lunda, Chokwe, and Ngangela ethnic groups live scattered through the thinly populated eastern part of the country, spilling over into the DRC and Zambia. The Ovambo and Herero peoples in the southwest also live in Namibia, while the closely related Nyaneka-Nkhumbi people are confined to Angola (Britannica 2006).

\textsuperscript{46} There has not been a complete population census since 1970.
5.3 A history marked by violent conflict

The recent European history began with the landing of the Portuguese in 1482 in what is now northern Angola, where they encountered the Kingdom of the Congo, which extended from modern Gabon in the north to the Kwanza River in the south. During the 16th century, the Portuguese gradually took control of the coastal strip by treaties and wars. The Dutch occupied Luanda in 1641 until Brazilian based Portuguese forces reconquered the city in 1648. Portugal's principal interest in Angola as early as in the 16th century was slavery. The first slaves were bought from African chiefs at the beginning of the 16th century to work on sugar plantations in São Tomé, Princípe, and Brazil. By the

47 Source: www.lib.utexas.edu/maps/angola.html; This map, dating from the colonial time, uses old place names such as Nova Lisboa which stands for today's Huambo city.
19th century, Angola was one of the largest sources of slaves not only for Brazil, but also for the Americas, including the United States. With the ban on Slavery, a massive forced labour system started to replace the Slavery system in Angola, to continue until this was also banned in 1961. It was this forced labour that provided the basis for the development of Angola’s plantation economy and mining sector in the north. Forced labour was also used to construct three railroads from the coast to the interior, combined with British financing, the most important of which was the Benguela railway (Caminho de Ferro de Benguela – CFB) that linked the port of Lobito with the copper zones of today’s northern Zambia and southern DRC (US Department of State 2006; Minter 1994: 17). The building of the railways also marked the beginning of full Portuguese administrative control of the interior in the context of the continent wide ‘scramble for Africa’ that initiated in the 1870s (Pakenham 1992). Colonial economic development, however, did not translate into social development for native Angolans. The Portuguese regime encouraged white immigration, especially after 1950, and as decolonisation took place elsewhere in Africa, Portugal, under the Salazar and Caetano dictatorships, rejected independence and treated its African colonies as overseas provinces (Bender 2004).

The independence struggle began in 1961 when about 200 Angolans attacked the São Paulo prison and other government institutions in Luanda. Ten days later an uprising in the northern coffee growing areas of Angola killed some 300-500 Europeans. The Portuguese reaction to both uprisings was swift and brutal. It is estimated that in retaliation operations some 30,000 to 50,000 Angolans were killed in the north alone (MacQueen 1997: 24). During the 1960s, three independence movements emerged and consolidated their positions: the Popular Movement for the Liberation of Angola (MPLA), with a base among Kimbundu and the mixed-race urban African elites of Luanda, with links to communist parties in Portugal and the East Bloc; the National Front for the Liberation of Angola (FNLA), led by Holden Roberto with an ethnic base in the Bakongo region of the north and links to the United States and the Mobutu regime in

---

48 During the ‘Scramble for Africa’, five rival nations, Germany, Italy, Portugal, France and Britain (plus one individual, Leopold II, King of the Belgians) sliced up Africa like a cake. While in 1880, most of Africa was still undiscovered beyond trading posts on the coasts and a few settler colonies such as Algeria and South Africa, less than thirty years later almost the whole of Africa (except Liberia and Ethiopia) was effectively occupied by European powers. Contributing to this startling ‘Scramble for Africa’ were a series of factors, such as English-French rivalries, the dream for El Dorado, diamond mines and gold fields, surplus capital in Europe, and a moral force in terminating the slave trade by Swahili and Arab traders in East Africa (Pakenham 1992).
Kinshasa (Zaire, now DRC); and the National Union for the Total Independence of Angola (UNITA), led by Jonas Savimbi with an ethnic and regional base in the Ovimbundu heartland in the centre of the country (Minter 1994: 18-19). Besides fighting the Portuguese however, the three movements soon engaged in open hostilities between each other (MacQueen 1997: 23).

On 25 April 1974, the Caetano regime in Portugal was toppled by the Revolution of the Carnations and the Armed Forces Movements (Movimento das Forças Armadas – MFA) became the new leadership, headed by General Spínola. At the time, Portugal had a troop strength of about 60,000 in Angola of which 40 per cent were African. The military situation however was very calm with none of the three liberation movements posing any serious threat to the colonial government, and the settler community of 300,000 was the strongest in Africa besides South Africa (MacQueen 1997: 161). The coup followed an initially calm period during which the new Portuguese leadership and the liberation movements prepared their positions for transition towards independence.

In January 1975, the Alvor talks for organized transition were held between the Portuguese Government and the three liberation movements. The agreement signed by all parties made provisions for a joint transitional government and general elections later in 1975. However, the transitional government never really worked and was dissolved in August the same year before independence was celebrated in November (MacQueen 1997: 176).

The lack of a managed transition led to a generalised civil war ravaging the country from September 1975 onwards, with the MPLA gaining ground. The rise of the Marxist MPLA however led to South African concerns, fearing that a hostile government in Luanda would support the South West African People’s Organization (SWAPO) in Namibia (controlled illegally by the South African regime), and also jeopardise South African investments in Angola. Based on this concern the South African Defence Force (SADF), together with MPLA opponents UNITA and FNLA, launched two strike forces in October the same year with the objective to reach Luanda and to topple the MPLA government. The invasion force, however, was repelled south of Luanda by the MPLA with the support of Cuban troops which had arrived in considerable numbers to assist their Marxist allies (Minter 1994: 20-21). On 11 November 1975 Angola became independent and in 1976, the Clark amendment endorsed by the US Congress prohibited
any further US support to UNITA, which until the early 1980s did not return to pose any real threat to the MPLA regime (Minter 1994: 32).

The FNLA was marginalised through military failures, internal divisions and abandonment by international supporters (Minter 1994: 28). From the mid 1980s onwards, however, the civil war intensified again between the MPLA and UNITA. In 1985, South Africa undertook a new invasion into the south of the country as a counter attack to a large-scale offensive by the MPLA government supported by 50,000 Cuban troops against UNITA (Human Rights Watch 1999: 31). The US subsequently renewed support to UNITA, providing some USD 250 million between 1986 and 1991, and by 1987 the civil war reached a new stage of magnitude with significant conventional battles (Minter 1994: 130-131). After a failed peace initiative facilitated by (then) Zairian President Mobutu Sese Seko, another peace initiative started in 1990, this time in Portugal with the participation of the US and the Soviet Union, this cooperation facilitated by the end of the Cold War. On 31 May 1991, a peace agreement was signed by the MPLA and UNITA, known as the **Bicesse Accords** (Perreira 1994: 14-17). Elections were to be held on September 1992 and the UN was asked to monitor the election process (Anstee 1996).

When it became clear that President dos Santos of the MPLA had won the presidential elections, Savimbi led UNITA back to war and it followed the bloodiest fighting ever experienced in Angola. It is estimated that more than 100,000 people died during this part of the civil war and some 3.7 million were in need of emergency assistance (Human Rights Watch 1994: 1). The shelling and aerial bombardments of cities, widespread use of land mines, and associated famine and displacement took an acute toll on the population. Provincial capitals such as Malanje, Huambo, Kuito and Luena sustained great infrastructural damage. Kuito, for example, was basically shot into rubble during a twelve month siege by UNITA. With UNITA losing ground and heavy diplomatic pressure on the MPLA, both sides signed a ceasefire protocol in Lusaka in November 1994. Although this **Lusaka Protocol** included a wide range of military and political provisions to pacify the country, neither side really demilitarised and from 1995 to 1998 Angola lived a phase of 'neither war nor peace' (Human Rights Watch 1999: 35-40).

---

49 Between May and October 1993 as many as 1,000 people were dying every day in Angola – more than in any other conflict in the world at the time (Vines 1998: 3).
UNITA's continuous violation of the Lusaka Protocol led to yet another outbreak of open hostilities in 1998. UNITA's conventional capacity however was soon destroyed and by 2000, the government recaptured all major cities previously held by Savimbi's forces. As a response UNITA was forced to return to guerrilla tactics which led to 'scorched earth' tactics by the MPLA government forces, driving hundreds of thousands of people into urban centres, emptying the countryside in order to weaken UNITA (Médecins sans Frontières 2004: 12).

On 22 February 2002 Savimbi was finally killed in combat and this opened the way for new peace talks. Two months later, the Angolan Government and UNITA signed the Luena Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), formalising the de facto ceasefire that began soon after Savimbi’s death. Through the MoU, UNITA recommitted to the 1994 Lusaka Protocol, returned all remaining territory to Angolan Government control, quartered its military personnel in predetermined locations, and relinquished all arms. In June 2002, the government declared that the task of assembling and disarming Angola’s former rebels had been completed (Porto and Parsons 2003: 22).

Summarising, this short overview of the armed conflict showed its magnitude in terms of losses in human lives and destruction of infrastructure, and gives an indication of its impact on the overall development and governance context in the country. It is further a major factor that accelerated the urban growth as discussed in the next section.

5.4 Urban development

This section provides a short overview of some general characteristics of urban growth and development in Angola. Chapters six and seven will provide a more detailed discussion in relation to urban growth and development of the two cities of Luanda and Huambo where the case studies are situated.

5.4.1 Urban growth

The first reliable demographic statistics date to the initial census in Angola which was undertaken in 1940 and was repeated in intervals of 10 years until 1970 with this latest census registering a population of 5,620,001 (Couto 2007). Since independence, there was no general population census undertaken in Angola, but some local censuses were conducted in the provinces of Luanda, Cabinda, Zaire and Namibe, the city of Lubango
and the municipalities of Uige and Negage (Sita 1990). Contemporary estimates suggest a total population in the country of approximately 15 million inhabitants (United Nations 2005). Contemporary demographic statistics are usually estimates on the basis of the 1970 census (applying average population growth rates) or, in the case of urban areas, derive from the use of alternative methods based on contemporary aerial and satellite imagery.

The unreliability of contemporary demographic statistics does, however, not inhibit one to grasp the magnitude of the extremely rapid urban growth that can be observed since the first census in 1940. Between 1940 and 2000, the population of Luanda for example probably multiplied by a factor of more than fifty. In the cases of Huambo and Namibe, the population has probably multiplied by a factor of twenty four during the same period, and in the case of Benguela by a factor of thirty three.

### Table 3: Urban growth of provincial capitals of Angola

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Luanda</th>
<th>Huambo</th>
<th>Namibe</th>
<th>Benguela</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1940</td>
<td>61,000</td>
<td>16,000</td>
<td>4,926</td>
<td>14,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>224,000</td>
<td>38,000</td>
<td>7,963</td>
<td>23,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>480,613</td>
<td>61,885</td>
<td>12,076</td>
<td>40,996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>738,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>923,263</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>1,138,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>59,508</td>
<td>219,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>90,000</td>
<td>225,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>1,538,779</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2,100,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>355,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>115,000</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>3,276,991</td>
<td>250,000</td>
<td>120,492</td>
<td>469,365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>390,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>4,500,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

50 These censuses were undertaken with the support of the United Nations Fund for Population Activities. Some other Censuses were also undertaken in other provinces, but the data has not been processed (Sita 1990).
51 Estimated at 6.8 in 2005 (United Nations 2005)
52 Apart from the number dating from 2003 and 2007, all data is cited from different sources in: MINUA 2002: 28
53 Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 1
54 DW and CEHS 2005: 73
Most urban growth has been unregulated expansion at the periphery of cities, leading to large and still growing informal settlements around an older urban core. With the end of the war in 2002, many decision makers in Angola believed urban growth could be inverted, however, due to a very young population and high fertility rates, cities continue to expand rapidly (DW and CEHS 2005). These extremely high growth rates have an important relation to the three dimensions of sustainability as discussed in the following sub-section.

5.4.2 Sustainability of urban development

Cities in Angola have very high levels of poverty and also social exclusion, with large proportions of the population living in informal settlements without any or with very low, levels of basic service provision. It is estimated that well over 50 per cent of Angola’s population now live in urban centres and of those more than 80 per cent in peri-urban areas (IRIN 2003). In the Human Development Index for example Angola is ranked 160th, at the very bottom of world tables, providing an indicator of the very high levels of poverty (United Nations 2005). Peri-urban (and rural areas) are characterised by low adult literacy rates, low primary school enrolment, low life expectancy (40.8 years) and a high under five mortality rate (260) (United Nations 2005). Another indicator related to poverty and social exclusion is the informality of housing in peri-urban areas. Recent research found that in Luanda for example, almost 80 per cent of respondents in peri-urban areas obtained their land in the informal market (these including purchase, rent, occupation or family transfers) and do not possess formal land rights documents (DW and CEHS 2005: 108).

The economic aspect of urban development in Angola must be seen in the wider national context. Soon after the war, Angola was able to show very favourable macro-economic indicators, such as one of the highest GDP growth rates worldwide, estimated at 20.5 per cent in 2005 (Aguilar 2006: 3). This new macro-economic stability and prosperity is due to the new political stability and related to international developments such as the

55 A more detailed assessment of demographic tendencies and characteristics in Luanda and Huambo will be discussed below in chapters six and seven.

56 Similarly, research implemented three years earlier to the DW and CEHS study also found that out of 194 respondents in peri-urban Luanda, none had a formal land rights document (MINUA 2002: 56).
increase of oil prices, Angola being the second biggest crude oil exporter in Africa after Nigeria (IRIN 2006).\textsuperscript{57}

While international donor funding has never been as important for the Angolan economy\textsuperscript{58} nor do international donors directly contribute to the annual state budget, international donor involvement has become even more marginalised since the end of the war with the Angolan government accessing new sources of financing through bilateral agreements especially with China, but also with Brazil and Portugal.\textsuperscript{59} These new sources have also lessened the importance of agreements with the international financing institutions (Aguilar 2006: 21) such as the IMF which have been in a conflicting relationship with the Angolan government for some time, mainly about issues on transparency but also different opinions on macro-economic policy (EIU 2004: 16). It can be argued that the Presidency as well as many within the MPLA are firmly supporting spending on major infrastructure projects because they have the opportunities to profit personally (EIU 2004: 16).\textsuperscript{60}

The oil related growth in Angola and the infrastructure rehabilitation that is being financed by it also has an important effect on private investments, to a certain degree ‘triggering’ or making feasible new investments in Angola’s provinces and hinterland (Aguilar 2006: 12). In general, Angola’s newly gained political and economic stability allowed considerable growth in the domestic non-oil economy, such as agriculture, construction and services, albeit from a minimal base-line. This is considered a most important process with the potential to create employment opportunities and significantly contributing to poverty reduction as well as much needed diversification of the national economy (Aguilar 2006: 4).

The formal sector, however, is not able to provide employment to a significant percentage of the population which has to engage in informal sector economic activities in order to

\textsuperscript{57} By 2006, Angola produced more than 1.4 million barrels per day (Aguilar 2006: 3).

\textsuperscript{58} This compared to countries such as Mozambique for example where international donor funding contributes with a significant percentage of the annual state budget.

\textsuperscript{59} The 2005 annual state budget revenues only declared 0.8% as donations, while the bulk is from incomes from the oil and non-oil sector (80.1% and 15.6% respectively) (Aguilar 2006: 8).

\textsuperscript{60} As discussed below, the governance context in Angola is strongly marked by this macro-economic policy where oil-backed credit lines especially from China are directly managed by the Presidency and not by the Angolan government.
secure their livelihoods.\textsuperscript{61} Recent research for example indicates that more than 84 per cent of households in Luanda and around 77 per cent in Huambo had one or more adult family member with a micro or small enterprise of which most are in the informal sector. Projections to the overall enterprises in this sector indicate a total of more than half a million enterprises in Luanda and around 150,000 in Huambo. The estimates further suggest that the sector absorbs an estimated 700,000 persons in Luanda and about 170,000 in Huambo (DW 2006: 9-10).

Overall, the above mentioned information suggests that formal economic development is un-sustainable in the sense that it is not sufficient to provide employment and to alleviate poverty of the rapidly growing population. This is therefore a similar situation that has been described in the case of Johannesburg, but is much more accentuated in the case of Angolan cities, this also being looked at in some greater detail in the respective sections about the two case study cities Luanda and Huambo.

Cities in Angola also face a range of environmental challenges. One primary concern is the extremely high level of public health hazards due to contamination of the environment through solid and liquid waste, insufficient drainage and a lack of access to clean water. The dangers of this contamination have become very visible in the cholera outbreak in several Angolan cities in 2006/7, having affected more than 73,000 individuals until early 2007 and having killed almost 3,000 (Folha 8: 3/3/2007). Open sewers and stagnant waters are further contributing to a high risk of malaria. Overall, Angolan cities and especially the musseques\textsuperscript{62} of Luanda can therefore be considered environmental high risk areas for human habitation.

Summarising, this section indicated the huge challenges that Angolan cities face by extremely rapid urban growth contributing to already very high levels of social exclusion and poverty, a population largely depending on the informal economic sector and increasing environmental challenges especially in informal settlements. The next section

\textsuperscript{61} Informal economy here refers to a set of activities (trading, production or services) conducted as subsistence activities by the urban and peri-urban population in the parallel economy of Angola. In reality however it is very difficult to draw a clear line between what is formal and what is informal, as many ‘informal’ agents may in fact fulfil all or some requirements necessary to be declared legal of formal (DW 2006a).

\textsuperscript{62} Musseque is a term used for the informal settlements in Luanda. In the local language Kimbundu, musseque is the word for the arid red sandy soil that dominates the higher plateau area of Luanda.
now looks at the governance context in Angola, intrinsically linked to the development of Angolan cities.

5.5 The governance context

5.5.1 Angolan ‘realpolitik’ from 1975 to present

The Portuguese left behind a tightly centralised administrative system and a repressive political climate. There were no legal opposition parties, no independent press nor judiciary and no public experience of political dissent (Hodges 2001: 44). There was a brief period of pluralism and popular political mobilisation and community participation during the collapse of the colonial regime in 1974/1975, but the ruling MPLA regime quickly adopted a Stalinist political model that was superimposed on the authoritarian political system inherited from the Portuguese. The security forces were built up with Eastern Bloc assistance, and a command economy was established. The organs of the state were declared to be under supreme guidance of the MPLA party and the party’s structures were to have primacy over those of the state (Hodges 2001: 45; Sommerville 1986: 106). However, factional infighting within the MPLA continued after independence and led to a coup attempt in May 1977 (by the then Minister of Internal Administration, Nito Alves) which was put down with extreme violence by the MPLA (Birmingham 1977). At its first ordinary congress in December 1977 the party then formally changed its name to MPLA-Workers Party (MPLA-Partido de Trabalho - MPLA-PT) and adopted Marxism-Leninism as its formal guiding ideology (Sommerville 1986: 84).

Angola’s first president Agostinho Neto died in 1979 and José Eduardo dos Santos followed as his successor. Dos Santos also became head of the party, whose leading bodies were the 90 member Central Committee (75 full and 15 alternate members) and the 13 member Political Bureau (11 full and two alternate members), to which the Council of Ministers was formally subordinate. Under dos Santos, the party became a small and tightly knit organization which also controlled several mass organizations, including the National Worker’s Union (União Nacional dos Trabalhadores de Angola - UNTA), the Angolan Women’s Organization (Organização das Mulheres de Angola - OMA), the Youth MPLA (Juventude do MPLA - J-MPLA) and a pioneer organization for children (Organização dos Pioneiros de Angola - OPA) (EIU 2004: 5). There was no

---

63 The only experience of political dissent was the one of the liberation movements.
parliament until 1980, when for the first time the party held internal elections for the constitution of provincial assemblies and a national People’s Assembly. Both bodies had a three year term of office, but the elections due in 1983 were postponed until 1986 because of the difficult internal security situation. The People’s Assembly however met rarely and had few powers (Hodges 2001: 47).

Although the Political Bureau did act as a collective leadership, increasing powers were vested in the Presidency. This was mainly due to an attempt to ensure strong leadership needed to cope with the UNITA and South African aggressions. The security problems had also increased the influence of the armed forces in the political system (Hodges 2001: 48). In 1982, in order to further strengthen the President’s position, the Central Committee decided to entrust President dos Santos with emergency powers. This decision was followed in July 1983 by a decree enabling the President to appoint regional military councils to administer those parts of the country which were directly affected by the war. These councils, which were answerable directly to the Presidency, had sweeping powers (Hodges 2001: 49). Subsequently in 1984 a Defence and Security Council was set up, chaired by President dos Santos and composed of the top political and military leaders, becoming the most powerful organ of government (Hodges 2001: 49). By the beginning of the 1990s it has been observed that the real centres of power have ceased to be the party itself, its Central Committee or even its Political Bureau, but have also not passed to the government which was still without any real autonomy. Rather, as Messiant (1992: 21) observed:

“While the military have entered in high numbers into the party-State structures, power has progressively concentrated around the Presidency, and the President has been able, although lacking any other social base than the party-State, to impose himself by playing between the various party-State factions.”

After the party’s formal abandonment of Marxism-Leninism at its third congress in December 1990, a constitutional revision law was enacted in May 1991 (law 12/91), coinciding with the Bicesse Accords (Hodges 2001: 50). 64 The law proclaimed a democratic state based on the rule of law, respect for human rights and guaranteeing

64 A second constitutional revision law was enacted in September 1992, bringing additional changes such as provisions for decentralisation and local government (Hodges 2001: 51).
freedom of expression, assembly, demonstration and association (EIU 1994: 8). It also introduced a multi-party political system and within a very short time, numerous new parties came into being along with many national non-governmental organizations, community groups and professional associations. An important aspect of the constitutional changes in 1991-92, however, is that they confirmed the concentration of power in the Presidency, formally ending the leading role of the party (Hodges 2001: 51). Under the new constitution, the government (Council of Ministers) became accountable to both the head of state and the National Assembly while the President chaired the meetings of the Council of Ministers, acting as the effective head of government. He also remained commander-in-chief of the armed forces and appointed the provincial governors.

The executive role of the President means that there is a high degree of presidential intervention in the daily management of state affairs. In 2005, the Presidency’s Military Office for example, through its Office for National Reconstruction (Gabinete de Reconstrução Nacional – GRN), effectively became an extended arm of the Presidency in the post-war reconstruction efforts. Of note for urban affairs in Angola, the USD 3 billion credit from the Chinese EximBank, secured in 2005, came under control by this office, rather than the Ministry of Public Works and the Ministry of Urbanism and Environment. The GRN’s management of this credit line in fact gave the presidency direct control over part of the state’s oil revenues, showing how the Angolan governance system at its highest level is intrinsically linked with the oil based economy and provides it with the financial resources to maintain or even strengthen its power. This development is further an indicator for the fact that ministries often play only a junior role in affairs of the state and are subservient to the real centre of power at the Presidency (Hodges 2001: 52; EIU 1994: 7).

The role of the GRN and the power of the Presidency in general also have a fundamental influence on urban governance and related decision-making processes, as the GRN over the last two years initiated huge housing and infrastructure programmes without consultation or control by the government, not to speak of consultation with local

---

65 The Presidency is formally divided into the Secretariat, the Civil Office (Casa Civil) and the Military Office (Casa Militar), each led by presidential advisors.
government or civil society. As the discussion in chapters six and seven shows, these GRN led programmes are not addressing important urban development challenges as identified in this chapter and use an approach which is not sustainable in many aspects, rather addressing the needs of the upper class than those of the poor and marginalised.

In spite, however, of these dynamics of centralising power in the Presidency and the country’s political elite, the political opening after 1991 allowed the formation of civil society organizations as discussed in the next subsection.

5.5.2 Nascent civil society

Before the introduction of multiparty democracy, civil society organizations were not permitted in Angola. Only the new constitution in 1991 in its Article 32 and the law of associations adopted in the same year provided the necessary legal framework for the creation of different forms of organizations within civil society. Over the following years, NGOs, local associations, professional associations, church groups and other forms of social organization emerged, and, together with the developing private media, these organizations engaged with society and the state on issues such as peace-building, human rights, freedom of speech, provision of basic services, good governance and HIV/AIDS.

Most of the Angolan NGOs have their roots in the urban professional and intellectual circles, although many have started to link up with community associations in peri-urban areas (Cain 2002: 1). Until 2001, more than 300 Angolan NGOs had sprung up of which half of them were active in Luanda (Howan 2001: 31). During the war, most of the NGOs were involved in emergency assistance, rural development and rehabilitation (Howan 2001: 31). While there developed a few big and resourceful Angolan NGOs with a presence in more than one province, most of the national NGOs however remained rather small and after the ceasefire in 2002, many were struggling with the change from emergency to development, also suffering from the effects of fragmented and short term funding (World Bank 2006: 42).

66 The process and impact of GRN led housing and infrastructure projects is discussed in more detail in the case studies of Luanda and Huambo in chapters six and seven.

67 In general, the legislation however is rather complex, making it difficult for example for smaller CBOs to register (World Bank 2006: 36).
Only a few Angolan NGOs are engaged in land and related development issues. ADRA (Acção para o Desenvolvimento Rural e Ambiente – Action for Rural Development and Environment) for example is the biggest Angolan NGO with a presence in several provinces and has a focus on rural development, including land issues. ALSSA (Associação ‘Leonardo Sikufinde-Shalom Angola’ – Association ‘Leonardo Sikufinde-Shalom Angola) is another NGO located in Huila province, having been very active in defending land rights of the local indigenous population against commercial farmers (Weber 2000). SOS-Habitat is another very vocal NGO active in Luanda, especially defending inhabitants of informal settlements against forced evictions. 68 Development Workshop Angola is the only NGO in Angola with a specific focus on urban land and urban planning, working in a collaborative role with central and provincial governments in Luanda and Huambo. These Angolan NGOs are in many cases receiving funding or are collaborating with international NGOs and donor agencies such as the Food and Agriculture Organization of the UN (FAO) in the case of rural land issues, or United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the European Commission in the context of decentralisation projects, where municipal planning is a key issue.

There are still relatively few community based organizations (CBOs) existing in Angola, one reason being the decades of war that brought many social structures of Angolan society to the point of collapse (Sogge 1992: 105-106). Recent research also showed that due to poverty and often non-existent state administration, the creation of sustainable social community organizations is very difficult and only beginning to emerge (Robson 1999: 16). The creation of many CBOs is linked to the interventions of national and international NGOs, which facilitate the development of CBOs in order to reinforce and increase sustainability of the NGOs’ development assistance activities. In this context for instance, CBOs are engaged in management of water, sanitation and education infrastructure, implementation of civic education activities, micro-credit groups or community publishing (DW 2005a). In terms of land and urban development, anecdotal evidence suggests that there now exist some CBOs in peri-urban areas that are leading the resistance against forced evictions or other threats to the rights of land of their constituency. 69 In these activities it seems that they seek support either from local NGOs or those government entities that are potentially favourable to their cause.

68 Some of the activities of SOS-Habitat are discussed in greater detail in chapter six.
69 One example of a local CBO that struggled for land access and against forced evictions in peri-urban Huambo is discussed in chapter seven.
Churches are traditionally a strong force in Angola. Their contribution to the development of the country dates back to the late 19th century when many protestant missionaries settled in different parts of the country. In addition to religious evangelism many of these missions promoted literacy, improved agricultural techniques, provided professional training and were close to the people in general (Chikueka 1999). The powerful Catholic Church, however, played a much less progressive role and was closely allied to the state (Howen 2001: 29). After independence, churches were restrained but not prohibited by the Marxist government. After the democratic opening in 1991 and the subsequent outbreak of war in 1992 and again in 1998, the different churches took an increasingly important role in leading the peace movement. While initially the protestant and catholic churches launched their independent initiatives (Schubert 1997b: 10), they came together to found an ecumenical movement in 2000 (Howan 2001: 30). With the end of the war in 2002 however, the leverage of this movement decreased rapidly.  

In many peri-urban areas (as well as rural), the churches play a very important role through providing invaluable social assistance to the needy (DW 2003). Pastors and laymen often work closely with the local authorities because they provide essential physical infrastructure and human resources especially in the health and education sector. A recent survey about local governance structures and service provision in nine neighbourhoods of peri-urban Huambo showed the important role that the churches continue to play on the community level. In all surveyed areas, the churches are providing health and education services, clothing and food for the most needy, undertake prison visits, support the traditional authorities in administrative tasks, facilitate the resolution of certain types of conflicts and have a very important role in terms of reconciliation between returning UNITA ex-combatants and residents (DW 2003).

There is, however, no contemporary evidence that suggests that churches are directly involved in urban development issues. On the contrary the Catholic Church has received some negative publicity through their involvement in forced evictions from land that is

---

70 While in the same period there was an upsurge of Pentecostalist churches in Angola (as elsewhere in Africa), these churches did not participate in this ecumenic movement.

71 On the other hand, there is some evidence of rural mission stations assisting their constituency in land conflicts. In Huila province for example, Qihita Mission station has provided fundamental assistance to the local population in defending their land rights against commercial farmers (Weber 2000: 1).
claimed by the church in Kilamba Kiaxi Municipality in Luanda (Amnesty International 2006).

Networks have been created by several NGOs with the aim to join resources and to increase their advocacy leverage. Some of the most successful networks are the Forum of Angolan NGOs (FONGA), Jubilee 2000 for debt relief and the Women’s Network. In 2002, following the government’s intention to revise land legislation, several national and international NGOs and associations set up the Land Network (‘Rede Terra’) which played an important advocacy role during the land law consultation process, but rather quickly lost significance thereafter.\(^\text{72}\)

There are two other important actors in urban development, these being ‘traditional’ authorities and resident commissions which both arguably are part of the local administrative system but at the same time derive some of their legitimacy from local society and are therefore discussed in this section.

‘Traditional’ authorities\(^\text{73}\), today mostly referred to as ‘sobas’, have their origins in the pre-colonial time when most of Angola was ruled by different kingdoms. The Portuguese used a system of indirect rule, integrating lower levels of traditional authority into the colonial administrative apparatus. The post-independence government adopted this system and traditional authorities in contemporary Angola do have an important role in the local administration of rural and many peri-urban areas. The contemporary state delegates administrative functions to traditional authorities that exist at three hierarchic levels, these being soba grande (‘big’ sobas), soba and sekulus (elders). There are also a few kings existing in accordance to the pre-colonial kingdoms, but they only have symbolic power and are not integrated into the state administration. According to official data the state paid subsidies to 37,930 traditional authorities in 1998 (UNDP 2003: 53). Traditional authority can be considered non-democratic because its leaders are not elected. However, there are local mechanisms that to a certain degree can regulate abuses or non-compliance with duties assigned to the sobas, for example through collective

\(^{72}\) Interview with Moises Festo, 2/6/06. The land law consultation process is examined in more detail in the following section.

\(^{73}\) These authorities are usually referred to as ‘traditional’ authority, but as the discussion shows, the description ‘traditional’ is not very adequate as these authorities are effectively part of the local administrative system. In the absence of an adequate alternative description, the term ‘traditional’ however will be used throughout the thesis.
action of residents or the involvement of other local authorities such as communal administrators.

**Resident commissions** are a distinct local associational form which is found in Luanda, created by the state and representing residents of an area at the bairro level. They are supposed to be autonomous, although in reality local administrations strongly influence the way they operate, this fact giving the commissions a rather ambiguous function. 74 Resident commissions do have responsibilities for supporting basic service provision in their areas and also help resolve conflicts about land. However, they have no resources available and their capacity to provide support is limited (Cain et.al. 2002). The commissions have a history going back to the pre-independence period when they were part of the MPLA popular mobilisation movement (Sommerville 1986: 79). They lost importance after the 1977 Nito Alves Coup 75 but in 1983 the state made an effort to strengthen its authority down to the community level, creating new local administrative divisions and giving resident commissions the responsibility to organize community-level security through local militias (Cain et.al. 2002). There was no further attempt to make the commissions really representative until 1992, when the provincial government developed new regulations as part of the envisioned democratic reforms (GPL 1993), describing the role of resident representation. The regulation (GPL 1993: 5) specifically points out that:

"[...] the resident commissions are organs constituted by residents of high-rise buildings, blocks of high-rise buildings, blocks of houses, streets, sectors, communes or bairros, villages and municipalities. Their objective is the creation of conditions for a healthy living and social collaboration, focusing on the development of activities in the area of hygiene, maintenance of the communal patrimony, and implementation of cultural, sport, recreational and other activities."

Despite their ambiguous role, the commissions share a tradition of ‘reporting to the authorities’ more than representing their members or constituency. Many members of resident commissions consider themselves as channels of information ‘from the

74 Interview with Leonardo Samunga, 2/09/2005

75 Nito Alves, at the time Minister of Interior Administration, was responsible for the organization of the resident commissions until the 1977 coup.
government to the people', rather than the voice of the people to represent their interests to the government (Cain et.al. 2002). Although the resident commissions are weak and have a poorly developed sense of representation, they cannot be ignored. Potentially, they have an important role in planning and monitoring basic services, and they are argued to be the only viable structural option to guarantee sustainable basic service provision for the poor (Cain et.al. 2002).

Looking at the relationship between civil society organizations and the government of Angola, recent surveys point out a generally ambivalent relation with some of the mistrust from the government seeming to stem from civil society organizations suspected of engaging in party politics (World Bank 2005: 3-7; World Bank 2006a: 37). Overall however, a majority of civil society organizations seem to experience an improvement in their relationship with the government (World Bank 2006a: 37). Looking at specific cases on the local level, a recent evaluation report of several national and international NGO programmes argues that there has been considerable success in promoting dialogue between citizens and local government structures, especially if compared to the low levels of dialogue that existed some five years ago (World Bank 2006b: 29). The same report however points out that in parallel with expanding spaces for dialogue, progress in terms of the impact of this dialogue on local development tends to be much slower. This is partly attributed to the lack of fiscal decentralisation and human resources which gives local administrations very little room for manoeuvre (World Bank 2006b: 29-30). There seems therefore a certain willingness of local administrations to cooperate with local civil society, but at the same time this willingness is severely limited due to the lack of resources and capacities for promoting development which would follow the dialogue.

Summarising the governance context of Angola, the following key aspects can thus be identified.

Angolan ‘realpolitik’ as it has developed since independence was profoundly influenced by the war and foreign involvement in the Cold War context. These influences, together with local Angolan political and personal ambitions, led towards a contemporary governance context that is characterised by very strong presidential power which is exercised through a network that operates in parallel to the official state structures, such as ministries, provincial and local administrations. In terms of urban development, one of the most important branches of this network is the Office for National Reconstruction.
(GRN) which is based in the Presidency’s Military Office and headed by a general. Civil society, which has emerged after the democratic opening in 1991, is still very weak, especially in provincial urban centres and in peri-urban areas in general. While in Luanda there are a respectable number of NGOs working with CBOs in peri-urban areas, there are still few Angolan NGOs working in provincial towns. In these circumstances, resident commissions and traditional authorities do arguably have an important role in representing the interests of local communities, in spite of their limited accountability and non-democratic characteristics. The increasingly important role of provincial and local governments in the Angolan governance context is discussed in the next section.

The following section now looks at legislation that frames the interaction of state and civil society in general and urban planning specifically.

5.6 Governance and planning – legislation and spaces for participation

This section examines three different sets of legislation that are especially important in framing urban governance and planning in Angola. These are the legislation about decentralisation, the territorial planning legislation and the land legislation.

5.6.1 Decentralisation

The 1977 constitution already considered aspects of decentralisation, making provisions for elected sub-national government (UNDP 2003: 17). It enshrined the notion of ‘autarquias’, referring to elected local government with administrative and financial autonomy (World Bank 2006a: 9). Subsequent legislation however contradicted these constitutional concepts and over the coming years there was little consistency between constitutional principles of decentralised government and legislation and administrative practice (UNDP 2003: 4). Angola opted for a Marxist-Leninist model with a unitary state and in terms of government structure this meant that there was no formal separation between the different levels of government, each level simply representing an administrative division of the superior level (Brakarz and Rodrigues 1999: 3).  

76 The notion of ‘autarquias’ was already introduced by the Portuguese, allowing provincial governments to introduce them as appropriate. The original meaning of ‘autarquias’ is autonomous people’s governance (World Bank 2006a: 9).

77 In 1981 a new law (Law 7/81) institutionalised public administration at the provincial, municipal and communal levels. Another law was to be created for the regularisation of administrative entities below the
Before 1991 therefore, provincial government and local administrations were structured as follows.

**Provincial commissioners** were appointed by the president and they in turn appointed the municipal and communal commissioners. Ministerial representations on the provincial levels were the provincial delegations (or departments). Each ministry had a delegation on the provincial level, headed by a provincial delegate directly nominated by its respective minister. The provincial delegations were hierarchically subordinated to the respective ministries and methodologically subordinated to the provincial government. Provincial delegations represented de-concentrated structures of central government, designated to implement activities of central government in the provinces (Brakarz and Rodrigues 1991: 3). On the municipal level, municipal commissions were decentralised units of the provincial government, with a similar structure, albeit simpler and reduced. Legally, municipal commissions could establish municipal assemblies, in practice however, this only happened in a few municipalities (Brakarz and Rodrigues 1991: 3). This existing administrative system before democratisation in 1991 has been characterised as containing unclear definitions of functions on the different government and administrative levels. It has also been observed that legislation in fact did attribute representative responsibilities to provincial governments, but that those in turn were not receiving the necessary resources to take these on (Brakarz and Rodrigues 1991: 8).

Similar to the 1977 constitution, the **1992 constitution** defined decentralisation to take place through the creation of ‘autarquias’. The Lusaka protocol reinforced this process by stating that national reconciliation implies that the country’s administration should be effectively decentralised and that "[...] the provincial authorities have power in their own administrative, financial, fiscal and economic area, encompassing the capacity to attract foreign investment.” (UNDP 2003: 10) From 1994 until 1998, however, little was done in practice in terms of decentralisation.

---

communal level, but this was never done (UNDP 2003: 17). In 1989 the administrative entity of the commune ceased to be part of the local administration only to be instituted again in 1999. Bairros and other de facto administrative entities however never received institutional framing (UNDP 2003: 17).

78 Provincial commissioners were the equivalent of today’s provincial governors and municipal and communal commissioners the equivalent of today’s municipal and communal administrators. Until 1991, each province further held a popular assembly (assembleia popular) with the function of supervising and accompanying the management of the province (World Bank 2006a: 27).
Only in 1999 was a first law on de-concentration and decentralisation approved and became effective. This was Decree Law 17/99 which introduced significant change especially for provincial governments. Under the new law, former provincial delegations of central ministries were transformed into provincial departments with the governor appointing provincial directors. The only three central government delegations to remain were from the ministries of finance, interior and justice, where provincial delegates were appointed by MAT upon consultation with the line ministry. These changes brought decentralisation in favour of provincial government power but not that of municipal administrations, and continued as a system based entirely on the nomination of officials from above (UNCDF and UNDP 2006). Decree Law 17/99 further introduced some, albeit rather limited spaces of participation on the communal, municipal and provincial level in the form of Consultative Councils (Concelhos Consultivos).

In these councils, the governor or municipal administrator may, if he or she considers necessary, invite individuals or institutions not belonging to the administration (Articles 11 and 39), this implicitly allowing the participation of civil society organizations, but always depending on the invitation by the governor or administrator. Anecdotal evidence suggests that there were only very few cases were civil society was able to participate in these councils. But the difficulties in implementing Decree Law 17/99 were not confined to the consultative councils.

Three years after Decree Law 17/99 became effective, a UNDP survey observed that most of the newly created structures on the provincial, municipal and communal level were not operational in reality, also noting that the reform process initiated by Decree Law 17/99 was weakly monitored and accompanied by central government (UNDP 2003: 23-28). An excessive concentration of core staff at the provincial government level was also registered. In 2002, 79 per cent of all local administrative staff worked for provincial governments, another 19 per cent for municipal administrations and only 1 per cent for communal administrations. In addition, more than 80 per cent of municipal and communal staff was administrative and auxiliary personnel (UNDP 2003: 37). Local administrations were therefore largely often empty structures in terms of human, material and financial resources. As a result, the established structure created through Decree Law 17/99 did not adjust itself to local development priorities, population sizes or territorial dimensions (UNDP 2003: 22).
In 2001 the government published the ‘Strategy for De-concentration and Decentralisation’, introducing the key concepts of de-concentration and decentralisation in Angola, including the policies of ‘gradualism’ and pilot ‘autarquias’. Gradualism refers to the approach that will introduce decentralisation in Angola gradually, initially through pilot municipalities. Forty one pilot municipalities were subsequently defined in the government’s biannual programme 2005/06 (PAR 2006: 27). While decentralisation would be introduced gradually, a parallel process of de-concentration was to be implemented on the national level.79

In 2007, a new law was published for regulating the process of de-concentration. Decree Law 2/07, replacing Decree Law 17/99, establishes the structure, function and responsibilities of provincial governments and municipal and communal administrations (Governo de Angola 2007). This new law introduces some important changes to further the process of de-concentration, not defining however a framework for decentralised ‘autarquias’.80

The most important aspect of the new law in terms of widening the space of participation is the fact that it introduces the creation of Social Consultation and Liaison Councils (Concelhos de Auscultação e Concertação Social) to exist at provincial, municipal and communal level (Articles 21, 53, 75). These councils replace the previous Consultation Councils (Conselhos Consultivos) of Decree Law 17/99, with the aim of providing a more participatory mechanism. While in Decree Law 17/99 it was up to the governor or the respective administrators to decide whether the council admits members from civil society or any other non-state actor, the new law defines that representatives from traditional authorities, business sector, farmers associations, churches and NGOs are to be permanent members of the new form of Council.81 The Councils are to meet every three months on all three levels and are chaired by the governor at the provincial level and by the respective administrator on the municipal and communal levels. However, the councils are for consultation only and do not have decision-making power. In terms of

---

79 Again as in the case of Brazil and South Africa, the term ‘decentralisation’ as used in the literature consulted for this chapter reflects characteristics of what in chapter two has been described as ‘devolution’.

80 The lack of a legal framework for ‘autarquias’ means that there is to date also no clear understanding of how resources will be attributed to or generated by these sub-national governments. As discussed below, there is a similar lack of fiscal regulation for deconcentrated governments.

81 On the provincial level, the council also includes representatives from Syndicates (Article 21).
urban planning, it is important to note that the law defines that the Social Consultation and Liaison Councils have the responsibility to approve provincial and municipal development programmes (Articles 21 and 53), but not physical plans.

The new law is also more explicit about the responsibilities of provincial government and local administrations in terms of urban planning, development and housing. On the provincial level, Article 11 provides nine specific areas of responsibility to the provincial government in terms of urban development and land use management, among which are the responsibility to elaborate a proposal for a provincial land use management plan. Also, the new law confers urban development, planning and housing as the responsibility of the Vice-Governor for Social Affairs (Article 19). On the municipal level, the administration also has been allocated some responsibilities in terms of urban development and land use management (Article 43) which were not present in Decree Law 17/99. These include the authority to pass concession licences for land parcels not superior to one thousand square metres. On the other hand, the municipality is no longer responsible for the elaboration of a municipal master plan (as defined in Decree Law 17/99, article 30), but only for its approval and subsequent submission to the provincial government.

In general, the law provides for a much less rigid structure for the organization of municipal administrations, specifically indicating that excessive horizontal and vertical segmentation must be avoided and that municipalities can adopt different models of internal organization, depending on the local context and priorities (Article 64). While Decree Law 17/99 did not specify any aspects of financial de-concentration, the new law identifies provincial governments and those municipal administrations gradually being identified by MAT as budgetary units (Article 82). Such local authorities identified as budgetary units can generate their own revenues through taxes (Article 83). The law

---

82 Interestingly, the provincial government seems also to lose its decision-making authority for nominating municipal and communal administrators. While decree law 17/99 the governor could declare and dismiss municipal and communal administrators (Article 7, line c), the new law gives the governor only the power to propose to MAT the municipal and communal administrators (Article 17, line d).

83 The law however does not specify who is meant to prepare the master plans.

84 The taxes which local authorities are allowed to impose are listed in the law in the same Article. It does not include a tax on land.

Also, as Decree-law 2/07 has only just been approved and the relevant legislation on financial de-concentration and decentralisation has not been drafted yet, most of the financial resources for provincial
also says that provincial governments and municipal and communal administrations must promote public-private partnerships with the business sector, cooperatives and NGOs in order to improve the efficiency, quality and quantity of service provision (Article 87).

Beside this new law on de-concentration, the recently approved Territorial Planning Law also provides for some space of participation as discussed now in the following section.

5.6.2 Territorial Planning Law 3/04 and Regulations

The first law specifically regulating urban planning in Angola is the recently approved Territorial Planning Law (Lei do Ordenamento do Território e do Urbanismo - Law 3/04) (Governo de Angola 2004a). This law was elaborated in parallel with the Land Law but did not go through a public participation process as was the case with the latter. The Territorial Planning Law applies to rural and urban areas, but with a special focus on urban planning. The law defines physical plans as main instrument for territorial management, identifying following categories of plans:

- National and regional physical plans
- Provincial physical plans
- Physical plans
- Municipal plans
- Urban plans

Within the category of urban plans, the law identifies four specific plans (Governo de Angola 2004a: Article 31):

1. Urban Master plans
2. Urbanisation Plan
3. Detailed plan
4. Special recuperation or upgrading plan, with a focus on deteriorated or illegal land occupation

Governments and local administrations are still provided by the national government’s annual budget. Being a key issue related to effective de-concentration and decentralisation as taking place in Angola, the coming years will show whether the ‘autarquias’ and local government in general will be attributed (and also generate themselves) the necessary financial resources in order to comply with their increasing responsibilities.

This consultation processes is discussed in more detail in the following subsection.
Several articles refer to some, albeit limited, participation in planning processes.

Article 21 sets out an arguably rather broad and unspecific principle of participation. It says that “The series of processes for the development, implementation and revision of land use plans should include mechanisms which contribute to the reinforcement of civic values of citizens in relation to the causes of the effects on living conditions [...] as well as the right to information and the right to participation.”

Article 43 describes the composition of a participatory organ which is the National Consultative Commission for Territorial Planning and Urbanisation (Comissão Consultiva Nacional do Ordenamento do Território e do Urbanismo). This commission consists of representatives of relevant ministries, sub-national governments and the National Social Consultation and Liaison Council. The same organ is also to be established on the provincial level. The participation of the National Social Consultation and Liaison Council (where civil society organizations are permanent members) in the Consultative Commission for Territorial Planning and Urbanisation, means that civil society organizations are part of the Consultative Commission for Territorial Planning. However, the Consultative Commission is an organ for consultation and not decision-making.

Article 53 refers to the right of access to information about the content of territorial plans. It says that “Individuals have the right to information on the content, and any alterations to physical plans both in their development phase as well as through their dissemination prior to approval and after approval, being able to consult the relevant process and obtain copies and documents of the plans.”

Article 57 refers to participatory mechanisms in the absence of Provincial Consultative Commissions. It states that “Until the Provincial Consultative Commissions exist, the evaluation of plans can be undertaken by the participation of citizens and social partners in the province in working debates with the technical institutions presenting the plan to the Provincial Governor.”

---

86 See the discussion above about Decree Law 2/07.
Although the law provides some space for participation as identified above, it has been critiqued because it promotes a very passive form of participation where civil society and private sector actors need to initiate the contact. It is argued that in these conditions probably only a few and strong lobby groups would take the initiative and not a broader segment of civil society or even citizens. Also, by using this passive approach, planning processes can go unnoticed by the public (Jenkins and Smith 2004). It has therefore been suggested that this aspect of engagement with civil society should be explicitly mentioned in the regulations that were to follow the approval of the law (Jenkins and Smith 2004). One specific suggestion pointed out that government on the national and provincial level should identify key actors within civil society and the private sector, creating a core membership of the consultative commission and inform these members routinely on urban plans (Jenkins and Smith 2004).

The planning law envisages six different subordinate regulations (Governo de Angola 2004a: Article 68). Three of the six regulations have been approved (but not published and therefore not effective) by August 2007 these being: 87

1. The Regulation of Land Allocation (Regulamento Geral dos Loteamentos);
2. The Regulation of Urban Buildings (Regulamento Geral das Edificações Urbanas);
3. The Regulation of Construction and Building Licenses (Regulamento do Licenciamento de Obras e Construções).

The remaining three regulations to be elaborated and approved are:

1. The Regulation of Urban Plans and Rural Planning (Regulamento dos Planos Urbanísticos e do Ordenamento Rural);
2. The Regulation for defining Urban Perimeters and the Concession of City Tax Bases (Regulamento que fixa os Perímetros Urbanos e Concessão de Forais de Cidades);

87 The elaboration of these regulations did not undergo a public participation process.
In the current situation, there is therefore a broad legal framework through Law 3/04 but as yet no regulation that would specify some of the still rather vague aspects of the law. As will be highlighted in the case studies in chapters six and seven, there is also no technical and administrative capacity for implementing the new, still developing, legal framework.

5.6.3 Land Law 9/04 and Regulation

This subsection discusses a third set of legislation with importance for urban planning and development, this being the recently approved Land Law 9/04 and its regulation. While the 1975 constitution established the overall right of the state to land that could subsequently be transferred to individuals (through concessionary rights), only in 1992 was a specific 'land law' approved (Law 21C/92), albeit with a focus on agricultural land and therefore with little relevance to urban development and planning. Facing rapid urban growth, some provincial governments such as Luanda and Benguela then approved regulations dealing with urban land on the provincial level\(^{88}\), but on the national level the process of drafting a new land law only began in 2001 with the creation of an ad-hoc Land Commission. The elaboration of the land law is unique in the sense that for the first time the government opened space for the participation of civil society in the development of legislation. For this reason, a short summary of this process seems appropriate.

The participatory process of the elaboration of the new law initiated with the creation of a Land Technical Commission by the Council of Ministers in early 2002, which produced a draft Land Law by July 2002 (DW and CEHS 2005: 148). The draft was presented for public consultation by the government who set a three month period for this process (Clover 2005: 359). It was in this context where the Land Network was created, lobbying for an extended consultation period and also pointing out the weaknesses of the draft. Several members of the Land Network engaged in different advocacy activities, such as action research, participatory workshops and specific legal suggestions to be incorporated into the draft (DW and CEHS 2005: 159-164).\(^{89}\) In December 2003, the draft Land Law

\(^{88}\) The case of Luanda is discussed in chapter six.

\(^{89}\) As indicated already in chapter three, DW and CEHS implemented a major action research programme at the time of the land law consultation process. Six distinct research projects were implemented within the overall programme, with the main objective to provide much needed information for the development of urban policy and land use management programmes in Angola (DW and CEHS 2005: 18). The results of
was passed on to parliament for discussion and approval, and civil society advocacy efforts then focused on parliamentarians and the different political benches (Ilinga 2005).

As a result of this advocacy process, parliament included a few changes to the land law, but many aspects with negative implications for the poor majority were maintained (Clover 2005: 360). While many individual parliamentarians reportedly acknowledged the suggestions made by institutions such as DW and CEHS, party discipline did leave little room for manoeuvre in the decision-making process in the National Assembly. In August the National Assembly approved the Land Law and in November it became effective through publication in the state gazette (Governo de Angola 2004b). Overall, civil society showed an impressive level of advocacy work, although in the end the impact of this on the actual Land Law was rather limited. Nevertheless, it is argued that this participatory process, which was the first of its kind ever in Angola, brought invaluable experiences for all involved and put land as well as urban development on top of the development agenda in Angola (DW and CEHS 2005: 164-165).

The new land law makes reference to urban planning in several articles, linking land rights to the existence of urban plans. In its article 15, the law says that land occupation and land rights are regulated through the norms inherent to the instruments of territorial and urban planning. Article 21 provides classifications of urban land, linking this to urban

The six studies were summarised in a synthesis report which in turn provided the basis for a book published in 2005 (DW and CEHS 2005). Coinciding with the consultative process that accompanied the elaboration of the new Land Law, the research provided a base of information for an advocacy campaign that has been implemented by DW and CEHS within this participatory process. Apart from policy influencing, another aspect of the research results dissemination strategy was a training workshop on participatory urban governance and planning, held in 2004 and provided by CEHS and DW with the participation of a wide range of staff from relevant government and non-government institutions. During this workshop, four different working groups each elaborated a peri-urban land use planning and management proposal, two in Luanda and two in Huambo of which one was located in Bairro Fátima, used as a case study for this thesis and discussed in detail in chapter seven.

One set of recommendations put forward by DW and CEHS (McAuslan 2004) suggested to include a new section in the Land Law designed to provide a legal framework for the regularisation and granting of legal security of tenure to the residents of informal urban settlements. It suggests that the relevant Ministry can identify areas of regularisation which then undergo schemes of regularisation (McAuslan 2004). The identification of regularisation areas has similarities with the ZEIS areas in Brazil. It should also be mentioned that although this aspect was never included in the law nor the following regulations, the pilot project in Bairro Fátima, Huambo, discussed in chapter seven, has tested a similar approach.

Interview with Pacheco Ilinga, 19/4/07
plans or equivalent plans, although it is not defined what is meant by ‘equivalent’. Article 36 says that private property rights can only be acquired on urban land that has been included in an urban plan or another instrument which is legally equivalent, and with the respective plot layout approved. Other forms of land rights mentioned in the law, such as surface rights or ‘precarious’ (provisional occupation) rights, do not refer to urban plans as a prerequisite.

The law has been critiqued on several aspects. One of the main critiques is related to the issue of regularising land rights of peri-urban populations who have occupied land through informal mechanisms. In the new Land Law article 84 states that all such land occupants have to initiate the land regularisation process within three years after publication of the land law regulations. Those who fail to do so will automatically lose any right to their land. This legal requisite for land regularisation contrasts with the lack of instructions that the law provides for regularisation processes. On its own this aspect of the law bears the risk that a major part of the urban population in Angola will become illegal occupants once the three year period has passed in 2009, as prior to the new Land Law they had some adverse occupation rights (usuçapião) in terms of the Civil Code (which have been explicitly removed in the new law). The new Land Law therefore has potentially weakened and not strengthened the property rights for the poor (Clover 2005: 360).

In 2006, the ‘Regulation for Land Concessions’ (Regulamento Geral de Concessão de Terrenos) was elaborated in draft form, but not published (Governo de Angola 2006). An earlier draft of the Regulation was distributed for limited public consultation and some institutions responded with specific recommendations.92 However, comparing the earlier draft regulations (Governo de Angola 2005) with the suggestions provided by these institutions (Bledsoe and Brown 2005; DW and CEHS 2006) and the final Regulation (Governo de Angola 2006), it can be noted that few of the recommendations have been taken on board. One key omission of the Regulation is the continuing lack of clear information about the process of regularisation of current land occupants. The Regulation is mainly concerned with the granting of new concessions on unoccupied land (Bledsoe and Brown 2005). This omission has been highlighted, especially because of the land regularisation requisites in article 84 in the Land Law indicated that the Regulation would provide very clear information about regularisation procedures. In early 2007

92 For example the Rural Development Institute (RDI), DW and CEHS.
however, the Ministry of Urbanism and Environment (MINUA) approached Development Workshop with the request to prepare a draft regulation for land regularisation,\textsuperscript{93} this being an indicator that within certain government institutions the above mentioned critique has been taken on board, and that the DW/CEHS action research and advocacy work on the Land Law had a positive impact.

5.7 Conclusions

The discussion in this chapter showed that current urban development trends in Angola are not sustainable in their social, economic and environmental aspects. One key factor is extreme rapid urban growth, with most of this growth taking place in informal settlements at the periphery of the cities. Angola therefore is experiencing not only the challenge of huge existing informal settlements where approximately half of the country's population live, but also the exponential growth of these settlements due to continued immigration and especially high natural growth rates. This urban growth has a close relationship to the three dimensions of sustainability.

Evidence suggests that cities in Angola are becoming more and more socially exclusive and the discussion of the land legislation showed that current urban policy and the legal framework do not address this challenge adequately. The chapter has argued that contemporary land and urban planning legislation is in fact accelerating social exclusion and puts the poor at risk of losing their assets by not providing a framework for land regularisation, intending rather to eliminate any land rights to those who fail to initiate the regularisation process by the year 2009. Cities also show clear indicators of economic exclusion with extremely high levels of poverty and a majority of the population working in the informal sector, despite rapid national economic growth. Although the government is currently implementing an extensive national reconstruction programme with a knock on effect on private sector investments and the creation of employment, it is not clear whether this growth of the formal economic sector and related increase in employment is likely to cope with the rapidly growing work force. Further, much of the government and private sector investment is targeted at city centres and new housing and infrastructure developments for the middle and upper class, with limited benefits for the poorer residents of informal settlements. The chapter has also documented how urban development in Angola is also not environmentally sustainable with much of the

\textsuperscript{93} Interview with Allan Cain, 9/4/07
informal settlements posing severe health hazards for the local population, as manifested by the 2006/2007 cholera outbreak.

The discussion then showed that the urban governance context must be seen in the wider governance context of Angola. The development of the post-independence governance context has been characterised by **extreme levels of violent conflict** with a significant impact on state and society formation. The discussion showed that since 1992 Angola developed a formally democratic system, however with very low levels of participation, transparency and accountability. Further, the formal government institutions such as the Ministries, the National Assembly, the Judiciary and the Council of Ministers are confronted with a very powerful Presidency that operates a parallel decision-making structure. Discussing this ‘realpolitik’ in Angola, it became clear that many decision-making processes are in fact controlled by the Presidency with government institutions only playing a marginal role. In the urban context, the Office for National Reconstruction (GRN) being located in the Presidency is of special importance. The discussion showed that this office has a lot of resources through managing major credit lines and little accountability, because it is not responding to the Angolan government.

At the same time however, there is a **nascent civil society** that has developed since democratic reforms initiated in 1992. While generally still weak, some civil society organizations do play an increasingly important role in local development processes and their relation to the state seems to have improved over the last years, especially some NGOs. However, civil society organizations are still concentrated in Luanda and a few other urban centres, while in many peri-urban areas, especially in the provinces, they do not exist apart from those related to churches. There are however other important local structures, such as resident committees and traditional authorities which are not civil society organizations per se, rather being part of the lowest level of state administration. These structures nevertheless are often very close to the local population wherefrom they derive some of their legitimacy. In the current context, their inclusion in local decision-making processes therefore seems important.

The discussion then showed that a process of **decentralisation** is underway, providing increased spaces for participation especially through the very recently approved Decree-Law 2/07 on the structure and responsibilities of provincial governments and local administrations. This law is providing the framework for the creation of Social
Consultation and Liaison Councils, which are consultative organs to provincial and municipal government with a permanent membership of civil society organizations and other non-government actors. It was however also pointed out that these councils are consultative bodies and do not have decision-making power. The analysis of the Territorial Planning Law 3/04 found that although an important first step has been undertaken to develop a framework for urban planning, regulations are needed in order to implement the law. As in Law 2/07, the Territorial Planning Law provides the framework for the creation of a consultative body without decision-making power, this being the National Council for Territorial Planning and Urbanism. The Social Consultation and Liaison Councils are part of these Councils and therefore, in theory, guarantee the participation of civil society. However, only the relevant but not yet published territorial planning law regulation will define the exact role and function of the councils. Finally the discussion of the 9/04 Land Law indicated that one major shortcoming of the law and its regulation is the fact that it does not provide a framework for regularising existing land occupation and therefore potentially weakens the land rights of the poor.

This analysis shows that urban planning in contemporary Angola is encountering huge challenges due to urban development dynamics and the actual governance context. Challenges, that compared to Brazil and South Africa are much more extreme in most aspects. However, having these difficulties and restrictions in mind, this chapter also showed that there exist spaces of participation that provide the opportunity to test different approaches to participatory urban planning. It is in this context that the case studies in Luanda and Huambo, discussed in the following chapters, have been developed.
6.1 Introduction

This chapter examines a participatory planning case study that was implemented in Luanda, the capital of Angola. The case study is examined following the analytical framework presented in the conclusions of chapter two, responding to following research questions:

2.1 What are contemporary urban development trends and what forms of sustainable urban development would be desirable in the case study city?
2.2 What is the governance context of the case studies and what kind of participatory mechanisms are practiced within this context?
2.3 What are the legal framework, policy and contemporary practice of urban planning in the case study context?
2.4 What kind of participatory planning is the case study presenting and how does it contribute to the desired sustainable development of the city?

In order to respond to research question 2.1, the section following the historic overview of development, governance and urban planning in Luanda looks at contemporary urban development trends in Luanda with a focus on urban growth and the three dimensions of sustainability. The following section then responds to research question 2.2, examining the governance context of Luanda. Responding to research question 2.3, the next section looks at urban planning legislation, policy and practice in Luanda.\(^4\) The final section before the conclusions then discusses the participatory planning case study, responding to research question 2.4.

\(^4\) These three sections do not repeat information provided in the previous chapter five where the broader issues of urban development, governance, participation and planning legislation in Angola have been discussed in detail. The discussion in these three sections is meant to complement the information provided in chapter five with characteristics which are specific to Luanda only.
As explained in chapter three, the literature review, interviews and observations that contributed to this chapter were undertaken from January to December 2005, with some additional information having been collected in 2006 and 2007.95

6.2 Urban development, governance and planning in Luanda – a historic overview

Luanda was founded in 1576 and initially called São Paulo de Assunção. During the first three centuries of its existence it remained a small military, administrative and commercial outpost with its main function being related to shipping and slaving. Population growth during this period was very limited from about 400 inhabitants in 1621 to about 4,500 in 1810 (Jenkins et.al. 2002b: 140). Brazil’s independence in 1822 and the official ending of the slave trade in 1836 even led to an exodus of some of the European settler population and by 1850, the town was very run down. Only in the second half of the 19th century, due to the search for alternative products to trade and employment of slaves, Luanda experienced renewed growth. The production of sugar, cocoa, cotton and coffee were developed during this period, and in the case of coffee, led to an economic boom in the next century (Jenkins et.al. 2002b: 140).

By the 1860s, an urban government was created and building control, sanitation and solid waste collection instituted. An urban telephone network was also developed in 1884, a limited water supply network in 1898, and gas lighting soon after (Jenkins et.al. 2002b: 140). The first railway was built from the port to the inland town of Malange between 1888 and 1909 with the aim to service the inland plantations. In this period, there were also the first relocations of the indigenous inhabitants from the central town area up to the higher land surrounding the narrow coastal plain where they rebuilt their houses. These areas became called musseques, which in the local language Kimbundu is the word for the arid red sandy soil that dominates the higher plateau area – a term that has continued to be used for all subsequent informal settlement areas in Luanda.

The city grew to over 11,000 inhabitants by 1882, 28,175 by 1898 and 50,000 by 1930 (Jenkins et.al. 2002b: 140-141). Despite the investment in public infrastructure, much of the rapid growth of the city was in the informal musseque areas without services, which were consecutively developed on the expanding urban periphery. The proportion of the

95 For a full list of interviews, refer to Appendix 1.
population residing in musseques rose to some 10-25 per cent, and was by no means exclusive to the indigenous Angolan in-migrants, but also included the Portuguese peasant emigrants (Jenkins et al. 2002b: 141). Until the 1940s, urban growth was guided through ad-hoc planning measures and only in 1942, the colonial government prepared the first master plan (Kasack 1992: 87). The plan provided for segregated residential development for the white settlers and the black indigenous people in ‘native quarters’. The first adjustments to this plan were made already in 1947, by the Town Planning Bureau within the Ministry of Overseas Territories in Lisbon, bringing the plan into accordance with the State’s developing interests (Troufa 1979: 37). In 1956 the Municipality of Luanda commissioned the elaboration of an alternative plan which was however again revised in 1961 as a part of the emergency measures following the incidents of armed uprisings in Luanda related to the struggle for independence (Troufa 1979: 37).

In 1962, in the light of shanty town growth problems and the general lack of infrastructure, the municipality created a Town Planning Bureau which put forward an urban diagnosis and elaborated a plan that was the first attempt of a planned integration of the different segments of the city’s population (Troufa 1979: 38; UNCHS 1990: 5). The plan however seemed to have been overtaken by urban expansion and in 1973, the French firm OTAM (Omnium Technique d’Amenagement) was contracted to prepare a new master plan. This plan projected a population increase of the Luanda region to 1.7 million by 1987 and strongly recommended the development of new housing. The plan was based on a ‘growth pole’ strategy for urban de-concentration to three new urban nuclei, Luanda, Viana and Cacuaco (Troufa 1979: 38). However the plan was criticised as an instrument of enhancing a serving colonial rule, securing the privileges of access to urban services of the Portuguese oligarchy and to a lesser extent the poorer migrants who settled in the country since the beginning of the 1960s (UNCHS 1990: 5). The plan was never implemented as the colonial regime began to collapse in 1974, linked to regime change in Portugal. Despite some urban upgrading initiatives in the 1970s, the major part of the fast expanding areas developed in an ad-hoc manner without any planning or building control. As a result, a large proportion of the population continued to live without services in the rapidly expanding musseques (Jenkins et al. 2002b: 141-142).

96 This plan was commissioned to the city planners Etienne de Groer and Moreira da Silva (Kasack 1992: 87).
97 Headed by the architect-city planner, Simões de Carvalho (Kasack 1992: 87).
The revolution in Portugal in 1974 brought political changes and increased expectations by the local population for improvements of their living standards. As a result of increased popular demands accompanied by demonstrations, the new Portuguese government created the **Department of Housing in Angola** (Gabinete de Habitação de Angola - GHA) that developed and implemented a new strategy for the improvement of the housing situation. The strategy was based on five actions of which Mendes (1988: 238, cited in Kasack 1992: 90) gives the following summary: 98

a. Immediate action was taken for the urgent improvement of social and sanitary conditions by installing public drinking fountains, basic street lighting, refuse collection, primary equipment of public use such as bath houses, dispensaries, multi-departmental schools, and commercial centres. This meant the involvement of the population in resolving their basic needs through the people’s committees.

b. Drains and accompanying drainage systems were built in slum areas, the post of inspector of drain systems was created, a peripheral primary network was installed and public toilets were constructed in areas served by the primary network. The work undertaken was limited to the musseque of Cazenga, where the lake was drained.

c. Urban plots were demarcated in areas where the master plan indicated low-cost housing, and the land was prepared for occupation under a self-building system. This action implied obtaining occupancy rights and division into plots, the installation of urban infrastructure and equipment, housing construction, the establishment of a public transport network and drawing up an administrative system for housing. These measures were applied to the musseque Golfe.

d. Gradual upgrading of the musseques without altering the neighbourhood was undertaken. In addition to the actions described above, this intervention

---

98 The author could not discover any maps related to the five different actions cited by Mendes above. The most detailed account discovered by the author is a report about the work in the musseque Golfe with a series of technical suggestions on planning and building standards to be applied in this process. The report is dated July 1975 (Troufa 1975) and includes contributions of a foreign consultant (Werner Schillinger).
included defining areas for eviction and those of deception.\(^9^9\) This work initiated in the \textit{musseque} of Rangel, which was very densely populated.

e. At the same time as the previous actions were being carried out, an attempt was made to control the flow of immigrants,\(^1^0^0\) avoiding overpopulation and the formation of new \textit{musseques}, both in Luanda and in other Angolan cities.

While the summary given by Mendes makes these activities sound widespread and effective, it is not clear to which degree they have actually been implemented. Given the short time-frame of the transition period (just over a year) and assessing the magnitude of the urban development challenge, it can be assumed that most activities, if they even surpassed the planning phase, were implemented on a pilot scale only.\(^1^0^1\)

In addition to these activities, the GHA led the development of \textit{integrated housing plans} which envisaged, among other things, the implementation of urban infrastructure such as water, sewage, electricity, streets, transportation and facilities such as schools and health centres (Troufa 1979). At the beginning of construction activities, plots designated for housing would be distributed to poor families from shanty towns or new immigrants. Those families could, in case they so wished, participate from the start not only in building their own houses but also in contributing to the construction of general facilities and be paid salaries for this work by the government. This policy explicitly aimed at curbing the growth and emergence of new shanty towns in the city. All GHA's actions, including the most technical, were shared directly and actively with the \textit{musseque}'s people's organizations, namely with the resident commissions. Troufa (1979: 59) argues that this policy achieved significant results. However, these \textit{musseque} upgrading activities did not last for long. With independence in 1975 the GHA was dissolved and a completely new housing policy became dominant, based on a Cuban model, promoting the construction of apartment blocks.

In 1979, with the help of a Cuban team of planners and architects, the National Directorate of Physical Planning (Direcção Nacional do Planificação Física) of the

\(^{99}\) It is not clear what deception stands for here in this citation of Mendes. It could be an error, actually meaning the word 'reception'.

\(^{100}\) The word 'immigrants' as used by Mendes could mean 'in-migrants'.

\(^{101}\) Kasack (1992: 90) also refers to the fact that the two known sources of this period (Mendes 1988 and Troufa 1979) do not specify the level of implementation of these activities.
Ministry of Construction, revised the 1973 plan and produced a new plan. However, it greatly underestimated Luanda’s growth, assuming a population of 1,650,000 by 2010 (CIPRO 1979), and the plan has never been implemented (Kasack 1992: 91-94). In 1980, the government introduced a new law of ‘self-help building’ (Regulamento da Auto-Construção) (Governo de Angola 1980). The law aimed at offering some direction to the energy being channelled into the informal housing sector, and at the same time providing some basic support from the state in the area of urban planning and the provision of infrastructure. However, the law aimed at new owner-builders that occupied undeveloped land, but for the inhabitants of the already existing musseques it did not really offer anything (Cain 1986: 7). Despite this, the law marked a first attempt by the state to deal with the increasing demand for urban shelter and indicated that the government became aware that it was not capable of providing formal housing at a scale to meet demand. A few years later, however, the programme collapsed because local government could not deal with the popular demand (Jenkins et al. 2002b: 143).

In 1987, in another attempt to promote urban upgrading, the international non-governmental organization Development Workshop and the national Department of Urbanism set up an Office for Musseque Upgrading in Luanda. One of the main projects promoted by the office was called the Sambizanga Upgrading Project which was aimed at testing several approaches to urban upgrading. Bureaucratic structures worked against this kind of initiative (Cain 1989: 18), but the basic urban service provision component of the project was successful, acting as a pilot for developing social mobilisation strategies for service provision and the community management of water distribution by elected water committees.\textsuperscript{102} This approach was taken forward and developed throughout the 1990s and continued to be promoted as a way forward for sustainable local water provision.\textsuperscript{103} Experiences from these activities were also taken on board in an urban infrastructure rehabilitation plan that was developed in 1997 with a World Bank Credit which, however, has not been implemented with the World Bank having frozen its urban projects due to different reasons (Jenkins et al. 2002b: 143).

\textsuperscript{102} Interview with Allan Cain, 9/4/07

\textsuperscript{103} Experiences of participatory approaches with the water committees led to the creation of two Associations of Water Committees in the late 1990s. The Association of Water Committees in N’gola Kiluanji (Sambizanga Municipality) for example became an active actor in the local development context, participating in activities beyond the provision of water. It was this increased participation of the Association that led towards the Municipal Participatory Planning Process as discussed later in this chapter.
The last overall urban assessment and land use plan was produced in 1995 by Dar Al-Handasah, based on 1994 satellite imagery and funded by a World Bank credit. The published volumes that make up this 'Urban Land Use and Growth Management Plan' provide the most detailed information about land use in Luanda to date.\textsuperscript{104} The plan estimated that at the time some 75 per cent of the population was living in informal settlement areas or in informal ways within the formal urban areas (Jenkins et.al. 2002b: 145).\textsuperscript{105}

\textbf{Figure 6: Province of Luanda with municipal administration boundaries}\textsuperscript{106}

6.3 \textbf{Sustainability of contemporary development processes}

The population of the city rose from more than 40,000 in 1930 to about 60,000 in 1940 and doubled about every 11 years from 1940 onwards. From 1945, rapid economic growth continued, with the population reaching nearly 1 million by 1980. The growth in the city was driven by economic activities, particularly oil production, which came to dominate the local economy. The rapid expansion of the city led to significant urbanization, with many residents living in informal settlements that lacked basic services.

\textsuperscript{104} Interview with Allan Cain, 9/4/07

\textsuperscript{105} It is also to the knowledge of the researcher that more recent plans exist, such as for development in the southern part of Luanda. The researcher however was unable to gain access to these plans which are not available to the general public.

\textsuperscript{106} Image provided by Development Workshop Angola
growth contributed to accelerated immigration from Portugal and simultaneously provoked increased internal migration to the cities (DW and CEHS 2005: 69). In 1970, at the last full national census, the total population of Luanda was 475,000, of which 66 per cent were African, 26 per cent European and 8 per cent of mixed race, with some 210,000 estimated as living in the musseques (Jenkins et.al. 2002: 142). After independence, the expansion of the city continued unabated with musseques being built ever further away from the city centre. Internal natural growth was coupled with high levels of in-migration from internally displaced people who fled the theatres of war. The city’s contemporary population is estimated at 4.5 million and is expected to reach almost 5.5 million by 2010, considering a medium projected growth rate. Most of this growth is taking place at the periphery, resulting in an extremely rapid physical expansion of the city.

Table 4: Demographic development of Luanda city

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Luanda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1940</td>
<td>61,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>224,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>475,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>738,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>923,263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>1,138,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>1,538,779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2,100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>3,276,991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>4,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>5,475,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of contemporary growth, government sources estimate a need of approximately 50,000 to 60,000 new homes a year (Angola News 2007: May).

---

107 In research done in 2003 in Luanda’s peri-urban areas, 59 per cent of interviewed households reported to have moved in to the bairro were they were interviewed. 35 per cent of these respondents moved in from another municipality within Luanda province and 20 per cent from another province. Within the research sample, 42 per cent of population growth was due to natural growth (DW and CEHS 2005: 109).

108 Apart from the estimates of 2007 and 2010, all data is cited from different sources in: MINUA 2002: 28

109 DW and CEHS 2005: 73

110 DW and CEHS 2005: 73

136
Luanda shows extremely high rates of poverty and social exclusion with a majority of the population living in informal settlements. Research conducted in several musseques in 2003 found 42 per cent of respondents to be destitute and 37 per cent very poor in accordance with the qualitative parameters established for this research (DW and CEHS 2005: 111). The highest levels of poverty were recorded from peripheral expansion areas where 85 per cent were considered destitute (DW and CEHS 2005: 111). Access to urban services is also very low in Luanda’s peri-urban areas. The same research identified that 30 per cent of respondents had no access to services such as water supply and electricity or basic services such as health and education in the vicinity (DW and CEHS 2005: 112).

Social exclusion and poverty in peri-urban areas is also characterised through forms of land access which in most cases is informal. The research found that more than 80 per cent of interviewed gained access to their land through the informal market. Not one interviewee was found to have land rights documents as stipulated by the law (‘precarious’ or ‘surface’ rights), with many however having some form of informal documents such as ‘purchase and sale’ contracts or receipts of fines paid for unauthorised occupation which are often mistakenly regarded as conferring rights for occupation (DW and CEHS 2005: 108).

Similar to social exclusion, Luanda shows very high levels of economic exclusion. Despite the impressive post-war reconstruction efforts and a rapidly expanding private sector, unemployment is extremely high. The formal sector is not able to provide employment to a significant percentage of the population, which thus has to engage in informal sector economic activities in order to secure their livelihoods. As noted above, recent research indicates that more than 84 per cent of households in Luanda had one or more adult family members with a micro or small enterprise, of which most are in the informal sector. Projections to the overall enterprises in this sector indicate a total of more than half a million enterprises in Luanda. The estimates further suggest that the sector absorbs an estimated 700,000 individuals in Luanda (DW 2006: 9-10). Overall, the sector

---

111 Poverty was defined as low access to a series of resources (economic, human, physical, socio-cultural and legal/political) that householders can draw on to lower their vulnerability (DW and CEHS 2005: 111).

112 In 1993, the estimate was at 24 per cent unemployed, 60 per cent underemployed and formal sector engagement was estimated as being 30-35 per cent of the work force. It can be assumed that these formal sector engagement percentages have declined since (Jenkins et.al. 2002b: 144).
generates approximately 54 per cent of the income of Luanda households and accounts for 58 per cent of the respective expenditure (DW 2006: 24-25).

Luanda also shows extremely low levels of environmental sustainability, principally caused through the lack of drainage systems, solid waste collection and the provision of basic services such as water. More than 50 per cent of the population and most of the population in the *musseques* have no access to piped water, but are forced to buy it from informal sellers which are served by tanker trucks that bring the untreated water from the Bengo river in the north of the city (Cain 2007).\(^{113}\) The cholera epidemic in 2006 and the flooding in early 2007 were manifestations of the abysmal sanitary conditions in which most residents in peri-urban areas live.\(^{114}\) Despite a certain effort by the government, solid waste removal is very ineffective in most peri-urban areas with huge illegal and ad-hoc waste deposits filling up streets and open spaces. Also, to date, the city of Luanda does not have an environmental impact assessment or similar study that would provide information about areas with special risks for housing.\(^{115}\) As a result, many people are building houses in areas prone to flooding or areas under a high risk of mud slides.

\(^{113}\) From the 300 standposts that were serving the musseque population at the time of independence, a mere six were still functioning in 1995 (Cain 2007).

\(^{114}\) In the whole of the country during the year 2006, 67,000 cases of Cholera were reported and 2,772 succumbed to the waterborne disease. According to the WHO, Angola accounted for nearly half the 6,303 cholera deaths in Africa last year (IRIN 2007).

\(^{115}\) Interview with Allan Cain, 7/4/07
Contemporary short term priorities for sustainable development in Luanda would therefore arguably include major investments in local infrastructure such as roads, sanitation, drainage and access to clean water. Apart from the sad fact that the lack of these investments takes a high toll of human lives every year, it also makes the city economically inefficient, this manifested through traffic jams that block access and inner city roads during extended periods of time, as well as increased costs of goods and services with most commercial establishments having to pay large amounts of money to guarantee individualised solutions for access to water, electricity and security. There seems therefore to be a case of a win-win situation where infrastructure investment and economic growth are linked in a dialectic relationship. This relationship has for example also been explicitly mentioned in the case of Jo’burg 2030 where infrastructure investments were assessed as an important contribution to the overall economic growth strategy. To make development more sustainable, Luanda further needs an explicit policy and related programmes that tackle the rapid urban growth at the city periphery.

6.4 The urban governance context

Chapter five examined the most relevant aspects of the Angolan governance context. Having looked at the workings of Angolan ‘realpolitik’, the role of the Presidency, the very low levels of real decentralisation and the still young and nascent civil society, the chapter concluded that Angola indeed provides a very challenging context for participatory urban governance approaches. In most aspects, the province of Luanda,
which comprises nine municipalities, reflects this general analysis. This section nevertheless provides additional information about some specific aspects of the governance context in Luanda.

On the level of urban policy, the Ministry of Urbanism and Environment (MINUA) has an important role. The Ministry was created in 2003 through Decree Law 4/03 (Governo de Angola 2003). The law defines that MINUA is responsible for the elaboration, coordination, execution and control of urban planning, urbanisation, housing and environmental policy. Since its creation, the Ministry has taken an increasingly active role in its sphere of influence, promoting exchange visits with Brazilian cities for example or collaborating with local civil society in the elaboration of regulations for slum-upgrading activities. The Ministry itself is not involved in the implementation of urban policy or activities related to urban management, this being the responsibility of the Provincial Government as discussed below. Under line management of MINUA is also the National Institute for Territorial Planning and Urban Development (INOTU). While not responsible for the elaboration of urban plans, the Institute has broad responsibilities in promoting, monitoring, and coordinating the elaboration of urban plans. It has also responsibilities for implementing land use assessments together with partner entities and to elaborate norms and regulations necessary in the Institute’s area of intervention. In spite of its potentially important role, INOTU however hardly participates in any urban planning or urban development activity in Luanda and has also lost the technical capacity for this.

While MINUA is responsible for urban policy, the Provincial Government’s main task is urban management. While legally the Provincial Government is responsible for

---

116 These being Ingombota, Rangel, Sambizanga, Cazenga, Kilamba Kiaxi, Samba, Maianga, Viana and Cacuaco.

117 MINUA is a national institution and could arguably have been introduced in the previous chapter. However, given that the majority of MINUA’s activities are implemented in Luanda it seems also adequate to introduce this institution in the current chapter.

118 In March 2007, the Ministry subcontracted DW for preparing a draft of these regulations.

119 Confidential interview with INOTU official, December 2005. As discussed in the following chapter seven, INOTU in Huambo has a more active role in urban planning and development than in Luanda.

120 The provincial government however is also contributing to urban policy that is promoted in a dialectic relationship with practice. Especially important in this regard is the Office for Studies, Planning and Statistics (Gabinete de Estudos, Planeamento e Estatistica).
overall urban land use management, the government in practice does not have the necessary resources for controlling urban development, in many cases not even being informed about all major urban development projects that are being implemented in the province. This lack of control has resulted in and is also partly the result of direct interventions by the Presidency, creating parallel structures for land use management in Luanda province. In May 2005 for example, the President issued a presidential dispatch (despacho presidencial) for the creation of a technical commission with the objective to analyse development projects in Luanda. Although the commission included the Governor and other senior officials from the Provincial Government and MINUA, it was headed by a presidential advisor (Journal de Angola 2005: 19 May), thus reinforcing the double lines of authority.121

**Municipalities** do not have any independent fiscal base and neither administrators nor vice-administrators are elected, as noted above. Each municipality in turn consists of several communes, each usually with its own communal administration. The commune consists of several sectors which can be made up of several bairros. The bairro in turn consists of 10-50 neighbourhood blocks (quarteirão), each one including 10–50 families (Cain et.al. 2002). Municipal administrations in Luanda have basically no resources or real decision-making power and the de-concentration process as discussed in chapter five, initiated by Law Decree 19/99 and recently substituted by Law Decree 2/07, is not much felt in reality.122 **Communal administrations** however, although without formal rights to allocate land, have undertaken this extensively as an emergency measure, responding to the high demand (DW and CEHS 2005: 127).

In an initiative for increasing participation in urban management, MINUA and NGO partners launched the **National Urban Forum** in April 2007.123 The Forum is the outcome of a joint effort of MINUA and a consortium of NGOs, which initiated as a follow-up to the Barcelona World Urban Forum in 2004 (LUPP 2007). The National Urban Forum’s main objective is to provide a participatory space for government and non-government actors to discuss and disseminate urban development approaches and

---

121 The commission’s first accomplishment was the compilation of contemporary urban development projects in Luanda, using GIS technology (Confidential interview with INOTU official, December 2005).

122 This was stated by the Vice-Minister of MAT, Mota Liz, in his speech at the first session of the Urban National Forum in Luanda, 9/4/07.

123 Being a ‘national’ Forum, this topic could be discussed in chapter five. However, given the fact that in reality the Forum only has some significance in Luanda, it is examined in this chapter six.
The creation of the Forum therefore can be attributed to the increased lobbying process of civil society, especially during the consultation phase of the new Land Law, as well as MINUA’s increased willingness to partner with civil society organizations. The creation of the Forum has also been actively supported by the Luanda Urban Poverty Programme (LUPP) that organized the first session of the Forum in April 2007, chaired by the Minister of MINUA. In the words of the organizers, the Forum is “an open space for dialogue and reflection, democratic debate of ideas, identification of participatory proposals, free exchange of experiences, a basis for initiating joint action between the Government and civil society.” (LUPP 2007) Beside the confirmation of this rather broad objective and the realisation of the first session of the Forum, no specific activities have been undertaken to date. The Forum however seems an important first step to institutionalise the participation of civil society in the dialogue on urban policy, with the potential for an increased share of knowledge and initiation of joint action.

Comparing with other cities in Angola, Luanda has the highest number of civil society organizations of which many are present in peri-urban areas. Traditional authority in most peri-urban areas of Luanda does not have an important role, however, unlike other smaller urban areas such as Huambo as will be discussed in the next chapter. Research in 1999 observed that traditional leadership, as existing in the rest of Angola, is not present in Luanda (Robson 1999: 9). Traditional leadership, however, seemed to re-emerge in the city sometime around 2001, but in spite of its increased presence in peri-urban Luanda, its function seems rather limited. Resident commissions as noted in the previous chapter are present in all parts of the city, but, as discussed earlier, they do have a potential, rather than actual important function in the current governance context.

Summarising this section, a first key observation is the fact that the government in Luanda appears to have always lacked the capacity to effectively control and plan urban land use. The lack of adequate planning and development control was evident throughout the colonial period in the repeated post-factum planning attempts, and has become increasingly accentuated since independence. In parallel to this lack of capacity of the state, extremely rapid urban growth has contributed to today’s very high levels of social

---

124 Interview with Pacheco Ilinga, 19/4/07
125 LUPP is implemented by an NGO consortium consisting of DW, CARE international and Save the Children UK and financed by the UK Department of International Development (DFID).
126 Interview with Pacheco Ilinga, 19/4/07
and economic exclusion and environmental degradation – accelerated by the war but now sustained by natural growth rates. Poverty levels are very high with most of the population being engaged in informal economic activities in order to sustain their livelihoods. Environmental hazards are also extremely high, this having been clearly manifested through the devastating cholera outbreak in 2006 and the flooding in early 2007. The governance context in Luanda is characterised by weak state institutions, especially on the municipal and communal level and a weak civil society and very few private sector actors in the urban developments sphere, as is described below. These actors from the local governance context engage in different planning and development activities that in some way or other contribute to contemporary urban development trends. The following section looks in more detail at some of these processes, especially examining the function of planning.

6.5 Important contemporary planning and development processes in Luanda

6.5.1 Housing and infrastructure development by EDURB

In 1992, the Brazilian private sector enterprise Odebrecht presented a master plan to the Luanda Provincial Government, suggesting the creation of an expansion zone in the south of the city, called Luanda Sul, with an approximate extension of some 10,000 hectares (MINUA 2002: 63). In 1994, the Council of Ministers approved the plan and assigned a public-private partnership to lead the development of Luanda Sul, this being the ‘Enterprise for Urban Development’ (Empresa de Desenvolvimento Urbano - EDURB). The programme was initiated in 1994 and the process is still ongoing to date. The land is provided to EDURB by the Provincial Government of Luanda, while private sector partners develop the housing with infrastructure and sell it to individuals at a price calculated on the basis of the costs of the infrastructure plus a social contribution in lieu of land cost (MINUA 2002: 63). The first clients of housing developed by EDURB were oil companies and in 2000, an estimated 75 per cent of Luanda Sul residents were from the upper class and some 22 per cent from the middle class (MINUA 2002: 63). There are basically no poor living in the newly developed Luanda Sul area, but some 1,500 former residents of the areas developed were compensated with land and in a few cases also with houses.

By 2000, contracts signed by EDURB had exceeded USD 133 million and four different poles have been developed. these being Talatona, Novos Bairros, Morro Bento and
Projecto Morar (MINUA 2003: 63). Five years later, by 2005, more than USD 200 million have been invested in EDURB by the private sector for condominium developments and associated infrastructures (UN-HABITAT 2005: 9). The new owners of houses in Luanda Sul are eligible for surface land use concessions and housing credits are available for some government employees, permitting the small middle class access to housing in the schemes. While its main operation continues to be in Luanda Sul, EDURB has recently been expanding into two provincial cities, Huambo and Benguela.  

Civil society is not actively participating in EDURB’s developments. However, the approach used provides an interesting example of a private-public partnership, involving the Provincial Government of Luanda and several private sector companies. For its impact on sustainable development, EDURB has been recognised by UN-HABITAT as ‘international best practice’ and received the International Reward for Best Practices for Urban Upgrading by the Municipality of Dubai. It has however also attracted critiques on several levels. One critique points out that Luanda Sul is turning into a huge ‘dormitory’ without associated local economic development, with residents that continue being primarily employed in central Luanda. This development has led and continues leading to increased traffic congestion into central town with current travel times of up to two hours each way during rush-hours.

EDURB has also received critique in regard to forced evictions associated to its developments. Local NGOs such as SOS-Habitat and international agencies such as Amnesty International have called attention to excesses of police violence, lack of eviction procedures and lack of adequate compensation (Amnesty International 2006). The project is further creating fenced-off high income condominiums in the midst of poor slum areas. Overall, it can be concluded that EDURB is using an innovative approach for successfully providing much needed housing for the upper and middle class. It does

---

127 In Huambo, EDURB signed a contract with the Provincial Government in early 2007 for an infrastructure and housing development located along the road from Huambo to Kaala (Confidential Interview with DPUA official, February 2007). In Benguela, EDURB has signed a contract for feasibility studies in 2005 (UN-Habitat 2005: 9). News in April 2007 revealed an urban development programme called ‘North Benguela’ (Benguela Norte) with the main objective to revitalise economic development in the northern part of Benguela city and province. While EDURB was mentioned as the lead agency, Odebrecht was mentioned as being responsible for implementation (Angolense 2007: 14 April).

128 Interview with Pacheco Ilinga, 19/4/07

129 Forced evictions are discussed in greater details below.
however not provide an integrated planning and development approach that would benefit a wider segment of local residents and the sustainability of such an approach can therefore be seriously questioned.

Figure 8: Example of housing provided in condominiums in Luanda

6.5.2 Housing and infrastructure development by the Office for National Reconstruction (GRN)

In 2006, the GRN (Office for National Reconstruction) revealed the biggest urban project ever undertaken in Angola (ANGOP 2006). The Angolan press reported that by 2008, 200,000 new housing units would be developed by the project in 23 localities in Angola (ANGOP 2006). The development is being implemented by Chinese construction companies in the context of the Angola-China cooperation. In Cabinda, constructions started in early 2006 in a rural area south of the provincial capital, implemented by the China International Fund, which has also contracts to reconstruct the Benguela and Moçamedes railways. The housing concept is based on Asian and European urban design, with the planned construction of apartment blocks with 15 floors each (ANGOP 2006). Access to these housing units is supposed to be regulated by specific legislation but this has not yet been approved by the Council of Ministers at the time of writing.\textsuperscript{130} The housing and urban concept is the same in all provinces, however with varying numbers of housing units allocated per city as the table below shows:

\textsuperscript{130} August 2007
Table 5: Number and locality of satellite city housing units (Jornal de Angola 2006a)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Locality</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Housing Units</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Luanda</td>
<td>Luanda</td>
<td>120,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zaia</td>
<td>Cabinda</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soyo</td>
<td>Zaire</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mbanza Congo</td>
<td>Zaire</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dundo</td>
<td>Lunda Norte</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saurimo</td>
<td>Lunda Sul</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaala</td>
<td>Huambo</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lobito and Catumbela</td>
<td>Benguela</td>
<td>20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuito</td>
<td>Bie</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luena</td>
<td>Moxico</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Praia Azul</td>
<td>Namibe</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lubango</td>
<td>Huila</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ondjiva</td>
<td>Cunene</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Menongue</td>
<td>Kuando Kubango</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>215,500</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In Luanda, the project aims to create ‘the new city of Luanda’ (Nova Cidade de Luanda) on an area of 800 km² with 120,000 housing units and if completed, the new city would be larger than Brasilia, the capital of Brazil. It has further been indicated that bank credits would be available for people to buy homes, probably from the proposed Development Bank (Banco de Desenvolvimento) (Africa Confidential 2006: 4).

The GRN is also leading the development of a new international airport being developed in a locality known as ‘kilometre 38’ at the border of Viana Municipality and Bengo province. The area reserved for the airport is 100 km² and the airport, once finished, is supposed to have the capacity of moving 15 million passengers per year and providing facilities for the biggest and most modern airplanes in use.\(^{131}\) The airport is supposed to be ready by 2010 (Independente 2006: 17 June). This potentially provides a strong development pole for the city, as planned as far back as 1973\(^{132}\) - however the

---

\(^{131}\) In January 2007, the Angola National Television Broadcaster (TPA) started showing an advertisement for the airport.

\(^{132}\) See the discussion in section two of this chapter.
number of jobs provided at the airport will be small in relation to un- and under-employment levels.

In both of the above development projects, there has hardly been any participation in the planning phase with even central government institutions being excluded from the process, let alone civil society and the public. \(^{133}\) Neither of the two projects have been discussed in the National Assembly and only the urban housing project has been discussed and approved by the Council of Ministers, which did suggest some modifications in order to adapt it more to the habits of the local population (Africa Confidential 2006: 4).

Looking at the GRN activities' impact on sustainable development, it can be observed that while both major new projects are providing much needed infrastructure, they are being critiqued on several aspects. As with the Luanda Sul development, the urban project does not provide housing nor infrastructure solutions for the poor, nor does it address the issue of existing peri-urban and informal settlements. And in relation to the new airport, critical voices are saying that the size of the airport is completely out of proportion to what will be needed, meaning that the airport is too ambitious for Angola's needs. \(^{134}\) In addition, apart from being highly non-participative, many of these new large scale projects ignore any rights to land that informal occupiers potentially have, as is detailed below.

### 6.5.3 Resistance to forced evictions

Many of the more recently reported forced evictions are related to urban development projects such as the developments in Luanda Sul or infrastructure developments led by the GRN. A recent report (Amnesty International 2006) reported forced evictions in several municipalities in Luanda since 2004, \(^{135}\) affecting several thousand families. In most cases, the evictions took place without eviction orders and not following procedures as required by international law and standards (Amnesty International 2006: 3).

---

\(^{133}\) Confidential interview with MINUA official, November 2005

\(^{134}\) Confidential interview with senior NGO worker, April 2007

\(^{135}\) There are also some, albeit limited encouraging developments in which the rights of the evicted are being protected, notably evictions in Sambizanga and Ingombota municipalities where residents were evicted from land belonging to the Luanda Railway Company (Caminhos de Ferro de Luanda - CFL) but only after having been consulted and offered compensation (Amnesty International 2007: 2).
Additionally, the excessive use of violence was reported in many cases and the evicted usually have not received alternative accommodation nor any other form of compensation for lost and destroyed goods and investments. Although many of the evictions were related to urban development projects, it seems that the affected individuals were not given any prior information on the relevant urban plans (Amnesty International 2006: 3). Officials often refer to the fact that many of the houses are ‘randomly and illegally’ built on either private or government owned land earmarked for development (Amnesty International 2006: 3). The government entities enforcing and implementing the evictions include municipal fiscal officials, the national police, the military police and the presidential guard.

An example is in the area of the new international airport where local residents who were evicted by the presidential guard in 2005 were promised compensation but have not yet received anything a year later. In the search for justice, hundreds of families congregated in front of the National Assembly in June 2006 where they were met by the MPs of the Fourth Commission (Human Rights Commission). The MPs however reportedly were unable to give an explanation to this issue, given the fact that the project of the new airport was not discussed in, nor approved by, the National Assembly. The MPs however offered to write to the head of the President’s Military Office to request information (Independente 2006: 17 July).

In Kilamba Kixi municipality (Bairros Cambamba I and II, Banga Wé and 28 de Agosto) there have been several evictions from land reportedly granted to the Nova Vida housing project that is part of the Luanda Sul condominium development. The demolitions in this case seem to have been ordered by the Municipal Administrator and in the course of the evictions, several residents and SOS-Habitat activists were arrested but were later released (Amnesty International 2007). SOS-Habitat and several residents subsequently met the President of the National Assembly to complain about the forced evictions. This then led to a meeting of the President of the National Assembly with the Provincial Governor in order to discuss the situation. However, demolitions continued and soon after the President of the National Assembly convened another meeting with the Provincial Governor who subsequently set up a commission of inquiry. Demolitions still continued during the course of which several residents were injured or arrested by the

136 SOS-Habitat is a local Angolan NGO operating in Luanda and defending residents affected by evictions. The NGO had an important role in many cases of forced evictions in Luanda.
police. Several representatives of international agencies and institutions also visited the area to witness the forced evictions. In April 2006, residents staged a demonstration in front of the National Assembly and it was also reported that the Provincial Governor set up another commission of inquiry into the forced evictions, but it is not clear whether any of the commissions in fact have reported. In May, on request of opposition parliamentarians, the Prime Minister appeared before the National Assembly to answer questions related to the forced evictions (Amnesty International 2007).

Participation of communities and civil society organizations in the cases above is strong, albeit not in the process of elaborating urban plans, but in the process of opposing them. Nevertheless, the examples show that in Luanda’s peri-urban areas local community structures and local NGOs do exist, and that they have the capacity to engage with government and the private sector in some way in the implementation of urban plans – albeit reactively and not proactively as being promoted by international good practice in planning. The resistance to forced evictions can arguably be interpreted as a manifestation against socially exclusive urban development that is an aspect of closed condominium development, catering for the middle and upper class without taking into account the needs of the poor. In this regard, the resistance to forced evictions as described above is making a contribution to protect the rights of the excluded and to indirectly promote a more inclusive approach to urban development. From a certain point of view, these cases of forced evictions therefore provide an example of strong participation of community and civil society organizations.

6.5.4 Informal settlements – expansion without planning

While the Luanda Sul development and GRN urban project described above mainly respond to the housing needs of the upper and middle class, Luanda’s informal and poor peri-urban areas continue to expand rapidly. Development in most of these areas is not guided by any planning at all. Recent research in an expanding peri-urban area in Cacuaco municipality (bairro Agusto N’gangula) for example found a complete lack of basic services and serious problems in terms of sanitation and environmental hazards. There were no roads due to the unplanned occupation of the area and poverty levels were extremely high (DW and CEHS 2003c: 29-30). The research found that inhabitants buy

These included members of the United Nations Human Rights Office in Angola, Oxfam and a British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC) journalist.
land from various sources, build their houses, and only after the house is built some might begin with the regularisation process for the right to occupy the land. Further, because housing plots and roads were not laid out and there has not been any kind of land demarcation, land has been occupied in a very disorganized way, what is commonly known in Angola as 'anarchic' occupation and construction, making future infrastructure provision very difficult (DW and CEHS 2003c: 29-30).

While local residents are engaged in this form of ad-hoc planning and development, there is no participation taking place whether in the planning nor development stage in the sense that relevant stakeholders, such as local authorities or local civil society organizations are involved in the process. Also, the outcome of this form of development lacks sustainability in its social, economic and environmental dimensions.

Summarising this section, the following key aspects can be pointed out. First, all above mentioned examples show very low levels of active participation in the planning phase. Only in the resistance to forced evictions and demand of compensation are there high levels of participation of the community - in collaboration with a local NGO (SOS-Habitat) – this however arguably rather a reaction to exclusionary planning and development than participatory planning as discussed in this thesis. However, given the high resonance in the local media and the fact that the issue (forced evictions) was brought into parliamentary debate, this form of participation (or resistance) seems to have a certain effectiveness in defending land rights of the poor. The discussion further argued that while there are some successful initiatives for planning and developing middle and high-income housing and related infrastructure, there seems to be a complete lack of any serious attempt to deal with the city as a whole, addressing the most pressing development issues as identified earlier in this chapter. Based on this analysis, the thesis looks at an alternative planning process that sought to contribute to more sustainable development in a specific municipality in Luanda, this being discussed in detail in the following section.
6.6 The Sambizanga participatory municipal planning process

6.6.1 Introduction to the case study

The NGO Development Workshop (DW) started working in Sambizanga municipality in 1983 with a project for Educational Facilities Planning of primary schools in Luanda (Cain 1986: 9). In 1989, DW launched the Sambizanga Project and since 1999 DW’s interventions are part of the Luanda Urban Poverty Programme (LUPP). The emphasis of the last few years has been on community managed basic service provision, such as water stand posts managed by water committees which in turn are organized into a local association. As the Communal Administration of N’Gola Kiluanje invited non-governmental actors to participate in the Consultative Councils (as stipulated by Decree Law 17/99), the association began to have a scope of intervention beyond the management of water stand posts. Based on this experience DW suggested to introduce a participatory planning process on the municipal level, and with this idea being accepted by the Municipal Administration the process was implemented from June to August 2005.

As discussed in chapter three, the author participated in the planning process in the function of an observer and evaluator in accordance with his position as Manager of DW’s Monitoring and Research Unit. The author thus had access to information that would not have been accessible to ‘outside’ researchers, as explained in the methodology chapter (chapter three, section three), permitting this experience of observation to be incorporated in this thesis, adopting an ‘insider’ approach to social research. The discussion in chapter three also pointed out some inherent risks of this approach, mainly in terms of impartiality in the process of data analysis. The discussion however showed that the author was explicitly aware of these risks and that the necessary steps were taken to ensure impartiality.

Sambizanga municipality is situated to the east of Luanda’s downtown (cidade baixa) and is one of the oldest musseques in Luanda.138 The municipality is divided into three communes, these being commune Sede, commune N’gola Kiluanje139 and commune Bairro Operario. N’gola Kiluanje and Bairro Operario have communal administrations

138 Sambizanga stands for two words, the Kimbundu word sambila for dance and the Portuguese word zanga for struggle.

139 The bairro is named after the tribal leader N’gola Kiluanje who led a resistance movement against the Portuguese at the end of the 16th century.
while the Municipal Administration located in commune Sede also has the function of the Communal Administration.\textsuperscript{140} In the 19\textsuperscript{th} century, farmers from the inland occupied the area of Sambizanga and some of today's bairros are named after these original African land owners, as for example Marcal and Rangel (Kasack 1992: 67). From the early 1950s on, when resistance against the colonial power began to develop, Sambizanga became the home for neighbourhood groups which grew later into national political structures. Many of the political leadership came from this and other similar musseque communities (Cain 1986: 4).

Over the last decades, the municipality experienced a dramatic increase in inhabitants. While the 1983 census counted a population of 123,655 (Kasack 1992: 175), Sambizanga today has an estimated population of around 650,000 inhabitants (DW 2005d: 1). Sambizanga municipality has settlement characteristics that makes it belong to the typology of 'Old musseques' as defined in a recent research on peri-urban land in Luanda (DW and CEHS 2005: 90-93).

Figure 9: Satellite image of Valsaroca in Sambizanga Municipality\textsuperscript{141}

\textsuperscript{140} This however changed in 2006 when the commune Sede also received a communal administration. Interview with Leonardo Samunga, 8/4/07

\textsuperscript{141} Source: DW and CEHS 2003d
As other musseques of this typology, Sambizanga has been hemmed in lateral extension by the central city to the south and west, by the sea to the north and more recent musseque developments to the east. As a result, densities rose dramatically over the last decades as illustrated above by the contemporary population estimates, with an average of over three people per sleeping room (DW and CEHS 2005: 92). Being situated rather centrally in the contemporary city, the municipality offers some access to employment opportunities, this also being due to the presence of the biggest informal market in Luanda, Roque Santeiro, located within the municipality along the main road that links the city centre with the Cacuaco municipality in the north.

Poverty levels are very high (at 55 per cent) and the provision of public services is inadequate or non-existent, with mostly no piped water connections, no electricity and no drains. Information collected in one specific bairro within the municipality (Val Saroca) indicates that most residents acquired land through informal purchase, this usually being accompanied by a ‘purchase and sale declaration’ (DW and CEHS 2005). There is therefore no effective formal land use control, neither by the communal administration nor by the municipal administration, without any land cadastre existing at this level of government.

Source: DW and CEHS 2003d

As mentioned below, DW has been engaged in the Municipality in the provision of community managed water stand posts, these providing the almost only access to piped water by local residents.
There are several civil society organizations working in the municipality, including churches and local associations such as the Association of Water Committees. The Association of Water Committees' initial focus was to facilitate the contact between the Water Committees, the provincial water service provider EPAL and the Communal Administration. Over the time however, the Association widened its scope of activities and became involved in other development processes not related to water.

There are also resident committees working in each sector in the municipality. On the communal level, the resident committees elect a president who serves as the link to the Communal and Municipal Administration. In Sambizanga, some members of the committees are also officials of the Municipal Administration. Being relevant for the case study, it should also be noted that with DW’s facilitating role, a Municipal Forum was created with the aim to increase the participation of civil society in local development processes. The Forum is coordinated by the Municipal Vice-administrator and has a secretariat with four staff. The participants of the Forum are various churches (Don Bosco, the Catholic Church and the Universal Church), resident commissions, five local associations, a local administrator and the local representative of the Ministry of Women and Family.

6.6.2 Description of the planning process

The objectives of the participatory planning process were to develop a Municipal Activity Plan. This obviously went beyond any form of land use planning *per se*, but was considered essential as the basis for more integration of physical and social development issues, this making the case a potentially interesting comparative example with Integrated Development Plans developed by South African municipalities and discussed in chapter four. As such it is considered relevant as a case study for the objectives of this thesis.

One aim of the proposed process was that through its participatory preparation, the plan would gain credibility and address priorities as identified by several participants and not only by the Municipal Administration. This thus viewed participation as a means to an end, with the objective that through wider participation there would be an increased

---

144 Many of the resident committee members that participated in the municipal planning workshop as discussed below were officials of the Municipal Administration.

145 Interview with Leonardo Samunga, 2/9/05
possibility for the plan to be implemented. The participatory planning exercise lasted for 35 days in total. The process was coordinated by an external consultant who was contracted by DW for this purpose.\textsuperscript{146} It was implemented in three phases, as follows.

During \textbf{phase one} in June, a first meeting was held with the Municipal Administrator and Vice-administrator. They formally approved the planning project and facilitated the creation of a technical team that was to accompany the whole planning process. The team was composed of the Vice-administrator of Sambizanga Municipality, the head of the Municipality's Secretariat, the head of the Municipal Section of the Ministry of Family and the Promotion of Women, the governance official of the DW Sustainable Community Services Programme (SCSP) and the evaluation officer of DW's Monitoring and Research Unit. A second meeting was held with the Communal Administrators, Municipal Administrator and the technical team. This meeting served to create a better understanding of the contemporary municipal planning practice, to reflect about the advantages and disadvantages of participatory planning and to elaborate an agenda and methodology for the participatory planning process.\textsuperscript{147}

During \textbf{phase two} in June and July, a five day workshop was held in all of the three communes with participants from government, private sector and civil society. The workshops facilitated a participatory analysis of the actual development reality, the desired reality and the identification and definition of priorities. The workshops were held from 3-7 pm, these hours being chosen by the staff of the local administrations because it permitted them to attend their work normally from 8 am to 3 pm. The diagrams and list of priorities that represented the outcome of these workshops were then all compiled into one single document (Administracação Municipal do Sambizanga 2005) and distributed to the participants of a subsequent municipal workshop.

The municipal workshop was held during \textbf{phase three} in August, lasting for three days (2-4 August) and with the participation of 61 representatives from different state, civil society and private sector institutions as presented in Figure one below (DW 2005b). The objective of this workshop was the presentation and debate of the results of the communal workshops and to identify priorities for the municipality. The workshop was held from 3-

\textsuperscript{146} The consultant was Brazilian with extensive work experience in Angola. She had previously participated in similar participatory processes in Brazil.

\textsuperscript{147} Interview with Leonardo Samunga, 2/9/05
6 pm each day and the locality of the event was the Don Bosco high school which is situated in the commune Sede of Sambizanga. The plan that represented the final outcome of the workshop identified 18 priority objectives divided into seven categories including many aspects of sustainability in its social, economic and environmental dimension (DW 2005c). Following table provides a summary of the plan.

Table 6: Structure and priority objectives of the Municipal Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programme</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Public Security</td>
<td>To improve the performance of the police</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2 Water and sanitation | To improve public cleaning  
To improve the treatment of liquid waste  
To improve water provision                                                                |
| 3 Health           | To increase the capacity of health service provision                                                                                |
| 4 Education        | To increase access to education  
To preserve schools  
To incentivate the practice of reading and research  
To guarantee the access to literacy                                                      |
| 5 Commerce         | To reorganize the vendors in the municipality                                                                                            |
| 6 Employment       | To improve access to employment                                                                                                        |
| 7 Urban planning   | To do a diagnostic of the contemporary situation  
Participatory elaboration of a municipal physical plan  
Public consultation / approval of the plan / monitoring of implementation  
Infrastructures: to rehabilitate the roads of all communes in the municipality  
Transit management  
Settlement upgrading: diminish the expansion of anarchic housing construction and promote regularisation of land  
Improvement of the environment such as the removal of car wrecks |

Responding to programme point seven, DW initiated a pilot upgrading project in the commune of N'gola Kiluanje that included aspects of land regularisation and settlement upgrading. Besides being a result of the Sambizanga planning process, this pilot project was also influenced by the research on peri-urban land access and tenure that was concluded in the same year (DW and CEHS 2005), as mentioned earlier in chapter three. Part of the research dissemination process was training on pilot upgrading projects, provided by CEHS and DW, with the participation of a wide range of government and non-government institutions. In this training, a first project proposal for a pilot upgrading
project in N'gola Kiluanje was elaborated by the participants in the training. Several meetings were then held with the communal administration, this having taken place shortly after the implementation of the Sambizanga planning process. A team of DW staff further participated in an intensive training on urban planning and pilot project management at Heriot-Watt University in October 2005 provided by CEHS. A second training for the same staff was then held after the initial phase of the project in March 2006, again at Heriot-Watt University.

While some of the staff was trained for the implementation of a similar project in Huambo\textsuperscript{148}, two other members of the team prepared the implementation of the project in the commune of N'gola Kiluanje. The specific focus of this pilot project was to establish a register of current land occupation in three specific neighbourhoods within N'gola Kiluanje and to assist land rights holders to achieve secure forms of tenure and prepare the basis for a gradual urban upgrading programme through an initial participatory land use planning exercise (Festo et.al. 2005). From the beginning however, the project encountered several obstacles. One main challenge was the fact that the Municipal Administrator of Sambizanga was substituted shortly after the participatory planning process, with his successor having much less interest in participatory planning approaches as promoted by DW and its partners.\textsuperscript{149} Principally because of this lack of local government support, the project therefore never succeeded in overcoming the planning phase, providing an interesting case, however, for showing the huge challenges that any urban upgrading project in Luanda faces.

6.6.3 Levels of participation and the contribution to sustainable development

The participatory planning in Sambizanga enjoyed support from the Municipal Administration who actually took over as the driver of the process. The Administration acknowledged that the planning process gave it new capacities and knowledge necessary

\textsuperscript{148} This being the lay-out planning and slum-upgrading pilot project in Bairro Fátima, Huambo, discussed as a case study of participatory urban planning in chapter seven of this thesis.

\textsuperscript{149} The substitution of the Sambizanga municipal administrator is most probably not linked to his involvement in the participatory planning process. This form of sudden reshuffling of local administrations in Luanda has been observed in several instances and on large scales, without any clear indication of the reasons behind it. This phenomenon is arguably another indicator of a governance context with little transparency and accountability.
for decentralised municipal governance. In the communal workshops however, there was a remarkably weak participation of government institutions and political parties. Even from the local administration very few attended. In the municipal workshop on the other hand, representatives from the local administrations, MPLA, UNITA and other political parties were well presented. Two major public service providers, ELISAL (solid waste removal) and EPAL (water), only participated in the municipal level. Other service providers participating in the N’gola Kiluanje workshop were all from the health sector. Numerous representatives from the resident commissions participated in all workshops and were considered as having an important role in the implementation and monitoring of the decisions taken. Associations and churches were well represented in all workshops, especially in the N’gola Kiluanje workshop. The private sector however was almost completely absent in all the workshops (DW 2005d).

Figure 11: Participation of institutions

Overall therefore, there was a relatively broad spectrum of participants from different sectors, especially from the state and civil society. Comparing to the other two communes, N’gola Kiluanje showed a greater number of participants, this possibly due to the longer presence of DW in this specific commune, having succeeded in mobilising, with the assistance of the local administration, a greater number of institutions to participate in the planning process.

While there are arguably interesting levels of institutional participation, data collected in the planning process also permits to make some analysis of other aspects of participation, such as gender and youth representation and power relations.

150 Interview with Leonardo Samunga, 2/9/05
The participation of women was relatively low. The highest participation was with 21 per cent in the communal workshop in Bairro Operario, and the lowest one with 9 per cent in the communal workshop in N’gola Kiluanje. It was observed that many of those women that were present showed a weak participation in the discussions. It was also observed that the youth participated more in the municipal level workshops that on the communal level.  

Table 7: Total number of participants and percentage of women

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Locality</th>
<th>Total no.</th>
<th>% of women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commune Sede</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commune N'gola Kiluanje</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commune Bairro Operario</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Workshop</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Clashes among representatives of the two main political parties MPLA and UNITA was reported in one instance in one of the communal workshops, this being a manifestation of power linked to broader provincial and national politics in Angola.

The lack of women’s participation and clashes of political parties during the participation process are indicators of the unequal power relations between the different participants in the process, these being explained by the cultural and political context. These examples are therefore an indicator of the importance in acknowledging the issue of power in all stages of a planning process, in this case in conducting participatory workshops. While many conflicts can be resolved on the bases of argument (a key argument of collaborative planning), it is doubtful whether culturally and politically deep seated power inequalities such as the ones described above can be resolved in the rather brief period of a planning process such as in Sambizanga and with the limited resources available.

Looking at the contribution of the planning process to sustainable development, it can be observed that the plan that resulted from the participatory planning process clearly includes aspects of sustainability in all three dimensions, social, economic and environmental. No aspect of the plan however has been implemented to date and therefore, the plan did not contribute to any immediate sustainable development process.

151 As the age of the participants was not recorded, it was not possible to do a statistical analysis about this variable.
The main reason arguably is due to the lack of funds, but also related to the change of leadership within the Municipal Administration. As mentioned above in regard to the N’gola Kiluanje pilot project, the change of the Municipal Administrator shortly after the planning exercise proved a serious setback.

6.7 Conclusions

This chapter first provided an overview of the development context of Luanda, pointing out extreme rapid urban growth linked to very low levels of sustainability of contemporary urban development in its social, economic and environmental aspects.

The chapter also provided an overview of the local governance context that provides very limited spaces for participation with a strong direct influence of the Presidency, a relatively strong provincial government (albeit often sidelined by the parallel lines of authority based in the Presidency), very weak municipal and communal administrations and a civil society mainly organized around a few key issues such as forced evictions, often relying on international agency support. The analysis also showed that the governance context in Luanda reflects the broader national governance context as discussed in chapter five. The discussion further pointed out that this link to the broader governance context is also apparent in the lack of legislation that would guide urban development and planning in Luanda, the only key legislation being the one discussed in chapter five, the evolving legal framework on decentralisation, the new Land Law and the new Territorial Planning Law. Also, the role of civil society in participating in decision-making processes in Luanda was considered rather weak, albeit probably being the strongest in comparison with other cities in Angola and with an arguably growing influence.

Looking at some examples of contemporary planning and development practice in Luanda, it was concluded that while some activities such as the construction of new condominiums do make a contribution to urban development, the arguably most pressing problems linked to increased social and economic exclusion through rapid peri-urban expansion are not dealt with in any appropriate and effective way.

Based on this assessment, the thesis suggested examining as a case study a recent participatory municipal planning process implemented by the municipality of Sambizanga
in partnership with the international NGO Development Workshop. The case study provided an interesting example of how a more participatory planning approach can be initiated in a challenging environment such as in Luanda. Despite the huge challenges due to the contemporary development and governance context as summarised above, participation in the planning process could be considered as rather successful, taking into account the number of representatives from civil society that were included, this especially compared to very exclusionary nature of municipal planning as usually practiced in Angola as pointed out in chapter five. In the Sambizanga case it was argued that especially important was the long term relationship of DW (that introduced the idea of the participatory planning process) with the local administrations and community organizations, this providing the necessary trust that contributed to the implementation of the planning process. Issues of power did play an important role, and in some instances the differences of interests and values between different participants were difficult to reconcile. It seems however that effective workshop facilitation was able to overcome these bottlenecks. It can therefore be argued that the Sambizanga Municipal Administration and DW managed to develop a participatory approach appropriate in the specific case study context, integrated into the existing planning framework and respecting local decision-making processes.

However, the case study failed to take the planning outcome forward and make a direct contribution to sustainable urban development. This failure reflects a focus on planning process and outcome rather than impact, an issue that was identified earlier in this thesis as a characteristic of some of the discussed planning theories, as well as participatory approaches in development studies and development policy as promoted for example by the Cities Alliance. For participatory planning as experienced in Sambizanga to become relevant in the context of Angola, it must address the shortcomings as identified in this chapter. Future similar processes for example could be more successful if linked to financial resources, separate to those available to the municipal administration, these being insufficient for implementing municipal plans such as elaborated in the Sambizanga case study. In parallel, such actions arguably also need to engage more with higher authorities (such as provincial governments and central government ministries) where resources are concentrated.

Perhaps most importantly, the example shows the very restricting nature of the local governance context as it exists in contemporary Angola, despite the rhetoric of
decentralisation and local development. Compared to urban governance in São Paulo and Johannesburg, the governance context of Luanda provides an arguably much more challenging and difficult environment. Urban development trends are much more extreme, with higher urban growth rates coupled with very high levels of social and economic exclusion. Also, urban governance actors are much weaker than in both São Paulo and Johannesburg, and the relationships between the actors are less developed, especially between the state and civil society. And in terms of policy and legislation, both Brazil and South Africa have developed a much more comprehensive and coherent framework for tackling urban challenges, linked to programmes such as Bairro Legal that reflect this policy and use progressive legislation. Based on this analysis, it was concluded that the success of Bairro Legal and Jo’burg 2030 were strongly related to:

- the programmes’ ‘embeddedness’ in national policy and support by appropriate legislation;
- the relatively advanced stage of effective decentralisation;
- strong civil society; and,
- a history of (reasonably) effective urban planning that contributed to urban development.

This chapter showed that these contextual factors that contributed to success of Bairro Legal and Jo’burg 2030 do not exist in Angola. It is therefore argued that if participatory planning as presented in this chapter is to become more relevant for urban development there must be, besides improvements of the proper planning approach, a broader change in the governance context. But urban planning would not only benefit from such broader change, it can arguably also contribute to it through the practice of participatory approaches that can become included in policy, legislation and programmes.

The next chapter examines another participatory planning process in Huambo, a secondary city in central Angola.
Chapter 7: Huambo Case Study – Participatory Local Lay-out Planning

7.1 Introduction

This chapter examines a participatory planning case study that was implemented in Huambo, a secondary urban centre in central Angola. The case study is examined following the analytical framework presented in the conclusions of chapter two, responding to following research questions:

2.1 What are contemporary urban development trends and what forms of sustainable urban development would be desirable in the case study city?
2.2 What is the governance context of the case studies and what kind of participatory mechanisms are practiced within this context?
2.3 What are the legal framework, policy and contemporary practice of urban planning in the case study context?
2.4 What kind of participatory planning is the case study presenting and how does it contribute to the desired sustainable development of the city?

In order to respond to research question 2.1, the section following the historic overview of development, governance and urban planning in Huambo looks at contemporary urban development trends in Huambo. The following section then responds to research question 2.2, examining the governance context of Huambo. Responding to research question 2.3, the next section looks at urban planning legislation, policy and practice in Huambo. As in the Luanda case study, the information provided by these three sections is meant to complement information provided earlier by chapter five. The final section before the conclusions then discusses a participatory planning case study, responding to research question 2.4.

As explained in chapter three, the literature review, interviews and observations that contributed to this chapter were conducted from July 2005 to June 2006, with most of the interviews having been conducted in 2006.\textsuperscript{152}

\textsuperscript{152} For a full list of interviews, refer to Appendix 1.
7.2 Urban development, governance and planning in Huambo – A historic overview

The province of Huambo lies in the central highlands of Angola. It comprises an area of 35,771 km² and borders the province of Kuanza Sul to the northwest, Bié to the north and east, Benguela to the west, and Huíla to the south. Huambo city is on an altitude of 1,700 metres above sea level. The ecological conditions of this region have attracted settlers for a long time. An archaeological site in the south of the province provides information about early inhabitants that have practiced agriculture and knew how to work iron, at least 1,300 years ago (Neto 2003). During hundreds of years the local economy was based on agriculture, hunting and gathering and the holding of domestic animals. From the 16th century on, the slave trade started to penetrate the area, bringing with it the introduction of textiles, brandy and fire-arms. At this time, there were several kingdoms that governed the region. The most well known were the kingdoms of Mbalundu (Bailundo), Viye (Bié), Wambu (Huambo), Ngalangi (Galangue), Sambu (Sambo), Ndulu (Andulo), Cingolo (Quingolo) and Ciyaka (Quiaca) (Neto 2003). From 1773-1776, the Portuguese tried for the first time to conquer the highlands. Although they defeated the Bailundo kingdom, they could not hold the territory and had to withdraw to the coast.

During the 19th century, the slave trade was substituted by the trade in ivory, rubber and wax. In the southern half of Angola, the Ovimbundu were the main intermediaries in this trade between the inland and the coast (Neto 2003). Towards the end of the 19th century, the Portuguese started the final conquest of the highlands and in succession, subjected the local kingdoms such as Bié in 1890, Bailundu in 1896 and Huambo in 1902, with the last resistance only broken in 1904. The first military fort was established in 1902 in Quissala on the north-eastern perimeter of today’s city. The city however was not established there, but on the highest point of the area which is today’s plaza where the Provincial Government and several provincial departments are located (Neto 2003). On 21 September 1912, governor Norton de Matos inaugurated the City of Huambo which was however still to be built beside the new railway station that marked the arrival of the Benguela Railways (Caminho de Ferro de Benguela – CFB) (Neto 2003). Legislation of 1928 elevated the city of Huambo to the capital of Angola and gave it the name of ‘New Lisbon’ (Nova Lisboa). Luanda officially became the provisional capital, but the city of Huambo in fact never became the capital of the country and until the 1940s it did not have electric light, water or sewers (MINUA 2003: 17). A large area however was

---

153 This site is known as Feti and lies close to the Ngove dam in Kaala municipality.
reserved for the city to develop and within this the construction of shacks or any other form of temporary housing, that would be contrary to the European character of the city, was prohibited (MINUA 2003: 17). But European in-migration was less than expected and in 1940 the city of Huambo had a mere 16,000 inhabitants (MINUA 2003: 28).

Until the 1950s, the city was little more than a commercial staging post and an administrative centre connected to the railway workshops. The small city of Huambo had, however, a clear colonial form of settlement, with a more rigid social and racial division than the much older cities of Luanda and Benguela (MINUA 2003: 17). During the 1950s and 1960s, the city underwent rapid demographic growth and expansion, in parallel with the development of an industrial park, and in the 1960’s the Institute of Agronomic Investigation and the Agronomy and Veterinary Faculty were created as extensions of the University of Luanda (MINUA 2003: 17). The attraction for the many European immigrants was the pleasant climate of the central highlands, considered less harsh for Europeans, but also the possibilities of development in the southern regions of the country which had excellent agricultural potential. Huambo itself continued to be principally a white city, while small areas of houses of the African population grew gradually at the city periphery, maintaining the social and racial separation. At the time it was still possible to graze animals and practice agriculture in the free spaces between these peripheral house groups and the inhabitants of these bairros continued to return to rural areas in certain seasons of the year to do agricultural work (MINA 2003: 17).

In 1975, as in Angola in general, the majority of the white population left Huambo and after a few months of being controlled by UNITA, the city was conquered and subsequently administered by the MPLA government until the early 1990s. The true transformation of the small house groups to peri-urban bairros dates from the period after 1980 (MINUA 2003: 17). During the early 1980s UNITA began occupying areas in the central highlands and this insecurity caused a gradual movement towards the city by people from the villages and nearby municipalities. Due to this insecurity, the rural area around the city of Huambo, three to five kilometres from the city centre, became depopulated and that population lived concentrated in the peri-urban areas. The growth of peri-urban zones continued within the previous peri-urban perimeter, principally for two reasons: outside this zone there were fields that belonged to individuals that had never left the city, and which were therefore not available, and the fact that this zone was also more secure since it was already inhabited (MINUA 2003: 17).
Most of the extensive human suffering and infrastructural damage that the city experienced dates to the war that broke out again after the elections in 1992. In January 1993, UNITA initiated the conquest of the city through a sustained attack, using conventional weaponry such as long range artillery within the urban perimeter. This urban war alone - which became known as the ‘55 days war’ - killed some 10,000 people and destroyed much of the urban infrastructure (Human Rights Watch 1994: 89-92). The city then suffered continuous damage until the signing of the Lusaka protocol in 1994, mainly through government aerial bombardments. Again with the subsequent outbreak of war in 1998, Huambo was shelled by UNITA’s long range artillery, but compared to the 1992-1994 period, damage was more limited.

Today’s large peri-urban areas consist mostly of adobe built houses with zinc roofs and clusters of old houses with tiled roofs which are a legacy of the colonial time. Densities of these peri-urban areas vary, ranging from consolidated areas where plot boundaries are built up with high walls to disperse settlements where agriculture is still common. Many bairros in Huambo cover a variety of peri-urban settlement types, and indeed sometimes a bairro includes urban and peri-urban areas (DW and CEHS 2003c: 46).
Figure 12: Satellite Image of Huambo, with the urban core perimeter (red), also referred to as 'inner city' and the peri-urban perimeter (blue).\textsuperscript{154}

Source: DW and CEHS 2003d

Figure 13: Colonial house in bairro S. José\textsuperscript{155}

\textsuperscript{154} Satellite image (Quickbird, dated May 2003) provided by Development Workshop Angola, perimeters introduced by the author.

\textsuperscript{155} Source: DW and CEHS 2003d
7.3 Sustainability of contemporary development processes

During the post-independence war, violence and destitution have resulted in a complex flux of in and out-migration in the city. Overall, the fighting in the central highlands led to an abrupt reduction of the number of people living in this part of the country. They fled to the coast, in particular to the cities of Luanda, Benguela, Lobito and Lubango (MINUA 2003: 12-13). Others who fled the rural areas and municipal towns settled in Huambo. With the end of the war in 2002, many of these migration patterns reversed with people returning to their places of origin. Contemporary estimates suggest continued and high population growth rates for the next two decades, especially in peri-urban areas. Recent research in several peri-urban areas suggests that the population growth in these areas is due to the high fertility rate as well as in-migration, either from other areas in the city or from other municipalities (DW and CEHS 2005). The Huambo/Kaala strategic plan estimates the population of Huambo city at 390,000 in 2004 and predicts a population of almost 900,000 by the year 2025, meaning that the city is expected to more than double within the next twenty years (Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 28).

Source: DW and CEHS 2003d

The research counted some 72 per cent of the interviewed reporting to have moved in from elsewhere. Some 36 per cent reported to have moved in from another municipality, and some 24 per cent from another province. In relation to in-migration the research found low levels of actual and intended out-migration, concluding that in-migration will contribute considerably to the future growth of the city (DW and CEHS 2005: 116).

The Huambo/Kaala structural plan is discussed in greater detail later in this chapter.
 Poverty levels in Huambo are related to the very high degree of social exclusion. In recent research in peri-urban areas 33 per cent of respondents were qualitatively assessed as destitute and 57 per cent as very poor (DW and CEHS 2005: 117). Further, access to infrastructure such as water, electricity, health and education tends to be low in most peri-urban areas (DW and CEHS 2003d: 57). In almost all of Huambo’s peri-urban areas, there is for example no piped water, with residents getting water through unprotected and protected water wells. Also, levels of electricity supply are non-existent or erratic in most peri-urban areas. Levels of social exclusion are also characterised by the lack of documentary evidence for land tenure. The same research reported that 61 per cent of the respondents had no document at all (not even informal) that would support the right to their land (DW and CEHS 2005: 115). Land regularisation, the provision of basic services

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Huambo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1940</td>
<td>16,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>38,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>61,885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>390,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>530,736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>645,722</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td>766,915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2025</td>
<td>893,389</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

159 Apart from the numbers dating from 2003 and 2005, all data is cited from different sources in: MINUA 2002: 28
160 Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 1
161 Projection with estimated 4.5% growth rate from 2003-2010 (Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 14)
162 Projection with estimated 4.0% growth rate from 2011-2015 (Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 14)
163 Projection with estimated 3.5% growth rate from 2016-2020 (Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 14)
164 Projection with estimated 3.5% growth rate from 2021-2025 (Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 14)
to peri-urban areas, as well as an improved road network therefore arguably are some of the main factors for making development in Huambo more socially inclusive.

Economic development in Huambo is characterised by a rapidly expanding formal private sector. While in 2002 there were only a handful of formal private sector businesses, the city today is bustling with shops, covering local needs such as in the fields of construction, electronics, food and beverages and household supplies. In parallel to the fast developing private sector however, the informal economy continues to provide the main source of income for most residents in peri-urban areas. Recent research estimated more than 17,000 vendors in the ten biggest markets in Huambo and a total 77 per cent of households relying on small and microeconomic activities for their survival (DW 2006a: 40).

The big informal peri-urban market places however are beginning to be relocated towards more peripheral areas, with important implications for vendors and clients as discussed below. In 2006 for example, the biggest informal market in Huambo (São Pedro) has been relocated to a peripheral area with much more limited access than in its previous location. Similar relocations towards more peripheral areas are planned for the remaining informal markets within the city. To date, the government has not publicly and explicitly acknowledged the policy that is behind these market removals. It may however be assumed that implicit policy is influenced by inner city based formal private sector interests that regard the informal markets as a major competition in the local bulk and retail business. This issue in fact can arguably be considered as a conflict between the different dimensions of sustainability, between formal private sector interests and the common interests of the poorer peri-urban residents that rely on the informal market as their source of income.

With the removal of the big informal markets, transport costs for vendors and clients have increased, making these markets increasingly less competitive compared to the growing number of shops based in the inner city. Huambo also has three main industrial areas\(^{165}\) but by 2004 only about 5 per cent of the factories were actually working (Dar Al-
Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 9). While the improvement of provision of basic services and better access roads to peri-urban areas are important factors to facilitate the economic inclusion of the poor, there seems also to be an urgent need for the city to develop an explicit economic development policy on how to deal with the informal sector on which most of the population still depends for survival.

Environmental hazards are especially high for peri-urban residents, illustrated by the cholera outbreak in 2006 that has only affected peri-urban areas and not the urban core (Ondaka 2007: January). The government’s failure to contain the outbreak well into 2007 shows the risks of contaminated sources of water and low levels of hygiene as encountered in many peri-urban areas. The improvement of sanitary conditions therefore is a key aspect for improving the environmental sustainability of urban development in Huambo.

7.4 The urban governance context

Huambo city is situated within the municipality of Huambo, the municipality being divided into three communes, these being the communes Sede, Chipipa and Calima. The city is within the commune Sede which is divided into six bairro administrations, these being Bandeira, Comandante Vilinga, Kapango, Xavier Samacau, Cacilhas, and Nzagi.166

Responsibility for urban land use management in the so-called inner city and government guided expansion areas167 is with the Provincial Department of Urbanism and Environment (DPUA) which is the provincial representation of the Ministry of Urbanism and Environment.168 Two national institutes are also working within the management structure of DPUA, these being the provincial delegations of INOTU and IGCA. DPUA has overall responsibility for urban and environmental affairs in Huambo, while INOTU has responsibilities in the area of urban planning and IGCA is responsible for the land...

166 The administrative divisions of bairro administrations is a specific phenomenon of commune Sede in Huambo province, dating to the 1980s when the commune was subdivided into these bairro administrations for city defense purposes against UNITA encroachment. Interview with Bairro Administrator of Cacilhas, 15/6/06

167 The government’s role in these expansion areas is discussed in the following section under the heading ‘Government led lay-out planning and land allocation for housing’.

168 Interview with Moises Festo, 28/3/07
For a city of approximately 390,000 inhabitants, these institutions are arguably acutely under-staffed and under-funded. Research conducted in 2004 revealed that DPUA, INOTU and IGCA have some 35 staff altogether with only one of them with university education (DW 2004). Also, INOTU and IGCA are restricted in their work radius due to a lack of transport. There is also no up-dated land cadastre in Huambo. The only existing cadastre is the one comprising buildings in the inner city, but this is located in the Provincial Department of the Ministry of Justice, and is also outdated, based primarily on the pre-independence Portuguese property ownership.

According to different sources, the process of government decentralisation is not much felt in reality. This means that municipal and bairro administrations in fact do not have the capacities to comply with those responsibilities attributed previously by Decree Law 17/99 and now the new law on de-concentration, Decree Law 02/07. The only contemporary land use management function actually undertaken by the Municipal Administration is land and building control through a team of officials (fiscais), checking whether construction sites are properly licensed. Although having much more limited resources, evidence suggests that local bairro administrations have a more direct land use management role that the Municipal Administration. Bairro administrations are physically located within or close to the peri-urban areas and land use issues are often solved at this level. Further, in government guided lay-out planning and land allocation, DPUA and INOTU are working directly with the bairro administrations and not through the Municipal Administration.

169 IGCA’s responsibility for the land cadastre however is very recent, only having been defined by the not yet effective land regulations which were discussed in chapter five.
170 Interview with Provincial Director of IGCA, 13/6/06
171 This is the Building Registry (registo predial).
172 Interview with Bairro Administrator of Cacilhas, 15/6/06; Interview with Provincial Director of MINPLAN, 4/7/06
173 This information is based on personal experience that the author has made with these officials when building his residence in 2007. The three required licences are the Purchase Licence (Licença de Arrematação), the Licence of the Plot Limits (Licença de Vedação) and the Construction Licence (Licença de Construção).
174 Interview with Bairro Administrator of Cacilhas, 15/6/06
175 Interview with Moises Festo, 28/3/07. Government led lay-out planning and land allocation is discussed in greater detail below.
Looking at civil society, there is a range of local and national NGOs working in Huambo, all located in the central, formal city. Their interventions include areas such as HIV/AIDS, civic education, human rights and electoral education. In most peri-urban areas, recent research found that there are very few if any local associations (DW 2003). The most important civil society organizations in these areas are the different church denominations that are often implementing social activities as well as spiritual ones. While not exactly in the domain of civil society, traditional authorities still play an important role in the local governance context in peri-urban areas, this having been discussed in some detail in chapter five.

Levels of participation in the local governance context are very low. Bairro administrations tend to regularly meet with those sobas within their administrative limits, but not with any other actors such as church representatives or civil society organizations.176

Summarising, this section highlights the extremely rapid urban growth of Huambo city, with rapidly expanding peri-urban areas. Related to this urban growth are high levels of poverty, social and economic exclusion, and environmental hazards that are a danger to public health. The local governance context is characterised by a strong role of the Provincial Government in urban land use management with only minor responsibilities for municipal and bairro administrations. Civil society organizations are relatively weak in Huambo and in many peri-urban areas the only civil society organizations that exist are the different church denominations.

The next section examines how different actors of the local governance context are dealing with urban expansion through different approaches to urban planning and development.

7.5 Important contemporary planning and development processes in Huambo

7.5.1 Structure and master planning

Shortly after the end of the war in 2002, the international consultancy firm Dar Al-Handasah proposed to the Government the elaboration of structure and master plans of

176 Interview with Moises Festo, 28/3/07
several provincial capitals. This proposal was approved by Council of Ministers shortly thereafter and the Huambo/Kaala structure plan was one of the first plans elaborated, with the ones of Benguela, Zaire, and Cabinda to follow.¹⁷⁷ The content of the plan is based on a population growth of more than 500,000 people between 2004 and 2025, reaching by then a total population of 893,389 (Dar Al Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 14). This population would need a housing stock of around 128,000 dwellings, assuming an average occupancy of 7 persons per dwelling. The plan suggests housing in various densities through a combination of housing standards that reflect the demand of the different income groups. The projected densities are low by international standards, even the projected ‘high’ density areas of 122 persons per hectare. For the structure plan, an average density of 103 persons per hectare is applied. Based on these numbers, the plan suggests an expansion area of 3,500 hectares until 2025.

To respond to the projected housing need, the plan suggests that the city expands towards the south and west in the direction of Kaala, pointing out the favourable topography and availability of water through the river Kunhangamua. The plan follows a logic of hierarchic centres, with the city centre at the top of the hierarchy. Then follow the suburb centre to serve a population of 100,000 to 200,000, the district centre to serve a population of 30,000 to 50,000 and the neighbourhood centre to serve a population of 8,000 to 15,000. Water provision is planned through a collection system at the Kuando river to a treatment plant adjacent to the Nanguenha river and gravity delivery to several distribution centres that serve all urban and peri-urban areas through a network that is aimed to provide household water connections. This structure plan is currently the only such plan being elaborated in Huambo province. While the Provincial Department of Planning has instructed DPUA to guide the elaboration of master plans for all municipalities, this has not taken place to date, mainly due to the lack of funds. In those municipalities without a master plan, the administrations are instructed to consult traditional authorities in order to take decisions on urban land use and expansion on what is effectively an ad-hoc basis.¹⁷⁸

¹⁷⁷ Confidential Interview with MINUA official, November 2005
¹⁷⁸ Interview with Provincial Director of MINPLAN, 4/7/06
There was basically no participation taking place in the elaboration of the urban plan for the city, with not even the Provincial Government, DPÚA, INOTU or IGCA being actively involved. For the elaboration of the plan, the consultant team paid a short visit to Huambo, drew up the plan and then ‘offered’ it to the Provincial Government. Some government institutions were called for a meeting where the plan was presented and participants could give some comments. Whether contributions were taken on board is not clear however. It has been felt by some provincial government staff who participated in this meeting that there should be more involvement of local government structures.

Early evidence suggests that the plan has limited influence in guiding urban development. For example, while the plan confirms the location of the São Pedro market beside the railway lines (Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 12), the market was

---


180 Interview with Provincial Director of IGCA, 13/06/06

181 Confidential interview with MINUA official, November 2005

182 Interview with Provincial Director of IGCA, 13/06/06
actually been replaced to another location in 2006. Similarly, the plan predicts an expansion of the Kanata market at the eastern exit road towards Kuito (Dar Al-Handasah and Odebrecht 2003a: 12). In the meantime however, the area designated for market expansion (Santa Iria) has been allocated for housing and the market itself is rumoured to be relocated further out of town. Similarly, concerns have been voiced of the plan’s failure in projecting industrial expansion in bairro São Pedro along the road towards Kaala, this being a contemporary development trend. Also, and this is arguably a fundamental issue, the plan does not suggest any way to finance these developments, nor how the currently weak government structures should be able to guide the implementation of the plan technically or administratively. As the discussion below shows, the government is currently even struggling to simply provide some reasonably organized residential areas for self-help housing and some private-public partnerships have only been initiated to build a few up-market condominiums for residential use.

7.5.2 Private-public partnerships for condominium developments

Since the end of the war in 2002, four different condominium projects have begun to be developed in Huambo city, without however any construction having initiated at the time of writing. Two of the developments, located on the road to the airport, are in partnerships between the provincial government and the private sector. A third, very recently initiated development on the road from Huambo to Kaala is a private-public partnership between the Provincial Government and EDURB, the contract having been signed in early 2007 with also no development initiated to the date of writing. A fourth development, discussed in greater detail below is linked to a broader governance and development process examined in chapter six, the GRN national urban project.

As pointed out in the previous chapter, the GRN urban project allocated 10,000 housing units to the province of Huambo. Originally, the location for this development was a site south of Kaala, some 25 kilometres west of Huambo city. According to one interviewee, members of the Chinese construction company involved in the project landed on the planned site with helicopters, established residences for the construction team without previously informing neither the local population nor the administration in Kaala.

---

183 Interview with Provincial Director of MINPLAN, 4/7/06
184 Confidential interview with DPUA official, February 2007
185 Confidential interview with Senior NGO worker in Huambo to which farmers, displaced through this occupation, turned for help, January 2007
area was occupied over a period of time, without however any further developments. It seems then however that the location was subsequently identified as not suitable for the kind of planned development and a new location was found in Chiva, a peripheral bairro to the east of the city of Huambo. Again, no developments have initiated to the date of writing.

There has been no participation in the above process, which has been marked by a lack of information to several key stakeholders, including the local administrations, the population affected by the development and the public in general. Concerns about the GRN condominiums as a contribution for sustainable urban development in Huambo have also been raised. One concern is about the form of development, arguing that 15 floor high-rise buildings are not appropriate for peripheral zones. Another argument is about the location, arguing that such developments for middle and upper class, fenced off from low-income areas such as Chiva will create social problems in the future. As in Luanda therefore, the sustainability of this model of urban development is questionable, especially in terms of its social and economic exclusion of the lower middle class and the poor.

7.5.3 Government led layout planning and land allocation for housing

Since 2002, the Provincial Government of Huambo is developing a programme of layout planning and land allocation for housing. Depending on the location, the process is either led by INOTU or directly by the Technical Department in DPUA. The areas targeted by this process are mostly green field sites within the current city perimeter, not peripheral expansion areas. Lay-out plans for these areas are elaborated by a technician from the Provincial Government, but without any participation from civil society. Before the allocation of plots, access and distribution roads are identified, marked with stakes and opened with the relevant machinery. The roads are very basic, not compacted and sometimes without any form of surface water drainage. In some of the project sites, the plots themselves are not marked with stakes prior to the distribution. In these cases, those identified as beneficiaries meet the relevant government technicians on a specified day in the project area, bring stakes themselves and measure their plots in the presence of the

---

186 These concerns have been raised independently by two senior provincial government officials during confidential interviews in June and July 2006.
187 Interview with Moises Festo, 28/3/07
technicians. It is then the responsibility of the new land occupant to obtain the necessary documents for construction.

The land allocation process is managed by DPUA who chooses beneficiaries among the applicants that have pending land request processes with DPUA. Anyone who seeks a plot for housing can deposit an official request at DPUA, this being almost free of costs except some minimal administrative charges. Currently, DPUA has some 4,000 pending processes\(^{188}\) and many applicants are already waiting for more than two years.\(^{189}\) Kalumanda, being the first project site where land was allocated in 2003 shows some other difficulties in relation to land use and building control that follows the land allocation. While the area today is fully developed with a mixture of residents - that judging by the housing found in the area include many upper-middle class residents - the area has lost some of its organized character. Some of the roads have become diverted and narrowed through buildings encroaching on both sides, and to date there is no infrastructure provided to the area.

**Participation is limited** in this government led lay-out planning process where DPUA and INOTU only undertake some consultation with the local administrations but not with any organizations from civil society.\(^{190}\) Further, the previous occupants of the areas being developed, formerly used for agricultural purposes, are not compensated.

This form of government led planning does have an immediate impact on urban development as construction by residents starts immediately after the land allocation process. The process is sustainable in the way that many lower income residents can have access to land and that the land is legal as being allocated by the government.\(^{191}\) The limited provision for access and transport through often narrow roads is however a possible constraint for future infrastructure upgrading and therefore economic development and social and economic inclusion. Equally, the lack of basic infrastructure development constrains the elimination of environmental and public health risks.

\(^{188}\) Confidential interview with DPUA official, January 2007

\(^{189}\) Informal interviews with people that have pending requests, February 2007

\(^{190}\) Interview with Moises Festo, 28/3/07

\(^{191}\) While the land is legal, it can still be difficult for the occupants to even get the three basic licences for construction, due to the lack of resources of the institution that is providing these licences (DPUA). These licences are also the basis for requesting a land concession or, under the new law also, a land property title.
The lay-out planning and land allocation process promoted by the Provincial Government can be characterised as an effective way of promoting certain levels of sustainable urban development, given the limited resources available by DPUA and INOTU who are leading this process. These planning processes however are limited in scale and do not include the more peripheral and rapidly expanding areas of informal settlements. Although showing aspects of social inclusion and efficient use of limited resources, this form of planning does not succeed to respond to the high demand of land for housing and therefore has a limited impact on sustainable development. A further shortcoming is the lack of compensation for the occupants of the land being urbanised. The participatory planning case study in the next section shows a rather simple way how this could take place.

7.5.4 Informal settlements – expansion without planning

Condominium developments and the government’s land lay-out and allocation programme are focusing mainly on infill areas within the existing urban perimeter. At the same time, as in Luanda, informal settlements further increase in density and expand without planning and any efficient land use control. In these areas, land allocation is guided by the informal market. Recent research in peri-urban areas in Huambo pointed out that the most widely reported form of land access is through informal purchase, with almost 50 per cent of respondents having bought their land on the informal market (DW and CEHS 2005: 114). Other observed frequent forms of land access were transfers between relatives and the informal rental market. In some cases local traditional authorities have a certain level of land use control, this meaning that they are consulted or informed about land transactions or even allocate or sell land themselves through the informal market. Evidence however suggests that in most cases, land transactions are taking place between seller and buyer only (including witnesses to generally verbal agreements) without involvement of any local authority.193

The result of this form of land transaction is an urban expansion without proper access and distribution roads and with a lack of land reserved for health and education infrastructure. Whether certain roads are maintained or green areas preserved for future

192 This has been observed at the western edge of Bairro Fátima where the local traditional leader sold land parcels.

193 This fact has been stated on several occasions by the soba of Bairro Fátima in the course of the Bairro Fátima Pilot Project (this being discussed in the next section).
upgrading then often depends on the foresight and initiative of local residents. Overall, observation based on field visits and satellite imagery suggests that this form of peri-urban development is the contemporary dominant form of how peri-urban expansion is taking place, providing the bulk of new housing units needed each year.

There is very little wider participation in this form of local development. None of the relevant government institutions are involved, in many cases not even local authorities, and generally other residents are not consulted. The impact on urban development is immediate, but arguably with little sustainability due to the lack of local infrastructure or even the reservation of the necessary space for future installations of infrastructure. This form of development in many cases has a further negative impact on the local environment, such as provoking increased erosion or polluting local water ways.

7.5.5 Community led planning and resistance to forced evictions

Community led planning combined with organized resistance to forced evictions has only taken place in one area in Huambo over the recent years, this being in Santa Iria which lies in the east of Huambo city. In 2001, the Association of Demobilised Soldiers in Bairro Comandante Vilinga at the eastern periphery of the city initiated an assessment about the availability of land in their area. As most of the Association's members lived in rented housing, the objective was to identify space where they could build their own housing. They subsequently identified an undeveloped space in Santa Iria, an area of approximately 20 hectares, situated behind the Kanata market, on the road to Kuito.

In early 2002 the group first requested a supporting letter from the local administration and with this attached, they wrote a letter to the Governor, stating their intention to use the land for housing development. The Governor's office directed them to the Provincial Department of Public Works where they had a meeting with the director of the urbanism

---

194 All information of this sub-section has been collected during one interview with a member of the Association of Demobilised Soldiers in Bairro Comandante Vilinga (16/6/06) and during one focus group interview with eight different members of the Association (24/6/06). The author has also been given insight into all documents referred to in this sub-section.

195 Given the importance of this rare experience for the objectives of this PhD research, the process is examined in greater detail than the previously discussed planning processes.
section within the department.\footnote{Until the creation of the MINUA in 2003, this section within Public Works was responsible for aspects that today fall under MINUA’s authority.} There they were told that the land in Santa Iria belongs to the Benguela Railway Company (Caminhos de Ferro de Benguela – CFB) and that they should build in Quilombo, which lies in the same area, on the other side of the road leading to Kuito. In Quilombo however, the soba did not allow them to build, arguing that the bairro is reserved for ex-combatants with physical deficiencies. On this response, the group wrote another letter to Public Works in June, reminding the Government that on 29 November 2001, CFB ceased to be a private company but turned into property of the government and due to this, they insisted on Public Works to take a decision, if not in Santa Iria, then to give them land in another area close by. In July Public Works agreed to send a technician in order to evaluate the suitability for housing in Santa Iria. The evaluation was positive but Public Works insisted that the group needed permission of CFB in order to develop the land.

In August the group wrote a letter to the Provincial Director of CFB in Huambo, in which they referred to the first draft of the land law that was in public debate at the time, specifically referring to article 49, point 1, line a) that says that “The state or sub-national government can cede land within its private domain, free of costs, to needy individuals or groups that want to develop housing projects in less developed areas of the country.” In a subsequent meeting with the Provincial Director of the CFB the group was told to make a written request for the land which would have to be sent to CFB headquarters in Lobito. Having submitted the request the group waited for several months without receiving any response, until in February 2003, when the CFB Huambo Provincial Director suggested that the group travel to Lobito in order to follow up the issue. Two members of the group made the trip and had a meeting with the Director of the CFB headquarters in Lobito. He confirmed having received the document, the issue had been analysed by two different commissions and approved by the Director but the document had not been sent back to Huambo where it had to be co-approved by the Provincial Director. The two members were given the document to take back to Huambo where they submitted it to the Provincial Director where it was subsequently approved. This document, signed on 19 February 2003, was to be the document that proved their right of occupation of this land and the group sent copies to all relevant institutions, including the police and the state security. On the basis of this document, the urbanism section in Public Works elaborated a physical plan for the area, however with no participation of the Association.
In April 2003, the group had to submit another official request to Public Works for some unspecified reason, stating the intention to build 300 houses in Santa Iria. During this process the group was also in contact with the Municipal Administration to which they submitted a ‘Declaration of Commitment’ in November 2002. This declaration commits the developer to adhere to the agreed housing standards. The group also approached Public Works again, this time with the request for machinery in order to open the local access roads. They were put on hold by Public Works and after a while approached the Governor’s office with the same request, however also in vain. From the Governor’s office they were sent to the Municipal Administration who by May 2003 informed the Governor’s office that the administration could not intervene in this issue as it is at the competence of Public Works. This letter was then forwarded to Public Works by the Governor’s office. Without receiving any concrete response from Public Works, the group sent another letter in July asking again for support for the implementation of the physical plan that had been prepared. With Public Works not responding to the letter, the group sent another one in early September to which Public Works responded by forwarding the letter and the case over to INOTU.

In INOTU they were promised machines but were put on hold over months until they decided to go back to Public Works. Finally they decided to hold a meeting with these institutions in the hope to bring the case forward. The meeting was held in Vilinga and the institutions attended, but then the process stalled because of the beginning of the rain season. In April 2004 they tried again with Public Works where they were finally told that they would never get any support for free, only through payment. The group made a collection among the members of the Association and for USD 150 per hour they quickly received the necessary machinery. The next step then was the plot layout of the areas for which INOTU was responsible. After having submitted the request to INOTU, they waited for 8 months during which they had several meetings with the director of INOTU, but the plot layout was not implemented. Finally they decided to implement the layout on their own, and went to DPUA where they received the standards for land parcels (20 by 25 metres) and a copy of the physical plan. After the plot layout was complete however INOTU told them not to start the distribution process of the land parcels.

It was then that the group started to understand that some sections of government had other ideas for the land. Over the previous period the Association incorporated several
government officials as associates of this land project as a strategy to bring the process forward. It was these people who alerted the group about these new developments. In a meeting with all associates they decided to occupy the land so that, in case the government would indeed reclaim the area, at least they would have to attribute them alternative plots. So the group allocated plots to those who contributed to the whole process and the new land owners started digging water holes, producing adobe blocks and the first ones initiated construction.

The group was then called to a meeting with the municipal Vice-Administrator who alerted them that the government was about to reclaim the area for a condominium to be built. It was not clear which part of government, although they were told that it was a direct presidential decision. The group insisted that they would not leave without compensation and suggested they be given alternative land in Cambiote, which is in the same area, along the road to Kuito, but further out of town. They also insisted for the Vice-Administrator to present this issue to the community as otherwise the associates might suspect that the group in contact with the Administrator was doing a deal with the administration instead of defending their interests. This however, he did not accept, supposedly being afraid. Instead, he started accusing the community of harbouring arms and brought the issue to the attention of the local army command (because it was a case of demobilised soldiers) who summoned the leaders of the Association to three subsequent meetings, without however the responsible Colonel showing up in any of these.

The group was then told that the case had been transferred to the police. Soon after they were called to a meeting with the Provincial Police Commander, and they insisted that the Vice-Administrator accompany them. As it came out, the Commander had been informed by the Municipal Administration that the group was occupying the land illegally. Having brought along the necessary documentation, the Commander soon realised that the group had a legal claim and at the end he verbally supported them in the presence of the Vice-Administrator, stating that also many of his men are having pending land requests with the administration and never received any response. He also however had to pressure the group to leave the area because of the government’s intention to build a condominium.

Again the group requested a meeting in Vilinga and the Police Commander, the municipal Vice-Administrator, the Director of Public Works and the Director of INOTU followed
suit, presenting the case to the community during a meeting on 3 August 2004. As the Police Commander mentioned that foreigners will occupy the area the associates opposed this strongly and maintained their position to not even move to Cambiote. The group was then called again by the Police Commander who explained that he now had no option but to enter by force, because a commission of the future developer of the area was on the way and they could not find the area occupied, otherwise the government was risking the loss of a lucrative contract.

On 5 August 2004 by midnight, the area was occupied by anti-riot police. They did not allow people to access their plots and assaulted everybody who tried to do so. They destroyed all construction and filled waterholes with earth. The group immediately met again with the commander but he defended the police presence with the arrival of the commission. The group also brought the news to the attention of Radio Huambo who, however, did not broadcast anything. The police occupied the area for 23 days and only left the day before the commission arrived. It came out later however that the developer declined to build on this land due to the topography which seemed not suitable for the planned development.

In the meantime, the group prepared documentation of the case and sent two members to Luanda where they submitted it to an MP of the National Assembly who had roots in Huambo. After studying the case he suggested to first present the case to the Governor in Huambo as he was absent during the last phase of the process. Soon after however they were told by the Municipal Administration in Huambo to report to Public Works where the Provincial Director offered land in the same area, also along the road to Kuito, but much closer to the city. He asked them to contact the local sobas and to organize the necessary declarations from him and the local administration.

With this documentation the Director of Public Works sent them to INOTU where they were asked for a payment of Kwz 57,000 (equivalent of approximately USD 700) for the drawing of a land layout plan. With contributions from the members the amount was paid but the plan was never completed. The group pressured INOTU to produce the plan but nothing happened. Soon after, the Director of the urbanism section in Public Works was acquitted and the newly created Provincial Directorate of Urbanism and Environment received a new provincial director. It was to him that the group presented their plight and problems with the layout plan. He asked for all documents of the process which the group
produced and submitted. The Director analysed the issue and then offered them another piece of land, in Bomba Baixa, a total of 84 plots (20 by 20 metres). At first, the Director insisted that all houses in this area would have to be built with concrete blocks, not adobe. The delegation however convinced him that good adobe houses also would be adequate. The Director’s compromise was for concrete houses to be built at the first row of houses by the main road, beyond this they could be adobe.

Soon after, he withdrew the case from INOTU and an official of DPUA drew up the plan, after a payment of Kwz 36,000 (approximately USD 450), again however without any participation of the Association. They then organized machinery from the Portuguese construction company Monte & Monte for USD 250/hour and DPUA organized the plot layout.197

This case study provides an interesting example of very strong participation of a local civil society group, in this case the Association for Demobilised Soldiers in Bairro Vilinga. Starting from a rather weak negotiating position, the association started strengthening its influence through strong and coherent leadership, advocating the use of the existing law, intense lobbying of their case with individuals in several government institutions on the provincial level and, in the last instance, meeting with an MP at the National Assembly in Luanda. The case study also shows the formidable obstacles to community-based action, these being the result of an inefficient bureaucracy and unclear definition of responsibilities between different government institutions, as well as embedded corruption.

The association’s resistance did have an influence on urban development, as their members were finally granted land in a well situated area close to the originally targeted area of Santa Iria. The result was arguably sustainable in the sense that the land provided to the members was on a good location, close to a major inter-provincial road facilitating access to health and education infrastructure, as well as economic opportunity.

197 It should be mentioned that the condominium was never built in Santa Iria, but towards the end of 2006, the Provincial Government initiated a plot-layout process in Santa Iria and started distributing plots to individuals with pending requests for land. By early 2007, plots were sold on the informal market at approximately USD 3,500 each. (In January 2007, the author pretended to be interested in buying a plot in the area and through the contact of a middle-man was offered a plot of 20 on 20 metres for USD 3,500. Those people contacted during this process commented that prices were rising fast.)
Summarising, this section provides an overview of some of the most important contemporary urban planning processes in Huambo. The discussion showed the following.

All but one of the planning processes in question have **very low levels of participation**. In the process of elaborating the Huambo/Kaala structural plan for example, not even the relevant government institutions in Huambo were involved. In contemporary condominium developments and government led lay-out planning and land distribution, the Provincial Government is leading the processes through DPUA and INOTU, with some limited involvement of the bairro administrations. In the expanding informal settlements there is no planning at all in most cases, and no effective land use control by either local authorities or the local administration. The only planning with effective civil society participation recently observed in Huambo is the example of the Association of Demobilised Soldiers who through strong organization and leadership succeeded in negotiating land rights and access to land with the Provincial Government.

Looking at the impact of different planning outcomes on development, the discussion showed that apart from the Huambo/Kaala structural plan, **all processes do have an important influence on land use development**, however with often limited aspects of sustainability.

The following case study of a participatory lay-out planning process discusses an approach similar to the government led lay-out planning discussed above, but with a greater emphasis on participation and sustainable development outcomes.

### 7.6 The Bairro Fátima participatory lay-out planning process

#### 7.6.1 Introduction to the case study

From November 2005 until January 2007, Development Workshop Angola (DW) with technical support from the Centre for Environment and Human Settlements (CEHS) implemented a land use management and participatory planning pilot project in Huambo. As discussed in chapter three, the author participated in the planning process in the function of technical advisor. The author thus had access to information that would not have been accessible to 'outside' researchers, as explained in the methodology chapter.
(chapter three, section three), permitting this experience of observation to be incorporated in this thesis, adopting an 'insider' approach to social research. The discussion in chapter three also pointed out some inherent risks of this approach, mainly in terms of impartiality in the process of data analysis. The discussion however showed that the author was explicitly aware of these risks and that the necessary steps were taken to ensure impartiality.

**Bairro Fátima** is an informal settlement in a peri-urban area in the southern part of the city, close to the airport (DW 2006b). The bairro is under the jurisdiction of the Cacilhas Administration and locally administered by a soba. By early 2006, the population was estimated at 9,785 individuals with some 64 per cent of the population under the age of 30 years. There is no access to public transport, only the informal minibus and motorbike taxis are providing transport services and in the whole area there is only one public health post and two private health posts, with the central hospital Huambo, however, being relatively close (approximately 2 km). There are three primary schools of which one was built by the government, one by the Adventist church and one by the Pentecostal church. Due to a lack of space, not all classes are held inside the school buildings.

During the colonial time, the Portuguese had installed a water distribution network linked to public stand pipes, but the system was not maintained and deteriorated completely beyond repair. Today, most of the inhabitants dig their own unprotected wells. Only a few houses at the northern edge of the bairro close to the inner city have access to the city energy network. Some residents have small generators, but most residents have no electricity at all. Residents usually dispose of solid waste in holes in their backyards. The most vibrant civil groups of civil society are the different church denominations which do provide important services such as primary education (as mentioned above) and health through the establishment of a local health post. Except DW, there are no other NGOs working in the area, nor are there any CBOs based there. There are no effective formal land use control mechanisms, providing access to land and regulating tenure. Neither the local administration nor the soba have any form of land cadastre, nor does the Municipal...

---

198 All information in this paragraph is taken from the baseline survey that was done at the beginning of the project (DW 2006b).
Administration, DPUIA or INOTU. Most of the land transactions or subdivisions are either taking place within families or between buyer and seller.  

**Figure 16: Location of Bairro Fátima, Zones A and B**

7.6.2 Description of the planning process

The development of the Bairro Fátima Pilot Project began during the earlier mentioned research programme on peri-urban land in Angola, implemented by DW and CEHS from 2002 to 2005. In order to prepare the implementation of the Pilot Project in Huambo, a team of DW staff participated in an intensive training on urban planning and pilot project management at Heriot-Watt University in October 2005 provided by CEHS.

---

199 Informal interview with the soba of Bairro Fátima, March 2005  
200 Satellite image (Quickbird, dated May 2003) provided by Development Workshop, limits introduced by the author.  
201 All information referred to in this and the following subsection has been gathered through participatory observation from July 2005 to June 2006 as mentioned in chapter three and the introduction of this chapter seven. Where information has been gathered through interviews it is explicitly referred to as such. For a full list of interviews conducted in Huambo please refer to Appendix 1.
A second training for the same staff was then held after the initial phase of the project in March 2006, again at Heriot-Watt University. The project itself started in November 2005 with a grant of USD 40,000 provided by the British Embassy in Luanda.

The first two months of the project were used to get all the main stakeholders involved in the process. Several meetings were held with the Provincial Director of DPUA, the Provincial Director of INOTU, the local Administrator and the traditional leader of Bairro Fátima. Through this process, two different groups were created with the objective to manage and implement the project. The management group included the Provincial Director of DPUA, the Provincial Director of INOTU and two DW staff. The implementation group included two DW staff and an INOTU technician. Especially the management group proved a very important participatory mechanism throughout the whole project. Meetings were relatively regular and all major decisions were taken through this body.

With all stakeholders agreeing on the project approach, the project initiated a 'sensitisation' process in Bairro Fátima explaining the objectives of the project to the local leaders and the population in general. For the purpose of the project, Bairro Fátima was divided into two different areas, Zone A and Zone B. Zone A comprised the already developed area with approximately 1,300 households, while Zone B included the non-developed area of approximately 45 hectares at the fringe of the peri-urban area.

The main objective for Zone A was to create a land registry of the current occupants and to facilitate the land rights regularisation process of the occupants. During five months, the project team demarcated the existing land holdings of all households. For the demarcation the team used print-outs of recent high resolution satellite imagery with the registered plot limits then digitised in the DW office using GIS software. Based on this land registry, the team prepared the land rights documents that were agreed upon by the management group in a previous meeting. These documents, the 'Purchase Licences' (Licenças de arrematação) are an existing form of intermediary land right document which is used for obtaining the construction licence and surface or property titles. The licences were prepared by DW staff and then submitted to DPUA where they were signed by the Provincial Director and then distributed to the relevant owners. At the time of writing (August 2007), some 400 licences have been distributed.

202 CEHS support continued throughout the project.
For Zone B, the main objective was to create a new neighbourhood in an expansion zone, preventing the unregulated expansion of the city in this area. As a first step, all existing land occupants whose land would be affected in the urbanisation process were registered, most of this being seasonal (rain-fed) agricultural land. A compensation process was developed which foresaw that each land occupant would receive plots in the newly urbanised area in accordance with the size of the land he or she lost, as a form of ‘land readjustment’. Overall, the size of urban plots to be received by the compensated would not be of the same surface area in terms of square metres, but the project aimed for the compensated occupiers to receive an area of at least equal value after the basic urban development process. As the land value of plots for urban housing and other uses is considerably higher than that for agricultural use, the compensated occupants received land plots of a surface that equalled 35 per cent of the former rural land surface that they occupied.203

Following the land registry in Zone B, a layout plan was elaborated by DW staff, discussed and approved by the management group and presented to the local administrator and a selection of local residents for comments. Subsequent to the layout of the first 225 plots, 83 of these were distributed as compensation to the previous occupants of agricultural land. The project then initiated the sale of the remaining 152 plots to individual clients that were sent to the project office either via DPUA or the local administration. At the time of writing (August 2007), the project had sold almost all plots, generating a revenue of more than USD 65,000. These funds are being held in a separate project account with two signatories, one of them from the provincial government and one from DW. The funds are being reinvested into the same area, mainly for basic infrastructure such as roads, water points and recreational areas. By July, some of the funds were also being used to continue development of an adjacent area using the same approach.

203 This approach to compensation was elaborated during the two training sessions at Heriot Watt University, under guidance by CEHS.
During the whole project phase, the planning of new residential areas and the infrastructure plan were focused on the rehabilitation of the area. The current plan was revised to meet the needs of the residents. The plan was designed to accommodate the existing services and facilities. During implementation, some adjustments were made to the plan, as for example increasing the space reserved for recreation.

Source: Development Workshop Huambo. During implementation, some adjustments were made to the plan, as for example increasing the space reserved for recreation.
7.6.3 Levels of participation and the contribution to sustainable development

The first phase of stakeholder participation took place during the initial training provided by CEHS and DW in 2004 through the participatory elaboration of the project, with involvement of staff from DPUA and INOTU. Several follow-up meetings were then held between DW staff, DPUA and INOTU in Huambo, these bridging the period from the training to the project initiation. Stakeholder participation was then institutionalised through the creation of the management group which has played a fundamental role in leading the project. Importantly, the Director of DPUA has previously participated in training provided by CEHS and DW in 2004 and was personally involved in the development of the Bairro Fátima Project Proposal. Nevertheless, certain reservations were felt in the first meetings, given the new approach and the high workload of both Directors. Over the months however, as the project started to produce positive results, confidence and interest of the government partners increased considerably. It was acknowledged that the project helped to reduce the pressure from the provincial government who was struggling to respond to the high number of requests for land for housing.

During the whole project period, the management group had eight meetings in total. DW staff usually prepared a proposal for the meeting agenda which was discussed and adjusted at the beginning of the meeting, each of which usually lasted between one to two hours. The local administrator, who was very supportive to the project from the beginning, played another important role. He took part in several community meetings,
providing legitimacy to the project and making his contribution in explaining the different aspects of the project. The traditional authority played a similar role as the local administrator, reinforcing the acceptance of the project activities on the community level. There was however no participation of the Municipal Administration, although the office of the Administrator was informed about the project from the beginning and the Municipal Administrator ideally would have been part of the management group.

**Community participation** was mainly conducted through dissemination of information to the community in a series of meetings, this being another important aspect for the project to gain acceptance and support on the local level. It was however a rather one-way participatory process, providing information about the project activities and answering questions from community members. While the population rapidly agreed upon the regularisation process in Zone A, the urbanisation process in Zone B requested a very intensive sensitisation process, especially when it came to the issue of compensation. Participation on the community level therefore was more about the transfer of information from the project to the population. There was no effective participation of the population in developing or shaping project implementation.

**Figure 20: One of the many sensitisation meetings with community members**

In the period of intensive community sensitisation about the urbanisation and compensation process, the project decided to create an elected community group that would provide a more effective channel of communication between the project staff and the population in the project area of Zone B. Two women and three men were elected by
a group of inhabitants of Bairro Fátima and subsequently became the main contacts in the bairro for any kind of activity or information to be disseminated. At the beginning, the project held weekly meetings with the group, but only during approximately two months. While some members of the groups continued to play an important role in the project, the group as such did not.

Participation in the layout planning process was limited. DW staff produced a first draft of the plan which was then internally reviewed by two DW architect/planners. The adjusted plan was then presented to the management group where some minor changes were suggested. Subsequently, the plan was discussed in the field with the local administrator who had no additional suggestions. Finally, the plan was presented to a group of local residents. Again, most of the meeting served to explain the plan to the participants who themselves did not produce any suggestions.

Figure 21: Discussing the physical plan with the local Administrator

It is argued below that the Bairro Fátima project made some important steps forward towards increased participation in urban planning, also arguing that this increased participation, beside other factors, has contributed towards a more sustainable outcome. However, the scale of the project is very small and therefore provides a limited contribution for sustainable development for the city as a whole. Further, participation was not the only variable contributing towards a sustainable outcome, equally important were arguably the technical skills of project staff and the specific project approach used.
In the social dimension, the project contributed to creating a socially diverse bairro with a population consisting of different income groups, ranging from the poor to the middle class. The inclusion of the poor has been achieved through the process of compensation through the allocation of developed land parcels rather than monetary compensation. Although some of the compensated are selling some of their plots, most continue with at least one in order for them or a family member to use it for housing. The plot price of USD 500 allowed access to land by young people of the lower middle class that find it very difficult to find appropriate land in the informal market, given the normal higher prices. The risks of future forced relocation in the process of urban expansion with its disruptive economic and social implications have also been reduced through the organized plot layout and preservation of space for the future installation of infrastructure. However, apart from the poor that have been compensated, others have been effectively excluded from access to land in the new bairro as USD 500 is above the capacity of many of the poor. Further, it is expected that levels of land speculation will rise in the area, as some people will not build but rather hold on to the land until prices rise and then sell.

To date, there are no actual indicators of the project contributing to the economic dimension of sustainability. It is arguably too early to try to measure this aspect. The project hopes however that the rehabilitation of the access road, access to the city’s transport system and the installation of a local market would contribute towards creating some local economic activity. Further, the land sales themselves can be seen as a way of valuing land and creating wealth by local land occupants who have been compensated by receiving urbanised plots.

Also in terms of environmental sustainability it is too early to draw any specific conclusions. Again however, the project hopes that some levels of environmental sustainability can be achieved through the instalment of protected water points, surface water drainage and rehabilitated access road that permits the collection of solid waste by the city’s waste removal trucks.

205 To date, there has not been done any informal land market research or other investigation that would provide evidence about informal land prices in peri-urban Huambo. Estimates based on personal conversations with local informants however indicate informal land prices in peri-urban areas that range approximately from USD 700 to USD 4000, depending on plot location and plot size.
While the project has shown a viable approach to address the non sustainable expansion of peri-urban areas, it did provide very few land plots taking into account current demand. It is therefore arguably a question of scale whether such a process can claim to make a real impact on more generally sustainable urban development.

7.7 Conclusions
This chapter provided an analysis of the development and governance context of Huambo city in the central highlands of Angola. As in Luanda, urban development has been characterised as unsustainable in all three dimensions, however not on the scale as in Luanda, this arguably also due to the city’s smaller size. The local governance context also reflects the characteristics of the national governance context, with a relatively strong Provincial Government and very weak municipal and communal administrations. Related to this are very limited spaces of participation in local decision-making processes. The Municipal Administration for example has never held a consultative council with the participation of civil society as provided as an option under Decree Law 17/99.

Examining the state of civil society in Huambo, the discussion concluded that its organizations are also very weak and mostly inexistent in peri-urban areas. Looking at land use management it was observed that while the very recent Decree Law 2/07 as presented in chapter five gives some responsibilities to the Municipal Administration, this is not felt in Huambo. Where there is land use control, this is undertaken by the DPUA and INOTU, both located in the Provincial Government, while in most peripheral areas the city is expanding without planning and land use control. The role (or in many cases inexistence) of urban planning and its relation to development has been illustrated by a few examples such as provincial government led lay-out planning, condominium development, unplanned expansion and community based planning. As in Luanda, the discussion concluded that current planning and development initiatives in Huambo are completely inappropriate for dealing with the development challenges identified earlier, especially if urban development is to become more sustainable in its social, economic and environmental dimensions.

Providing an alternative approach to the different (above mentioned) planning processes, the thesis suggested to reflect upon a recent experience of participatory lay-out planning and slum-upgrading that had as an explicit objective to foster social and economic inclusion of the urban poor. The planning process was arguably reasonably successful in its attempt of effective stakeholder participation, this having taken place
through a management group which took all major decisions as a collective body. The project also promoted an extensive community participation process which was fundamental to gain the cooperation of the local inhabitants, this having been vital for the successful implementation of the project. While this community participation did not result in some form of broad based community groups actively contributing to the outcome of the project, it arguably nevertheless provided the necessary space where local inhabitants could raise their doubts and questions, receiving answers and explanations by the local administrator, soba and project staff.

In comparison to the Sambizanga municipal planning process in Luanda, participation in Bairro Fátima was more direct, this arguably due to the different nature of the planning process and also the different governance context. Community participation in Bairro Fátima was directly with concerned citizens, while in the case of Sambizanga, participation was representative through local civil society groups. The issue of scale is the main explanatory variable for this observation; while the Bairro Fátima project dealt with a few thousand concerned residents, the Sambizanga planning process had to deal with more than half a million inhabitants. As has been discussed in the Johannesburg case, direct citizen participation in large scale planning processes is difficult to manage and sustain.

The chapter then suggested that the Bairro Fátima project provides an example where a participatory approach has been developed which is well integrated in the local governance context. In fact, the understanding of the local development and governance context as provided in this chapter showed that much of the success of the project is arguably due to a planning approach that was not imposed by the facilitator (in this case DW), but a planning approach that developed in the course of the project. Although DW staff received training in how to conduct this kind of pilot project, many aspects were adjusted and developed locally, this in collaboration with the key stakeholders (mainly the management group) and in response to project developments. In this sense, the project used an action oriented and pragmatic approach to participation, rather than an idealised approach as promoted by some planning and development theories, as well as development practice as discussed in chapter two.

The action oriented planning approach of the Bairro Fátima project also resulted in a direct impact of the planning outcome (the plan), with local developments such as
infrastructure (especially access roads) and self-help housing having initiated almost immediately after the completion of the plan. In this the project shows characteristics similar to the *Bairro Legal* case study in São Paulo, albeit on a much smaller scale.

These conclusions finally argue that this form of successful local level planning, calling the attention of local and national authorities, are the kind of approaches that help to contribute to a broader change in the national governance context that has been argued for in the conclusions of the previous chapter. On the basis of the *Bairro Fátima* experience for example, MINUA asked DW to prepare a by-law on land regularisation of peri-urban areas. This suggest that lobbying and advocacy for increased participation in the current context of Angola is more successful if backed up with tangible results which prove that what is talked about actually works in the reality of Angola’s peri-urban areas.
Chapter 8: Conclusions: The Case for Participatory Urban Planning in Angola and its Relevance for Theory and Practice

8.1 Summary of research results

Before addressing the final conclusions, this chapter first makes a review of the research objectives and questions of the thesis, and how the thesis has responded to these.

Chapter two of the thesis responded to research objective one and its related research questions, summarised again in the table below.

Table 9: Research objective one and related research questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective one</th>
<th>To examine the debate on participatory planning as a contribution to sustainable urban development in planning theory, development studies and international development policy.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Research questions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>What are the most influential approaches to participation in urban planning theory, development studies and international development policy and what is the critique of these approaches?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>How does the concept of governance help to analyse and guide participatory planning processes?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>What is meant by ‘sustainable urban development’?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An overview of conceptual approaches to participation in planning theory, development studies and development policy identified some key shortcomings across these different fields. The shortcomings included an insufficient recognition of power relations in many approaches to participation, an underestimation of fundamental differences among participants, the promotion of universally applicable participatory approaches that can override other legitimate contextually specific decision-making processes, and a reliance on assumptions (such as the assumption that participation leads automatically to pro-poor outcomes) rather than experience in practice.

Based on this critique, the thesis suggested looking at planning as a decision-making process within a specific governance context, with governance being conceptually defined by interaction between three spheres of actors: the state, civil society and the
private sector. The thesis argued that acknowledging planning as part of local governance requires an analysis of any planning process to start from an examination of the local governance context, emphasising the importance of local variables in this context for understanding the planning process in question. The argument also pointed out the importance of legal frameworks within any specific governance context in defining decision-making processes such as planning.

Finally, chapter two also discussed the concept of sustainable development, and - while emphasising analysis of this within a governance (or 'political') dimension - sought to understand and apply sustainability as a concept involving three different dimensions: the social, economic and environmental dimension. The discussion showed how these different dimensions of sustainability can be in conflict with each other, such as for example the promotion of economic growth and a concern for increased social inclusion. This definition of the concept of sustainable development provided an additional analytical framework, to that of governance, for the analysis of the development context of the case study sites and activities.

The conclusions of chapter two then summarised these arguments, leading towards the four research questions that provided the analytical framework of the case studies in São Paulo, Johannesburg, Luanda and Huambo, summarised in table 10 below.

Chapter three then presented and discussed the rationale of choosing the case studies, as well as the methods used for collecting and analysing the information necessary for responding to the thesis’ research questions. The key factors in choosing these case studies included: availability of information (literature in the case of São Paulo and Johannesburg and direct access to information in the Angolan case studies), as well as the potentially strong relevance of Brazilian and South African experience for Angola, given Portuguese colonial roots (Brazil), relative economic wealth (Brazil and South Africa) and potential general leadership of South Africa for Sub-Saharan African countries.

The research approach was defined as a comparative case study approach, using research methods that included literature reviews, interviewing and observation, using an ‘insider’ approach in the case studies of Luanda and Huambo where the researcher was also involved as a practitioner. The insider approach, so the chapter argued, was at once a necessity due to the very limited availability of evidence in Angola, as well as a unique
opportunity, given the researcher’s employee involvement in participatory urban planning practice.

The following chapters then examined and analysed the different case studies, based on the research objective and research questions as defined through the analytical framework in chapter two.

Table 10: Research objective two and related research questions (analytical framework)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective two</th>
<th>To critically examine four different case studies of participatory urban planning in countries in the South and to assess the relevance of these planning approaches for sustainable urban development.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Research questions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research questions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research questions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research questions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following chapters four, six and seven then examined and analysed the four case studies, one each in São Paulo, Johannesburg, Luanda and Huambo. The key conclusions of this analysis can be summarised as follows:

In all case study cities, trends of **unsustainable urban development** were identified, in the social, economic and environmental dimensions. The two case study cities in Angola however showed the highest levels of unsustainable development, such as very high levels of social and economic exclusion as well as extremely hazardous urban environmental conditions, linked to extremely rapid urban growth.
The governance context in São Paulo and Johannesburg was characterised by recent democratisation after decades of authoritarian rule. The PT in Brazil and the ANC in South Africa both introduced sweeping government reforms, including effective decentralisation and a revision of planning legislation, promoting high levels of participation of civil society organizations, networks and social movements that were considered as strong and vocal in both countries. Contrarily, in Angola, albeit nominally a democracy since 1991, the governance context was characterised as much less participative, with weak government and civil society institutions and most decision-making processes strongly influenced by the powerful Presidency and a political and economic elite. While government reforms are underway especially since the end of the civil war in 2002, they are at a very early stage and often undermined by vested interests of the country’s powerful elite.

All four case studies were analysed in reference to the specific development and governance context of the case study city. The analysis of the case studies in São Paulo and Johannesburg argued that both planning processes were rather successful in achieving their objectives and contributing to sustainable development, this principally due to national planning and development policy that supported the participative planning approaches, effectively decentralised local government and which was open to engagement of existing strong civil society organizations. Shortcomings of participation in the case of Johannesburg were seen as being compensated (at least to some extent) by the workings of local representative democratic institutions that assured some aspects of social inclusion in the final planning outcome. On the other hand in Angola, and especially in Luanda, the success of the participatory planning case studies was much less significant.

While in Luanda the proponents of the case study achieved a remarkable level of participation (especially if compared to contemporary general practice of municipal planning), the planning outcome did not contribute to any specific local development activities as it might have. This failure to influence local development was analysed as being mainly attributable to the very limited capacities existing in the municipal administrations, a fact highlighted in the previous discussion of the Angolan governance context. In Huambo, the case study also shows high levels of participation and even succeeded in influencing local development, however on a rather small scale. The rather
small scale of the project was explained by the fact that for all actors involved it was a first ever experience of this kind of planning and development approach (indeed the first such kind of approach ever tested in Angola), this resulting in a relatively low level of technical expertise of all involved with a lot of experimentation necessary. While the case study provided an interesting example of a pilot project, only experience over the coming years will show whether this approach to participatory urban lay-out planning and sustainable development can be implemented on a wider scale to have any significant impact on urban development.

Building on this analysis, this concluding chapter eight is responding to research objective three and its related research question, summarised in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective three</th>
<th>To discuss what forms of participatory planning are most likely to contribute to sustainable urban development in Angola.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Research question</td>
<td>Based on the two Angola case studies, international experience and prior analysis, what kind of participatory planning is most likely to contribute to sustainable urban development in Angola?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8.2 What forms of participatory planning can contribute to sustainable urban development in Angola?

The evidence presented in this thesis shows that urban planning in Angola encounters formidable challenges due to contemporary dynamics and trends in the development and governance context. Urban development is characterised by extremely rapid urban growth, especially at the peripheries of cities, resulting in ever larger informal settlements that grow often without even minimal planning, and show very high levels of poverty and environmental problems. The evidence has also shown how current forms of urban governance are ineffective in countering this trend. While contemporary urban policy, legislation and programmes are inadequate in content and application, local government’s lack of mandate and resources are major hindrances to becoming more effective local development actors. In addition, civil society organizations are still weak in Angola and only in isolated cases have the power to engage the government for improving the
situation of peri-urban dwellers. The evidence has also shown that urban planning has a very limited role and influence on urban development in Angola, where decision-making on land use (this reflecting the overall governance context) is in most cases neither transparent nor undertaken by the relevant government institutions, but often informally, to the advantage of the country’s political and economic elite as well as the powerful Presidency.

Nevertheless, the analysis of the two Angolan case studies and international experiences suggests that a possible way forward in Angola, in making urban planning more relevant in order to contribute to sustainable development, is through the promotion of participatory planning practice at local and metropolitan levels as a contribution to the wider governance reforms in the country.

8.2.1 Characteristics of participation in specific planning processes

The Bairro Fátima case study in Huambo provided an example showing that even within the context of rapid urbanisation and weak government, civil society and private sector, an action-oriented participatory urban planning approach can work, engaging with those local actors that are interested stakeholders in the process. The example showed that capitalising on the interests and local capacities (however limited) of such stakeholders can compensate for the lack of technical expertise and financial capital, which is one of the very key characteristics of the local urban governance actors in Angola. Given the relative weakness of each single participant in the process, be it local government, NGO partner or community, ways forward can be found in joining resources and engaging in effective planning and development that may show technical shortcomings, but are politically and socially legitimate and work with the resources available. While successful at the local level, the example also showed that this form of planning has the potential to have a broader impact, in this case for example DW’s role in the drafting of a new by-law for peri-urban land regularisation, subcontracted by MINUA, and based on the Bairro Fátima experience. Admittedly this is rather a unique situation, as it has depended on the development of mutual trust and interest in co-working between the NGO sector and government, which may also entail key personal links. However it does permit such activities to be designed as pilots for wider impact in a proactive manner. The key issue will be ensuring that the success of the pilot can be replicated to make it both more sustainable and to reinforce the interest and commitment of the various stakeholders to
the process, which they can then insist on validating through the emerging formal processes in legislation and regulation.

This approach reflects what Hamdi (2004) refers to as action planning. In his words, the rationality of action planning lies in the proposition that “[...] once sufficient work is done at the neighbourhood level, pressure begins to build up to act at city level and emergence begins to take place.” (Hamdi 2004: 101) Through action planning, he calls for stronger links between practical ground-level work and processes of policy development and structure planning. Through this linkage, small changes can be achieved incrementally, always looking for how to put a practical intervention into strategic advantage, using these as ‘triggers of emergence’ (Hamdi 2004: 99-100). For this reason, he argues, partnerships between local groups and government agencies are key. It could also be argued that this approach is essentially one of ‘insurgent planning’ where planners firmly base their activities in political terms, with clear social, economic and environmental motives – however avoids continuous confrontation with the state (as some radical planning has) as this closes off the opportunity to challenge wider governance issues in such a political context.206

Through a basis in proactive partnerships between local community based organizations or citizens, the private sector and/or state and a potential facilitator (such as an NGO), participatory planning can engage in practice that shows results at wider levels. Because practice, as Hamdi puts it:

“[...] is about opening doors, removing barriers to knowledge and learning, finding partners and new forms of partnership, building networks, negotiating priorities, opening lines of communication and searching for patterns. It means designing structures – both spatial and organizational – and facilitating the emergence of others, balancing dualities that at first seem to cancel each other out – between freedom and order, stability and creativity, practical and strategic work, the needs of large organizations and those of small ones, top and bottom, public and private.” (Hamdi 2004: 116)

206 An example of ‘insurgent planning’ with continued confrontation with the state would be the role of SOS-Habitat in defending land rights of the poor through opposing forced evictions, as discussed in chapter six, section five.
As a key conclusion of this thesis, the Bairro Fátima project therefore suggests that in the contemporary context in Angola, such rather small-scale and practice related planning approaches are more viable because contextual variables are more easily understood and engaged with. Due to the small scale activity in Bairro Fátima and the limited number of stakeholders, a rather close relationship between all participants was possible. However, to have any real impact on sustainable urban development at a city-wide scale, similar planning and development processes would have to be promoted in the form of a wider programme. For this to happen, stakeholder and community participation continue to play an important role, but so does the necessary political will as well as technical and managerial capacities of the stakeholders, this probably being a fundamental factor deciding whether such programmes can be implemented or not.

While the Bairro Fátima pilot project suggests that a local level lay-out planning and slum-upgrading approach is viable in the contemporary context, the Sambizanga experience indicates that higher level planning as for example at the municipal level is beset with an extra set of challenges, mainly due to the very nature of the planning process, but as well related to the weaknesses of local government. The discussion of Integrated Development Plans (IDPs) in South Africa provided a comparison for the difficulties when introducing participatory development and land use planning at municipal level. Although local government in South Africa is arguably much better prepared for this task and operating within a fairly developed regulatory and technical framework, the discussion showed that even years after introducing IDPs, many municipalities still had major difficulties in developing and implementing their plans.

Looking at the weaknesses of contemporary local administrations in Angola in the context of the still incomplete legal framework, the challenges for municipal level participatory planning are great, with any positive change arguably needing to be sought in the medium term rather in the short term. The Sambizanga case study showed very clearly that with increased participation alone planning does not automatically become a contribution to more sustainable development. The key challenge in the contemporary Angolan context seems to be actually making the link between planning and development, this arguably being a precondition for participatory approaches having any effective impact. This thesis argues therefore that engaging in participatory municipal planning indeed makes sense in Angola, if the focus is not on participation as an end by itself but as a means to strengthen the link between planning process, outcome and
development. Thus, as Angola moves slowly to some form of decentralisation there is a real opportunity for planning to become embedded in a new form – as has been the case in both South Africa (through integrated development planning) and Brazil (through obligatory master plans, using innovative approaches to inclusion). This also will require advocacy, and again the alliance between civil society organizations, NGOs and local government – based on experience – can play an important role. This also requires a proactive stance for planners, and one that would need to be embedded within the country’s education system – where land use planning is seen as a role for architects. Roles for NGOs such as DW in this sense for example would include a more proactive engagement with the Faculty of Architecture at Luanda’s Agostinho Neto University.

Moving up the scale and looking at strategic planning, the Johannesburg case study provided an illustration of the influences that shape such decision-making processes. It showed that even in a relatively strong democracy, wider civil society participation in this form of strategic decision-making is extremely challenging. However, the experience of participatory budgeting in Brazil does show that it is possible, if there is political will. Looking at the context of Angola, the promotion of participation in strategic planning, although desirable, seems not viable or politically acceptable at this time. The discussion of the GRN-led planning processes and the Huambo/Kaala strategic planning process showed that in this form of planning, local government, and often even provincial and central government institutions, are excluded. In this context to promote civil society participation would hardly be effective, because those institutions that by law are required to promote this participation are themselves excluded. It is therefore argued that an important step forward on this level of planning would be the inclusion of relevant government authorities in strategic and master planning processes, especially also municipal administrations which arguably have a closer appreciation of the most pressing development problems in their areas of jurisdiction. If considering any role of civil society, some form of consultative role could be a start. Here there is possibly an opportunity to build on the recent creation of consultative councils, and insist on the application of this in practice. However, if city-level participative planning is a medium-term objective, embedding participatory approaches strategically into general urban policy development in Angola is arguably an even longer term objective – albeit necessary as such.
Based on these arguments, the thesis therefore suggests that there is no single standard form of participation to be universally applied for urban planning in Angola. Rather, firstly the nature of the planning process itself and secondly the context where it takes place both need to condition participatory objectives and mechanisms, leading to a need for pragmatic approaches that sees participation primarily as a means to an end and, perhaps in the longer term, also an end in itself. For this reason, this thesis argues that a reliance on ‘best practice’ approaches as promoted by international development policy, while albeit useful as aspirational examples, are not an effective way in promoting a more participatory planning approach in Angola that could contribute towards more sustainable urban development. Arguing that no ideal approach can be applied however does not negate that many aspects of participation as promoted through ‘best practice’ are worthy goals, also in the context of Angola, but contextualised and pragmatic approaches must be found to introduce increased participation, recognising ‘realpolitik’ power relations and not being ‘idealised’. Thus, what is promoted is an ideal-driven process for participatory planning – to contribute to changing governance in Angola – and not an idealised process.

Acknowledging the importance of international experience, this thesis suggests therefore using a more developed way of learning from experiences abroad, based on a more in-depth understanding of such experiences, how they emerged and how they relate to their specific development and governance contexts. Instead of simply replicating ‘best practice’ approaches, it seems therefore that a more fruitful approach would be to invest time and resources in creating international partnerships with academic institutions, the private sector and local governments abroad which can go beyond the rhetoric and idealised reporting of the ‘best practice’ approach and engage with the ‘realpolitik’, with clear ideals and objectives related to the context. This process in fact has been initiated in Angola, manifested by the increasing links between Angolan government institutions and Brazilian private sector partners or partnerships such as between the government and DW, with assistance from CEHS, in the case of the Bairro Fátima project.

8.2.2 Contribute to broader governance reform

While more urban planning practice is clearly needed for gaining experiences and testing approaches in Angola, there is an obvious need for further changes in the broader governance context if participation is to become the basis for broader socio-economic
inclusion and environmentally sound development. Within this, participatory planning could become an effective tool for promoting sustainable urban development but this depends on influencing various factors. Some of these have been discussed in this thesis, including the need for effective de-concentration and decentralisation within government, as well as the adaptation of some of the existing legal framework (such as the Land Law with its exclusionary approach in regard to land regularisation) and completion of land use regulations. On the bottom line however, development in Angola arguably has to begin to be based on people – their needs and interests – and less on top-down government handouts based on oil revenues. To do this would mean a radically different approach to governance which seeks engagement, rather than avoids this, and this thesis argues that land use planning is a key area of development - which widely affects people and thus has strong interest for them - and thus could be seen to spearhead such a wider governance and development approach. While a radically different approach to governance is very unlikely to take place in the short term, some current events as mentioned in this thesis suggests that a gradual conversion towards more participatory governance could take place over time.

The historic overview of the process that led to the contemporary legislation on de-concentration (Decree Law 2/07) showed that change in the future most probably will continue to be gradual, based on experiences made in practice. Urban practice as mentioned above therefore has to make a potentially valuable contribution to the wider changes of the contemporary governance context also over time. For this reason it makes sense if planning practice works within the framework provided by contemporary legislation, such as engaging with the Social Consultation and Liaison Councils as promoted by Decree Law 2/07 and the National Council for Territorial Planning and Urbanism as defined by the new Territorial Planning Law. Doing so, urban planning as a governance process can indeed contribute to the changes in the broader governance context.

Returning to the title of the thesis, “Can participatory planning improve sustainable urban development in Angola?”, the final concluding answer on this question, summarising the above argument, is as follows.

Yes, participatory planning can improve sustainable urban development in Angola if:
participation is taking place in a planning process that is linked to actual
development;

- developing participation is considered as the basis for mid and long term
relationships with stakeholders in the planning process

- participation is considered primarily in practice as a means to an end, with
possibly an end in itself as a longer term objective; and,

- the participatory approaches used in the planning process are pragmatic,
contextually based and action oriented, ideal-driven to some extent but not
idealised.

8.3 Contributions of research findings

8.3.1 Contribution to planning theory

This thesis in fact advocates a participatory planning process, rejecting however the
communicative (or collaborative) approach as being limited in its analysis of power. The
approach promoted in this thesis would be rather sited within a radical planning approach,
but one that accepts engagement with the state and other powerful actors such as in the
private sector. In this, the thesis advocates a ‘realpolitik’ approach to understanding the
governance context first and foremost as a means to understand and deal with resource
conflicts over sustainable development.

Having said that, the analysis, especially of the Bairro Fátima experience, showed
characteristics of what Hamdi (2004) would call ‘action planning’. Hamdi however does
not use the connotation ‘theory’ when promoting action planning, he seems rather to
consider it as an approach, ‘a way of doing’. While not theory as such, the conclusions of
this thesis still suggest that action planning as described by Hamdi could potentially
provide an appropriate analytical framework. This could be due to the fact that action
planning is more suggestive than normative, calling attention to key issues like long term
partnerships and a focus on small changes, rather than promoting universally applicable
approaches, a normative way of thinking and acting as promoted by some planning
theories as discussed in chapter two.

Therefore, the thesis suggests that for discussing urban development and planning in
countries like Angola, less normative and more flexible approaches such as action
planning might be more appropriate and useful. An approach that could be tested as an analytical framework for research with a similar objective as this thesis.

8.3.2 Contribution to knowledge

The thesis contributes to knowledge on urban development, governance and planning in Angola. To date, there has been only one attempt of a coherent and inclusive analysis of urban development in Angola (DW and CEHS 2005). This thesis builds on this research, bringing in more information from previously untapped grey literature and taking the researched urban land issues further in relation to urban land planning processes. In addition very little academic research has been undertaken on urban governance in Angola, apart from un-published postgraduate research and international agency development reports. Building on this fragmented information base, and completing it with primary data, the thesis provides a coherent account on the development and contemporary urban governance context in Angola. By examining case studies in Luanda and Huambo, the thesis further contributed towards a better understanding of urban development dynamics of the two cities. While there is some literature about urban development in Luanda, hardly anything exists about secondary cities such as Huambo, the thesis therefore arguably having made a potentially important contribution to increase the body of knowledge about urban development and planning in secondary cities in Angola, and through this process to the body of knowledge on Sub-Saharan African cities.

8.3.3 Contribution to method

This research used a comparative case study approach where information was discussed and analysed in inference to an analytical framework. As such, while there is nothing innovative or new about the research method per se, the method proved very useful for undertaking research in a country like Angola, with great difficulty in access to data and limited research capacity. In combination with the ‘insider’ status of the researcher, the case study approach made it possible to make an in-depth analysis of the research topic, with limited availability of secondary information, mainly through the collection of primary data. The thesis therefore suggests that this approach provides an important additional approach to literature based research and surveys in countries where critical information is scarce and statistics unreliable, giving the possibility to transcend the
superficial and dominating discourses and conduct in-depth academic investigation even with very limited resources.
Appendix 1: List of interviewees

Semi-structured interviews in Huambo

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Institutional category</th>
<th>Interview date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not to be named</td>
<td>Provincial Director IGCA</td>
<td>Provincial government</td>
<td>13/6/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not to be named</td>
<td>Provincial Director of MINPLAN</td>
<td>Provincial government</td>
<td>4/6/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not to be named</td>
<td>Bairro Administrator of Cacilhas</td>
<td>Bairro Administration</td>
<td>15/6/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moises Festo</td>
<td>DW project coordinator and Vice-president of the Angolan Land Network</td>
<td>International NGO and civil society</td>
<td>2/6/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not to be named</td>
<td>Representative of the Association of Demobilised Soldiers</td>
<td>Civil Society</td>
<td>16/6/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not to be named</td>
<td>No institutional affiliation</td>
<td>Local Expert</td>
<td>5/6/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julio Quintas</td>
<td>DW project coordinator</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>5/6/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not to be named</td>
<td>Director of Local Woodfactory</td>
<td>Local private sector</td>
<td>5/6/2006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Semi-structured interviews in Luanda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Institutional category</th>
<th>Interview date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not to be named</td>
<td>INOTU technician</td>
<td>Central government</td>
<td>18/9/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not to be named</td>
<td>Advisor to the Minister of MINUA</td>
<td>Central government</td>
<td>20/11/2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allan Cain</td>
<td>Director of DW Angola</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>9/4/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Daly</td>
<td>Director of CCF Angola</td>
<td>International NGO</td>
<td>14/9/2005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

207 Some of these interviewees have not given explicit permission to mention their names, therefore the reference to ‘Not to be named’. In the table below named ‘Confidential Interviews in Luanda and Huambo’ however, the interviewees have explicitly requested to remain anonymous and for their information to be treated confidentially. In this case, whether name, specific position nor exact interview date are provided.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Institutional category</th>
<th>Interview date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Focus group interviews**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Institutional category</th>
<th>Interview date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eight members</td>
<td>Association of Demobilised Soldiers</td>
<td>Local civil society</td>
<td>18.9.2005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Confidential interviews in Luanda and Huambo**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Institutional category</th>
<th>Interview month</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INOTU official</td>
<td>Central government</td>
<td>December 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPUA official</td>
<td>Provincial government</td>
<td>February 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MINUA official</td>
<td>Central government</td>
<td>November 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior NGO worker</td>
<td>Local civil society</td>
<td>April 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior NGO worker in Huambo</td>
<td>Local civil society</td>
<td>January 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior provincial government officials in Huambo</td>
<td>Provincial government</td>
<td>June and July 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Institutional category</td>
<td>Interview month (or period)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Director</td>
<td>DPUA</td>
<td>January 2006 to April 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Director</td>
<td>INOTU Huambo</td>
<td>January 2006 to April 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrator</td>
<td>Bairro Administration of Cacilhas</td>
<td>January 2006 to April 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soba</td>
<td>Traditional Authority in Bairro Fátima</td>
<td>January to July 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Several</td>
<td>Residents in Bairro Fátima</td>
<td>January 2006 to April 2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2: Millennium Development Goals, Targets and Indicators

Goal 1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger

Target 1: Reduce by half the proportion of people living on less than a dollar a day

1. Proportion of Population Below $1 (PPP) per Day (World Bank)
2. Poverty Gap Ratio, $1 per day (World Bank)
3. Share of Poorest Quintile in National Income or Consumption (World Bank)

Target 2: Reduce by half the proportion of people who suffer from hunger

4. Prevalence of Underweight Children Under Five Years of Age (UNICEF)
5. Proportion of the Population below Minimum Level of Dietary Energy Consumption (FAO)

Goal 2. Achieve universal primary education

Target 3: Ensure that all boys and girls complete a full course of primary schooling

6. Net Enrolment Ratio in Primary Education (UNESCO)
7. Proportion of Pupils Starting Grade 1 who Reach Grade 5 (UNESCO)
8. Literacy Rate of 15-24 year-olds (UNESCO)

Goal 3. Promote gender equality and empower women

Target 4: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005, and at all levels by 2015

9. Ratio of Girls to Boys in Primary, Secondary, and Tertiary Education (UNESCO)
10. Ratio of Literate Women to Men 15-24 years old (UNESCO)
11. Share of Women in Wage Employment in the Non-Agricultural Sector (ILO)
12. Proportion of Seats Held by Women in National Parliaments (IPU)

**Goal 4. Reduce child mortality**

**Target 5:** Reduce by two thirds the mortality rate among children under five

13. Under-Five Mortality Rate (UNICEF)
14. Infant Mortality Rate (UNICEF)
15. Proportion of 1 year-old Children Immunised Against Measles (UNICEF)

**Goal 5. Improve maternal health**

**Target 6:** Reduce by three quarters the maternal mortality ratio

16. Maternal Mortality Ratio (WHO)
17. Proportion of Births Attended by Skilled Health Personnel (UNICEF)

**Goal 6. Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases**

**Target 7:** Halt and begin to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS

18. HIV Prevalence Among 15-24 year-old Pregnant Women (UNAIDS)
20. Ratio of school attendance of orphans to school attendance of non-orphans aged 10-14 years

**Target 8:** Halt and begin to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases
21. Prevalence and Death Rates Associated with Malaria (WHO):
22. Proportion of Population in Malaria Risk Areas Using Effective Malaria Prevention and Treatment Measures (UNICEF):
23. Prevalence and Death Rates Associated with Tuberculosis (WHO):
24. Proportion of Tuberculosis Cases Detected and Cured Under Directly-Observed Treatment Short Courses (WHO)

Goal 7. Ensure environmental sustainability

Target 9: Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes; reverse loss of environmental resources

25. Forested land as percentage of land area (FAO)
26. Ratio of Area Protected to Maintain Biological Diversity to Surface Area (UNEP)
27. Energy supply (apparent consumption; Kg oil equivalent) per $1,000 (PPP) GDP (World Bank)
28. Carbon Dioxide Emissions (per capita) and Consumption of Ozone-Depleting CFCs (ODP tons):

Target 10: Reduce by half the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water

30. Proportion of the Population with Sustainable Access to and Improved Water Source (WHO/UNICEF)
31. Proportion of the Population with Access to Improved Sanitation (WHO/UNICEF)

Target 11: Achieve significant improvement in lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers, by 2020

32. Slum population as percentage of urban population (secure tenure index) (UN-Habitat)
Goal 8. Develop a global partnership for development

**Target 12:** Develop further an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system including a commitment to good governance, development, and poverty reduction — both nationally and internationally.

**Target 13:** Address the special needs of the least developed countries. Includes: tariff and quota free access for least developed countries’ exports; enhanced programme of debt relief for HIPCs and cancellation of official bilateral debt; and more generous ODA for countries committed to poverty reduction.

**Target 14:** Address the special needs of landlocked countries and small island developing States.

**Target 15:** Deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing countries through national and international measures in order to make debt sustainable in the long term.

**Target 16:** In cooperation with developing countries, develop and implement strategies for decent and productive work for youth.

**Target 17:** In cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, provide access to affordable essential drugs in developing countries.

**Target 18:** In cooperation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications.

*Official development assistance*

32. Net ODA as percentage of OECD/DAC donors' gross national product (targets of 0.7% in total and 0.15% for LDCs)
33. Proportion of ODA to basic social services (basic education, primary health care, nutrition, safe water and sanitation)
34. Proportion of ODA that is untied
35. Proportion of ODA for environment in small island developing States  
36. Proportion of ODA for transport sector in landlocked countries  

**Market access**  
37. Proportion of exports (by value and excluding arms) admitted free of duties and quotas  
38. Average tariffs and quotas on agricultural products and textiles and clothing  
39. Domestic and export agricultural subsidies in OECD countries  
40. Proportion of ODA provided to help build trade capacity  

**Debt sustainability**  
41. Proportion of official bilateral HIPC debt cancelled  
42. Total Number of Countries that Have Reached their HIPC Decision Points and Number that Have Reached their Completion Points (Cumulative) (HIPC) (World Bank-IMF)  
43. Debt Service as a Percentage of Exports of Goods and Services (World Bank)  
44. Debt Relief Committed Under HIPC Initiative (HIPC) (World Bank-IMF)  
45. Unemployment of 15-24 year-olds, Each Sex and Total (ILO)  
46. Proportion of Population with Access to Affordable, Essential Drugs on a Sustainable Basis (WHO)  
47. Telephone Lines and Cellular Subscribers per 100 Population (ITU)  
48. Personal Computers in Use and Internet Users per 100 Population (ITU)
References


Anstee, M (1996) *Orphan of the cold war: The Inside Story of the Collapse of the


and Hills, J (eds.) *Exclusion, Employment and Opportunity*. CASE Paper 4, Centre
for Analysis of Social Exclusion, London: London School of Economics.

Huambo: Development Workshop Angola*.

Change in Developing Countries*. London: Zed Books.

Rothchild, D S and Chazan, N (eds.) *Civil Society and the State in Africa.*
London: Lynne Rienner.


Bank, A and Doimo, A M (1989) Between utopia and strategy: a case study of a Brazilian
urban social movement. In: Schuurman, F and Van Naerssen, T (eds.) *Urban

Angola*. Working Paper, Luanda: CARE.

London: Villiers Publications.

UK Limited.


Beall, J (2002) Globalization and social exclusion in cities: framing the debate with

Beall, J, Crankshaw, O and Parnell, S (2000) Local government, poverty reduction and


Budds, J, Teixeira, P and SEHAB (2005) Ensuring the right to the city: pro-poor housing, urban development and tenure legalization in São Paulo, Brazil. *Environment & Urbanization*, 17(1) 89-113


Cabannes, Y (2004) Participatory budgeting; a significant contribution to participatory democracy. Environment & Urbanization, 16(1) 27-46


  www.joburg.org.za/june_2002/sdf.stm (10/1/07)

  www.joburg.org.za/city_vision/index_plans.stm (10/1/07)

  www.joburg.org.za/city_vision/idp_2006.stm(10/1/07)


IRIN, [www.irinnews.org](http://www.irinnews.org) (14/8/07).

IRIN, [www.irinnews.org](http://www.irinnews.org) (17/4/06).

IRIN, [www.irinnews.org](http://www.irinnews.org) (27/11/03).


233


Jenkins, P, Robson, P and Cain, A (2002a) Local responses to globalization and peripheralization in Luanda, Angola, Environment & Urbanization, 14(1) 115-127

Jenkins, P, Robson, P, and Cain, A (2002b) City Profile – Luanda. Cities. 19(2) 139-150


Oberlander, H P (2006) Living history – a personal look at the conferences and resolutions that led to the creation of UN-HABITAT. *Habitat Debate*, 12(2) 4-5


PAR – Programme de Apoio à Reconstrução (2006) *Analise sobre as melhores praticas de diagnostico e planificagdo a nivel de Administraçäo Local.* Luanda: PAR.


Settlements, School of Planning and Housing, Edinburgh College of Art. Heriot-Watt University.


[http://www.economist.com/countries/Brazil/](http://www.economist.com/countries/Brazil/) (15/12/06)


UN Department for Economic and Social Affairs (2007) *Agenda 21.*


União Europeia and República de Angola (2006) Programmea de Apoio à Reconstrução (PAR) – Analise sobre as melhores praticas de diagnostico e planificação a nível de Administração Local. 2º draft, Luanda: União Europeia and República de Angola.


Wilson, N (2005) The Dark Side of Community Development. Planning Theory & Practice, 6(4) 517-541


